#### Comment from: Howdy Doodie

P-1-1

TeEST

#### **Comment from: James Seawel**

P-2-1

Why has this been extended? I smell a rat... or maybe a hog! Like most Arkansans, I'm pro farmer, but not pro large scale hog farms within the Buffalo River watershed! The Buffalo is the pride of Arkansas, let's keep it that way!

#### **Comment from: Dennis Dinkel**

P-3-1

Please quit listening to the wishes of a few monied interests who have no care for clean water and pristine conditions on our beautiful national Buffalo River.

Do not allow hog farms to pollute the scenic beauty of Arkansas any longer. It is time to put a stop to their incursions and land grabbing and despoilation of the beauty that is Arkansas.

For once, listen to the people.

### **Comment from: Judy White**

P-4-1

I grew up on a family farm. We had hogs. I helped raise and sell them. I am also a member of AR Farm Bureau despite the fact that it is totally sold out to Big Ag. I am for making bans on hog farming and any other farming that involves agricultural practices that endanger or have the potential to endanger the Buffalo River. I have paddled on the river many times and believe it is a national treasure that we should protect as if they were the Crown Jewels. And like the Crown Jewels, the river is a significant economic engine for the state. Favoring industry that would make money but pollute the river should not ever be permitted. Some things are more important than making money or freedom to farm whatever and however you like. The river is one of those things.

### Comment from: Cassandra Fox

P-5-1

Please don't allow corporate interests to destroy our beloved Buffalo River. Not only is it a giant as far as the local economy goes, it is also close to the heart of every Arkansan. To allow cruel and dirty operations such as hog farms anywhere near the river would be an insult to this state and its natural abundant beauty, not to mention its citizens. Stand up for us. Keep the slaughterhouses and their pollutants away from our crystal clear waters.

## Comment from: Cindy Baker

P-6-1

For 30 years, I have spent 90 percent of my vacation dollars on the Buffalo River. Please don't allow a handful of corporate farms ruin one of the most beautiful places in America. Not only would it be an environmental shame but the impact on the local economy would be tragic.

### Comment from: Tonia Spurlock

P-7-1

The Buffalo River is a national treasure and must be protected. There are more suitable locations for large scale hog production. We cannot allow corporate greed to degrade this gem.

### **Comment from: Ted Porter**

P-8-1

C&H hog farm must be permanently shut down. The excessive pollution run off will continue to poison the buffalo national river, harm wildlife and harm humans as well. The buffalo is a national treasure that must be preserved for generations to come, and must not be sacrificed at the expense of a hog farm. Thank you Sincerely,

Ted Porter

## Comment from: Kimberly Rabon

P-9-1

We need to keep Arkansas clean. Please, allow the moratorium on hog farms! Make a difference!

## Comment from: Allyce Capps

P-10-1

Protection of the Buffalo River watershed is paramount to the tourism industry and health of it's residents. It is unique in it's beauty and ecosystem. There should be ironclad regulations in place to protect it.

# Comment from: Genia Bennett

P-11-1

As a buffalo river lover I cannot believe you would allow farm bureau to dictate to our state about this national treasure! This is a site for all Americans to enjoy. Let's not continue to make the river a garbage can for hog waste please!

# Comment from: Karen Seller

P-12-1

The State of Arkansas is big enough for both - the protection of the Buffalo River Watershed and agriculture.

Both are very important to our economy and our well being.

# Comment from: Adam Schaffer

#### P-13-1

No factory hog farms in the Buffalo River watershed!

## **Comment from: Kathy Madding**

P-14-1

Please do all you can to protect t the Buffalo River from contamination from commercial hog farms. This is a fragile ecosystem, not able to withstand this much runoff. Our future generations depend on you

### **Comment from: Kerry Kraus**

P-15-1

Would you please put this mess to rest by standing up to these special interest groups?? Do what you were hired to do. Protect the most beautiful natural asset that The Natural State has. This mess was started by you. Clean it up. fix it properly.

### **Comment from: Sharon Holladay**

P-16-1

For heaven's sake! Ban these CAFOs, pig farms, industrial animal operations.....whatever you want to call them...from the Buffalo River watershed. I live in an area close to Beaver Lake in which we're restricted from putting poultry manure on our garden as a fertilizer, which is a far smaller amount and was only done once annually rather than on a constant, ongoing basis. I understood when the ban went in and have willingly complied with the regulation in order to protect clean water. It's time for the Farm Bureau to start caring about water quality and quit throwing up roadblocks. It's time for us all to demand clean water for our first national wild and scenic river

## Comment from: Jack Land

P-17-1

As a frequent user of the Buffalo River and a member of the Ozark Society I respectfully ask that a permanent moratorium calling for closure And denial for permits to place a hog operation in the Buffalo River watershed be put in place Thank you NO MORE HOG Farms

PLEASE

## **Comment from: Robert Merritt**

P-18-1

Save the Buffalo River; Don't allow any industry's near the river.

## Comment from: LaJuana Oswalt

P-19-1

NO CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed. Don't endanger the most beautiful area of Arkansas. Hog waste and clean, clear water are not possible in the same place.

### **Comment from: Lisa Orton**

P-20-1

No hog farms should be allowed at all near water. Ever. Let Arkansas be a state that shows the rest of our country what it means to care about clean air, clean water, and the beauty of our natural resources. Please don't let the few money-makers pressure legislators to do the wrong thing for the rest of Arkansas residents who make up the majority. Thank you for listening to us. I pray that God will give you wisdom to make the right decision. Sincerely, Lisa Orton

## **Comment from: David Pope**

P-21-1

Requesting that the ADEQ please stand up against irrational corporate interests regarding large CAFOs within the watershed of the Buffalo River. The most recent fight to protect the purity of the river centered on the misguided C&H hog farm and damage caused by CAFOs in other states has brought to light the harm and more importantly the potential disastrous harm they cause to the water shed. I own property near the river down steam from Carver and have personally witnessed the degradation of the water quality over the past couple of years during the operation of the C&H hog farm. The Governor did the only right thing by allowing the buy out and closure of that CAFO. I am strongly in favor of a permanent ban of these sort of operations in the Buffalo River water shed. This is the right thing to do to ensure the pristine and natural quality of our state treasure. Measures / laws should be enacted to disallow any discharge from a large animal confinement that is in that water shed. Thank you for your consideration.

David N Pope MD

## **Comment from: Ashley Money**

P-22-1

This moratorium is the most important economic policy Arkansas has ever seen. Stop all hog farms in the area. If you want a hog farm, go somewhere the entire watershed of some of our most important recreational resources won't be effected.

## Comment from: Thomas Baldridge

P-23-1

Please say no to hog farms and other pollutants in the Buffalo River watershed. I simply cannot comprehend why we are having this discussion in Arkansas let alone in the Buffalo River. It is easy to see the hog farm had a detrimental impact on the Buffalo. Take action to stop this and quit allowing farm bureau and the hog farm folks to sway politics with money. STAND UP FOR THE NATURAL STATE!!!! I am sick of this. Save the Buffalo!

#### Comment from: Elizabeth Mazzone

P-24-1

A permanent moratorium should be instituted to prevent any CAFO near any body of water.

### **Comment from: Mary Ellen Hill**

P-25-1

Good Lord, Why are we not done with this? I lived on the Buffalo River in the 70's & 80's. My family has visited every year for several year to float the River & enjoy Newton County. We've spent lots of money — money in Jasper, Harrison & with outfitters every year. The back room dirty deals regarding the approval of the CAFO hog farm makes you people look down right evil. How dare you take any chances to ruin the Buffalo for short term profits. It's disgusting.

### **Comment from: David Jones**

P-26-1

The moratorium must be made permanent to protect the Buffalo River and prevent damaging fiascos such as this one. There are obviously interests both local and foreign who care nothing about the river and its many benefits for so many people. It wasn't made a National River for nothing. Protecting it is the right thing to do!

#### **Comment from: Pat Ford**

P-27-1

Having floated the Buffalo for years, I've witnessed the degradation of water and bank quality and the state's indifference. The river is a natural and economic asset that the state needs to respect and protect, and it belongs to all of us. We need a moratorium!

## Comment from: Julie Lanshe

P-28-1

This really should be a no-brainer-protect the Buffalo! It's only a small part of the land in Arkansas-hog farms can be built elsewhere!!! But there is only one Buffalo river.

## Comment from: Andrew Blann

P-29-1

As an Arkansas resident I regularly enjoy the outdoor recreation resources abundant in the Buffalo National River watershed including fishing, floating, hiking, nature watching, rock climbing and swimming. Myself and other outdoor recreationalists spend significant time and money pursuing recreation and contributing to the local economies in the Buffalo River watershed. I believe a permanent ban on CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed is needed to create an environment where the recreation user base will continue to grow and support the local economy in the watershed. The Buffalo is a resource too precious and loved by too many to put in jeopardy from CAFOs. There are suitable locations for factory farms but the Buffalo River watershed is not one.

#### **Comment from: Jerry Hale**

P-30-1

The river watershed is not the place for any type of large farm or cafo. The Buffalo River is too important to risk. Farming operations can be anywhere. The watershed is not the place

## Comment from: Brenda Barnhill

P-31-1

I support the permanent ban on hog farms.

## Comment from: debbie Galbraith

P-32-1

as a kayaker and owner of land in Missouri on Spring river with first hand knowledge of what a incident along a river can do for years to come I am opposed to having any operation close enough to any of our rivers that a man made or natural disaster could do harm that would take years to correct if that would even be possible

### **Comment from: Cameron Peck**

P-33-1

Under no circumstance will the opening of any kind of hog "farm," or a farm of any kind that has any kind of impact on the area surrounding it, be something that the people of Arkansas will ever want. If this is allowed it will ruin the beautiful Buffalo River, and that can not happen. We are the Natural State, not the sewage capital of the U.S. Please do not let any company jeopardize the natural beauty of Arkansas!

## Comment from: Anice Tedford

P-34-1

I strongly support--Reg 5to make permanent the moratorium of confined animal operations of a certain size in the Buffalo

National River Watershed; and making non-substantive and minor stylistic changes in the

interest of clarity and consistency.

I also strongly support Reg. 6 to include adoption of federal revisions to the NPDES program,

including sufficiently sensitive test methods, cooling water intake structure requirements, steam

electric power generating, and reporting requirements; incorporations of statutory changes

passed by the Arkansas General Assembly, amending the Trust Fund permitting requirements,

changing Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality to Division of Environmental Quality,

changing the title of regulations to rules; revising to make permanent the moratorium of confined

animal operations of a certain size in the Buffalo National River Watershed; several minor

corrections to make the regulation more illustrative of the legislative and regulatory intent; and a

variety of non-substantive and minor stylistic changes in the interest of clarity and consistency.

All effort should be made to protect the Buffalo National River Watershed. Thank you!

### Comment from: Denise Lanuti

P-35-1

Reg 5 and 6

Why wouldn't you do everything in your power to save America's first national river? There are other places for a hog farm.

There is nothing more important than saving our rivers. It's a huge tourist attraction with millions of \$ that our state needs. We need clean water and healthy fish. Please don't lift the moratorium on the CAFO..

It's your responsibility to save this planet for farms like this. Please, I'm begging you, save our beautiful river.

#### **Comment from: Karen Hicks**

P-36-1

Stop this insanity! The Buffalo River watershed should NOT be for sale, no matter how you call it

## **Comment from: Tim Crouch**

P-37-1

I want the hog farm CLOSED for Good and no more open around the Buffalo Water Shed basin. Who thought this was a good idea anyway ? I SAY NO HOG FARM. Our precious resources are important to our family there at the buffalo and for our families for generations.. Thanks.. Tim Crouch

## Comment from: Eric Torgerson

P-38-1

Maintaining the water quality of the Buffalo river must be the first priority within its watershed. The value of this river in its natural state far surpasses any commercial agricultural ventures. For the state of Arkansas as well as our nation. I moved to the Ozarks over 45 years ago because this river drew me here. Since that day over 20 f as mily members have joined me in making Arkansas home. ALL BECAUSE OF THE BUFFALO RIVER.

It must be protected above and beyond any other commercial venturs.

#### **Comment from: Helen Pounds**

P-39-1

Everything possible needs to be done to preserve the Buffalo River!! It is the crown jewel of our beautiful state!! It is the legacy of this generation to save it for the next.

#### **Comment from: Nancy Harris**

P-40-1

A resounding YES!! to the moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed! Why would anyone choose a National River area to do such a thing? Please do not subjugate this beautiful environment to special interests. Thank you

#### **Comment from: Kimberly Rabon**

P-41-1

Please. We need a moratorium on hog farms in northwest Arkansas. The Buffalo National River is entrusted to us as a state to care for this national treasure. Do not let our country down and make Arkansas look like we are unwilling to care for the river wee are lucky enough to have in our state. I support the moratorium completely.

#### **Comment from: Susan Smith**

P-42-1

The Buffalo River must be protected. The very idea of risking the health of this beautiful and well-used piece of wilderness is ridiculous. Please make the ban on large livestock operations permanent. The good of the people outweighs private interests.

### **Comment from: Chris Dillon**

P-43-1

No hog farms near the buffalo river please! Reg 5 & 6 will be harmful to AR! Please protect our natural state, including our rivers!,,GT5H

### **Comment from: Dixie Rhyne**

P-44-1

These hog farms are an ecological disaster in this area. Please put a stop to this both now and permanently.

### **Comment from: Sonja Williams**

P-45-1

The beautiful Buffalo River must be protected from future hog farm pollution. Please vote to safeguard our natural treasures.

### Comment from: Lynn Risser

P-46-1

Arkansas must make permanent the ban on medium and large CAFOS in the watershed of our Buffalo National River. To do otherwise is allowing special interests to ruin the crown jewel of our state.

The report by the Big Creek Research and Extension Team stated that safety for the river for the current hog farm was possible "as long as the integrity of the holding ponds is maintained." That condition is not good enough. With the very real possibilities of shoddy building practices, careless maintenance, and even powerful acts of God, no one can guarantee the protection of the River. (I well remember when we were assured fracking did not cause earthquakes.)

Protect the River for all. Make the ban permanent.

Sincerely, Lynn Risser 432 N. Assembly Drive Fayetteville, AR 72701

#### **Comment from: Patricia McKeown**

P-47-1

I wish to support a permanent moratorium on any CAFO in the Buffalo River Watershed

### **Comment from: Kimberly Rabon**

P-48-1

I live in Jasper, AR. It s a resort town and people travel here for fun on the Buffalo National River. Our town depends on the revenue from this activity. If our National River becomes polluted and unsightly and even dangerous due to unsafe water algae, our town will be hurt. We must have a moratorium on animal farms in the watershed. Please, be responsible.

#### **Comment from: Karen Huber**

P-49-1

The ban on hog farms near the Buffalo must be permanent! This beautiful river and surrounding area are one of the greatest treasures our state has and spoiling it with animal refuse, smells, feed, etc. would be criminal. If protecting nature doesn't do it for you, then consider the tourism and lost of money side. Between these two, everyone should be for a permanent bagn.

### **Comment from: Brian Pruitt**

P-50-1

Tyson is allowed to have egg farms in the buffalo river water shed alliance shed and I. Feel like it's unfair because they can spread dry litter and be in the area and the. The fact is that liquid slurry litter is absorbed by the plant and grass it's applied to and rarely reaches the soil this is a 70 year old practice that has been tested and dry litter causes more pollution than wet litter does in California chicken houses run wet litter operations and Europe wet litter is a widely accepted method for animal waste disposal and the ozark mountain region is not true karst topography as the propaganda mill describes it as I'm against this practice because agriculture was in the buffalo river valley long before tourism was and it wasn't pollution until the national park service took over this is a picture of the vault toilet at mt Hersey flooded in 2017 can you regulate them and get them out of the flood plane the mill creek pump failure is the only reason they permitted C&h farms in the first place and your agency needs a scapegoat for your mistakes and ignorance

#### **Comment from: Sherrie Mcintyre**

P-51-1

Its a NATIONAL RIVER, Arkansas's crown jewel and a gift to the nation. Its a Arkansas icon that must be preserved for future generations. The Buffalo river is Arkansas most popular tourism destination according to recent surveys, limiting risks to this economic resource is a no-brainer.

#### **Comment from: Shawn Porter**

P-52-1

I support a moratorium on all CAFO's in the BNR watershed. Furthermore support a complete ban on CAFOS statewide. I am a small farmer.

### **Comment from: David Kuhne**

P-53-1

Please prohibit any CAFOs from the Buffalo River watershed. Protect our natural state and its only national river.

#### Comment from: Susan Hantz

P-54-1

I support the ban on certain sized hog farms in the Buffalo National River watershed

### Comment from: Nancy Johnson

P-55-1

We urge a permanent moratorium on all size CAFO's anywhere along the Buffalo National River watershed area. Given karst topography the risk of fecal contamination is too great with current waste practices, not to mention the accidents that always seem to happen.

## Comment from: Kimberly Rabon

P-56-1

It is a proven fact that waste from these big farms causes damage to the Earth.. The river ecosystem is in danger when these farms are within the watershed. Please, stop the madness! I want a moratorium that restricts this type of damage. Vote for the moratorium and do right by the Buffalo River!

## **Comment from: Katie Deakins**

P-57-1

Please! The moratorium on hog CAFO's must never be lifted. The Buffalo River is a treasure and must be protected. What else has to be said to keep this moratorium in place? I am a registered voter, and I never miss an opportunity to exercise my right to vote.

## **Comment from: MIKE FICK**

P-58-1

Keep this moratorium in place and tend to, maintain and protect the river from now on.

## Comment from: Steven Barger

P-59-1

I wish to express my support for proposed Regulations 5 and 6 establishing a permanent moratorium on concentrated animal feeding operations (CAFOs) in the vicinity of the Buffalo River. The Buffalo is a relatively shallow stream with relatively low average flow rate. As such, it is very sensitive to dramatic changes in flow and their capacity to carry surface materials into the stream. This includes nitrogen- and phosphorus-containing compounds, which are produced and disseminated from animal feces and urine. CAFOs create not only a threat but a guaranteed contribution of these eutrophication compounds into the streams, including the Buffalo. This has drastic and devastating effects on the health of living organisms in the streams. A permanent moratorium is necessary to match the permanent value of the streams and their life forms to the health and happiness of the people of the state and the nation.

## Comment from: Frank Kelly

P-60-1

Going out of our way to protect this incredible resource should certainly be a priority. Please trust the science and do what is necessary to preserve and protect the Buffalo River.

# Comment from: Kimberly Rabon

P-61-1

Jasper, AR is one of the small towns in the area of the Buffalo River. Our town depends on the revenue from people who visit the Buffalo National River. If the river is polluted, no visitors will come and our town will die. Please, place a moratorium on large farms in the watershed.

#### **Comment from: Charles Eubanks**

#### P-62-1

I recognize the need for farms and reasonable regulations. Operation of farms that adversely affects surrounding areas or watersheds violates justice and imposes a defacto tax on the citizens of Arkansas who must cover the costs of remediation. I support the permanent moratorium on large CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. The Buffalo River is too valuable a resource for all Arkansas citizens to risk catastrophic contamination for the benefit of the owners or operators of industrial scale farms. Small farms can more effectively provide needed food AND manage animal wastes with less risk to watersheds and downstream resources. I strongly support a permanent moratorium.

#### **Comment from: Cynthia Jetton**

P-63-1

With Big Creek and miles of the Buffalo National River downstream of C&H impaired by too many nutrients, the containment ponds of C&H are leaking and too many nutrients on the fields of C&H from the spreading of the hog waste, SHOWS THAT CAFO's do not belong in the Buffalo National River Watershed. I support a permanent moratorium for CAFO's within the Buffalo National River Watershed.

### **Comment from: Sharon Holladay**

P-64-1

Please do what is right and protect the Buffalo River. CAFOs are never going to work in this watershed. The data supports this, no matter what big ag tries to say.

### **Comment from: Andy McCutcheon**

P-65-1

I oppose a moratorium on farms in the Buffalo River watershed. There is NO evidence that C&H or any other agricultural operation in the watershed is causing or has caused any degradation of water quality in the Buffalo River. This is blatant government overreach and an attempt to deprive private land owners in the watershed of their right to farm.

### Comment from: David Orr

P-66-1

I strongly support the permanent moratorium on livestock production and confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs), especially in the Buffalo National River watershed. These operations cause nitrogen and phosphorous pollution in the groundwater and surface flows, which in this case flows into the federally protected Buffalo National River. Federal law requires units of the National Park System to be managed so as to ensure non-impairment of park resources--including water quality--in perpetuity. If ADEQ permits the resumption of livestock production and CAFOs in the valley you will be condoning the violation of federal law. ADEQ must take this opportunity to do the right thing and do the right thing. This is a moral and legal obligation. If you bow to the Farm Bureau and anti-environmental industries, you will be responsible for leaving a legacy of environmental damage to your grandchildren, and to mine, too. Thank you for your due consideration of my concerns.

### Comment from: Beth Ardapple

P-67-1

I support the permanent moratorium.

### Comment from: kent landrum

P-68-1

Think of the Buffalo River as a sanctuary, as in church. The one place we may expect to encounter the divine without interference. As one who has studied forestry and water quality since 1995, been a rural landowner in Stone County for over 30 years, served on City of Fayetteville's Environmental Concerns Committee for three years, and enjoyed the Buffalo River on many trips, I ask the Department of Environmental Quality to permanently restrict confinement pork production facilities from locating in the Buffalo River Watershed.

## Comment from: Ellen Mitchell

P-69-1

Pass a permanent moratorium on medium and large hog farms in the Buffalo river watershed.

We had to spend 6 million dollars of Arkansas taxpayer money to buy out c & h farms and clean up the filthy mess they made. Why spend that money and STILL let new farms come in??????

# PASS THE PERMANENT MORITORIUM!!!!!!!

# Comment from: Burnetta Hinterthuer

P-70-1

When the Buffalo River was saved from damming and later named as the first National River, I had no idea that years later, a confined animal operation would be allowed to threaten its water quality, its pristine environment and its reputation. This past summer, photos of algae blooms in mid-summer raised a red flag. In August, it was common to find shallow parts of the river with algae concentrations; but, this year, it started earlier and lasted longer. There is evidence the hog farm has already affected its quality from run off or transference through the limestone bedrock. Please prevent any other concentrated animal feeding opearions from getting started in the natural state! And, please close this operation and keep out any others that threaten our natural resources. Tourism brings money and revenue into the state. Without our natural resources, we are not the natural state.

#### **Comment from: Margot Lavoie**

#### P-71-1

I had the great good fortune to live and work in Arkansas for a very happy time in the early 2000s. I fell in love with the state - the warm and friendly people and the incredible natural beauty. My favorite place by far out of all the wonderful places in Arkansas was then and still remains the Buffalo River. The highlight of many of my years there was an annual float on the Buffalo with a great group of friends. What a treasure this beautiful wild and free river is for the state! Everywhere I go I always let people know how much they would enjoy a trip to The Natural State - and especially to the Buffalo River. I feel honored to be an 'ambassador' for Arkansas and although I am not a native Arkansan - it will always be my 'second home'. I live in Oregon now - to be close to my grandchildren - but have already made a trip back to Arkansas and had a terrific time - of course the trip was made truly complete with a visit to the Buffalo. I hope to return again and again as I am able - and I hope that on each return I will find the Buffalo healthy and flowing free and sparkling in the sun. Please uphold the permanent moratorium on industrial farming of any kind within the Buffalo watershed. This lovely river is surely one of the prized assests of the Natural Sate - and we should all see that it remains so for future generations of Arkansans and for the world as a whole. Thank you - sincerely, Margot Lavoie

#### **Comment from: Annie Holmes**

P-72-1

Please Do NOT ALLOW ANY MORE CAFO IN the Buffalo National River watershed!!

Big Agribusiness does not matter more than our natural resources.

#### **Comment from: William Jeter**

P-73-1

Under no circumstances should more CAFO's be allowed in this area. Please stop them.

#### Comment from: Mary Susan Seawel

P-74-1

I am a lifelong Arkansan. I love my home state and promote it to others every chance I get. I grew up on a farm and I support farmers and farming, but no corporate hog farms in the Buffalo River watershed. No, no, no!

#### Comment from: Deanne Mayer

P-75-1

Please make the moratorium on CAFO in the Buffalo River watershed permanent. We are stewards of this amazing natural environment for future generations. Please preserve these types of places for them.

Thank you, Deanne Mayer

#### Lowell, AR

### **Comment from: Sharon Gattis**

P-76-1

I support the Moratorium on the Buffalo National River in Arkansas. The Buffalo River is very important to the citizens of Arkansas and for all citizens of other states. It is a valuable treasure and should be keep environmentally safe for all who enjoy recreation in it. My family does and we always meet so many from our state and all other states. It is important to our tourism. Shame on Farm Bureau and any other corporations that want to harm these national waters just to fatten their pockets. Let them sit in the swine/poultry mess and see if they wouldn't have a fit or raise a stink!! Or see effects from it growing or floating in the water. The Buffalo River is a jewel for ALL to protect!! It is important to the state of Arkansas and it's people, not corporations!!!

#### **Comment from: David Jones**

P-77-1

I have commented previously about the importance of the moratorium being made permanent. Now I'm wondering about the delay. There has been more than ample time for public comments.

### **Comment from: Carole Cimarron**

P-78-1

I am requesting a Permanent Moratorium on swine CAFOs in the Buffalo National River's Watershed. This is our first National River and needs maximum protection.

### Comment from: CAROLYN Shearman

P-79-1

I support the Rule 5 & 6 changes that outline a permanent CAFO moratorium in the Buffalo River Watershed. This is a sensitive natural area that needs extra protection to maintain its scenic beauty and value as a destination for tourism. Carolyn Shearman

### **Comment from: Ginger Milan**

P-80-1

We strongly support the moratorium of CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed.

### Comment from: Andy McCutcheon

P-81-1

I OPPOSE the changes proposed by ADEQ to Rule 5 and Rule 6 that would institute a permanent

moratorium on issuance of permits for medium and large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo National River watershed.

### **Comment from: Cathey Morris**

P-82-1

The areas of soil that C&H Farm Allowed to be tested showed to be too thin for spreading of a hog waste over it. The areas Upland from those will be even thinner. I spent many vacation days taking my children to the Buffalo to enjoy floating in the water. We stopped along the way to Wade and swim to cool off. It's not enjoyable if there is contamination and algae.

#### **Comment from: Kimberly Rabon**

P-83-1

Keep it clean!! We need a moratorium to keep the Buffalo pristine! Make a difference by supporting the moratorium.

#### Comment from: Jana Brady

P-84-1

Save the Buffalo, NO CAFOs in the watershed. How many times do we have to tell you? Fuck profits, save the clean water you goddamn idiots.

#### Comment from: Beth Goodwin

P-85-1

The concern for hog farming close to the Buffalo National River is one our state must take a stand and refuse to allow it. We do not have to have a hog farming near the Buffalo. Hog waste is much different that other animal waste. It can seep into groundwater and end up in the Buffalo or its tributaries. This is simply an unnecessary decision. Please do not take the chance.

### **Comment from: Virginia Booth**

P-86-1

My comments on regulation five and six is that confined animal feeding operations need to be put in remote flat areas for their refuse to age and to protect the public from smells and polluted water, that's just common sense. Even if the state has to use eminent domain to do pick an appropriate place.

With so much confusion in sharing news publicly these days, such as newspaper versus website versus Facebook it is all very confusing for the public to know if a polluting operation is trying to sneak in without public awareness. Putting a required announcement only in an obscure and little read (by the public) website is underhanded.

The poster child for this situation is the C&H pig farm of Mt. Judea Arkansas. Had they been required to pay liability insurance towards the probability of an environmental error (and the government money it would take to fix it should an environmental catastrophe happened / or just a slow build up of pollutants), they could not have afforded to build there in the first place. It's just common sense.

The sport of kayaking is growing exponentially in the past decade and I am a frequent

kayaker on the Buffalo River. I also can see that our beautiful lakes on the White River do not need the slow build up of pollutants either, which could have been the next step if C&H and operations like it continued to expand their range in spite of being near water sources and the public.

Our country is getting more built up so picking those designated places for the CAFO's that we need should be done by the government. Kind of like how our country planned ahead for the land needed for the interstate system.

Sorry for any miss spellings I'm writing this on my very tiny phone.

Thank you for your time.

### **Comment from: Sue Mabry**

P-87-1

Most of us know Buffalo River is a national treasure and the crown jewel of Arkansas.

We're so blessed to have Buffalo River in our state and it's our privilege and duty to care for it for our children and grandchildren

1) The watershed is that of a National River under the care of our state.

2) The geology of the drainage area is underlain by the Boone Formation which is karst geology, making the Buffalo watershed particularly vulnerable to pollutants.

3) CAFO waste is spread on pastures using the Arkansas Phosphorus Index (API) which fails to account for groundwater or karst.

4) Soils in the Buffalo River watershed are too thin to accommodate industrial level distribution of CAFO waste.

5) The record shows agency concerns and degradation in regard to the single facility permitted.

## **Comment from: Victoria McClendon**

P-88-1

I wish to support the permanent moratorium on medium and large hog CAFO's in the Buffalo River Watershed, and our wise Governor Hutchison's decision formed across interests on this.

Reasons in support of this moratorium are economic and forward thinking, and include: 1)The watershed is that of a National River under the care of our state.

2) The geology of the drainage area is underlain by the Boone Formation which is karst geology, making the Buffalo watershed particularly vulnerable to pollutants.

3) CAFO waste is spread on pastures using the Arkansas Phosphorus Index (API) which fails to account for groundwater or karst.

4) Soils in the Buffalo River watershed are too thin to accommodate industrial level distribution of CAFO waste.

Respectfully submitter, Victoria McClendon

#### **Comment from: Lowell Collins**

P-89-1

Please support a permanent moratorium on medium and large CAFO's in the Buffalo River watershed. The topography of that region makes it unsuitable for a large hog operation. The Buffalo River is the crown jewel of Arkansas and needs to be protected for future generations.

I urge you to do what is right for Americas first national river the Buffalo.

#### Comment from: David Martinson

P-90-1

There are many reasons to make the moratorium on CAFO's in the Buffalo River watershed permanent, including the following:

1) The watershed is that of a National River under the care of our state.

2) The geology of the drainage area is underlain by the Boone Formation which is karst geology, making the Buffalo watershed particularly vulnerable to pollutants.

3) CAFO waste is spread on pastures using the Arkansas Phosphorus Index (API) which fails to account for groundwater or karst.

4) Soils in the Buffalo River watershed are too thin to accommodate industrial level distribution of CAFO waste.

5) The record shows agency concerns and degradation in regard to the single facility permitted.

Please help protect the sensitive ecology of the Buffalo River.

### Comment from: Barbara Fell

P-91-1

It is extremely important to have this moratorium on CAFOs so that the Buffalo River is protected and can be enjoyed by all. Karst geology allows for the waste to reach far and wide harming all water quality. The geology will never change so we as citizens must pass this moratorium to protect not only the river but all water in the area.

Thank you, Barbara Fell

### Comment from: Jerry Dorman

P-92-1

The Buffalo River is a precious asset to our states environment and economy. The karst geology does not permit the presence of CAFOs in this watershed without significant and long lasting environmental damage. Please support the permanent ban on CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed.

### Comment from: Karen Crocker

P-93-1

There should not be opportunities to build Cafo's in the Buffalo River Watershed in Arkansas. If farmers are not going to protect such an important natural resource than the state should do so.

### Comment from: David Martinson

P-94-1

There are many reasons to make the moratorium on CAFO's in the Buffalo River watershed permanent, including the following:

1) The watershed is that of a National River under the care of our state.

2) The geology of the drainage area is underlain by the Boone Formation which is karst geology, making the Buffalo watershed particularly vulnerable to pollutants.

3) CAFO waste is spread on pastures using the Arkansas Phosphorus Index (API) which fails to account for groundwater or karst.

4) Soils in the Buffalo River watershed are too thin to accommodate industrial level distribution of CAFO waste.

5) The record shows agency concerns and degradation in regard to the single facility permitted.

Please help protect the sensitive ecology of the Buffalo River.

## Comment from: Joel Emerson

P-95-1

The battle for the Buffalo continues as commercial farming interests cloak destructive practices in the "right to farm" mantra. Of course you have a right to farm, but you have no right to destroy the quality of a national treasure that brings in more tourist dollars than any "farm" ever will in the BR Watershed. Gov Hutchinson has shown great courage and political savvy in taking steps to protect the Buffalo and the legacy of John Paul Hammerschmidt and Dr Compton. Protect the Buffalo, now and forever. In closing, my grandfather was a wheat farmer for 40 years in the Texas panhandle, I know how real farmers earn their living.

## Comment from: Patricia McKeown

P-96-1

I support a permanent ban on medium and large CAFO operations in the Buffalo National River watershed.

The geology of the area is not conducive for industrial sized distribution of wastes from medium and large CAFO operations.

The karst geology makes the area vulnerable to pollutants.

### Comment from: Don McCaskill

#### P-97-1

The moratorium against CAFOs in the Buffalo National River watershed should be made final and permanent. The Buffalo River is an extraordinary water resource that should be protected for the benefit of future generations. Lying on steep terrain with thin soils underlaid by karst geology, this watershed is especially vulnerable to both surface and groundwater pollution by animal waste generated by CAFOs. The steep terrain practically guarantees that such waste applied to land in the watershed will be washed into the river and groundwater. These points have already been demonstrated via phosphorus data and increased prevalence of algae in the river as a result of the single C & H Hog Farm permitted to operate in the watershed. The rights of individual landowners in such fragile environments do not warrant allowing them to damage public treasures such as the Buffalo National River for personal gain. Make the moratorium on such operations permanent!

### **Comment from: Annee Littell**

P-98-1

I support a permanent moratorium on medium and large CAFO in the Buffalo River watershed. We need to protect the quality of our water. I also support expanding this to other river watersheds in Arkansas. Our drinking water comes from our surface waters for most people in Arkansas.

## **Comment from: Mary Gocio**

P-99-1

I am in support of a permanent moratorium on medium and large CAFO's near the Buffalo River. The watershed is that of a nationally designated National River for which I am very proud and protective. I feel it is our duty as a state to protect this area to the best of our ability.

## **Comment from: David Hughey**

P-100-1

Having been introduced to the river by Harry Pearson and following up with early floats in the late sixties, I have found it hard to

imaginary further encroachment on this treasure. The river and its surrounding lands should be protected for all time.

Please give the first national river its' proper protection. The wish is for many generations, to be able know a true treasure.

## **Comment from: Erin Rowe**

P-101-1

Our state should care for this watershed as its a national river Also the soil of the Buffalo River area can't handle these type of pollutants.

#### **Comment from: Cathy Ross**

P-102-1

I am in favor of a permanent moratorium on medium and large CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed because the geology of the drainage area is underlain by the Boone formation which is karst geology, making the Buffalo watershed particularly vulnerable to pollutants. I am also concerned about the amount of waste that is spread on fields in the watershed.

#### **Comment from: Janice Muetzel**

P-103-1

We all know by experience how dollar signs \$\$\$\$ can get in the way of our "better judgement" when it comes to making

an important decision

Think of the wisdom of those who spent their time, and effort to preserve the First National River for Arkansas and the whole U.S.A.

Pristine, wild NATURAL, this RIVER is our heritage for our children and Grandchildren.

Please don't sell our heritage to deceptive, smooth talking groups, whose main interest (although it may be hidden) is for financial gain for themselves. To me, the very idea that we would consider doing such a thing is UNTHINKABLE, SINCERELY JM.

#### Comment from: Candice Kozark

P-104-1

I would like to say that I am in FAVOR of a permanent moratorium of medium and large CAFOs near the Buffalo River.

1) The watershed is that of a National River under the care of our state.

2) The geology of the drainage area is underlain by the Boone Formation which is karst geology, making the Buffalo watershed particularly vulnerable to pollutants.

3) CAFO waste is spread on pastures using the Arkansas Phosphorus Index (API) which fails to account for groundwater or karst.

4) Soils in the Buffalo River watershed are too thin to accommodate the industrial level distribution of CAFO waste.

5) The record shows agency concerns and degradation in regard to the single facility permitted.

Thank you.

#### **Comment from: William Thomas**

P-105-1

I support the moratorium on CAFO's in the Buffalo River watershed. The thin topsoil and underlining karst geology are incompatible with spreading large amount of animal waste. I was born, raised, and own a cattle farm. I know what a farm looks like. These operations are not farms. The are closer to industrial production or commercial feed lots. They should be regulated as such.

As a avid hiker and camper I believe it is the utmost importance to give the Buffalo National Park protection.

Thanks Bill Thomas

### Comment from: schuyler schwarting

P-106-1

I would like to request a permanent moratorium on all hog farms on the Buffalo River watershed. PLEASE.

## **Comment from: Karen Beneke**

P-107-1

I support a PERMANENT moratorium on all CAFOs near the Buffalo National River. The Buffalo National River cannot resist the damage that done by runoff from these farming operations. As stewards of the BNR watershed it is up to the citizens of Arkansas to protect it from these farming practices. The damage to the watershed from the single facility that was allowed to recently operate has been documented thoroughly. The area's geology consists of the Boone Formation, a karst geology, which leaves the BNR watershed especially vulnerable to pollution. The Arkansas Phosphorus Index used to support spreading CAFO waste on pastures does not take into account ground water or the karst geology. In addition, soils are too thin to accept the industrial level of CAFO waste distribution. We cannot let this national treasure that is so unique to Arkansas and ARKANSANS be damaged any further. Please enact and enforce the proposed moratorium. Thank you.

## **Comment from: George Wise**

P-108-1

I support a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed

# Comment from: Jann Bell

P-109-1

I support a permanent ban on pig farms or any other endeavor that ultimately harms the Buffalo River.

# Comment from: Yolanda Dreher

P-110-1

I am in FAVOR of a permanent moratorium of medium and large CAFOs near the Buffalo River. This area has a unique karst geography and requires unique protection, accordingly. Common knowledge and common sense would keep any animal waste and feces from any water source.

#### Comment from: Linda Vanblaricom

P-111-1

Please make moratorium on medium and large CAFOS permanent. Our water quality and our future health is more important than anything!

#### Comment from: Kenneth Leonard

P-112-1

The Buffalo River is a jewel in Arkansas' crown and it is also a significant economic engine for the area. These two topics alone justify its protection from the pollution produced by CAFOs.

Furthermore, the geology of the drainage area is underlain by the Boone Formation which is karst geology, making the Buffalo River watershed particularly vulnerable to pollutants, including pollutants spread on the soil surface such as the waste created by CAFOs. The soils in the Buffalo River watershed are too thin to accommodate the large amounts of waste created by CAFOs.

CAFOs should not be allowed to be built or operated in the Buffalo River watershed. The environment and the ecology of the Buffalo River watershed are not capable of supporting industrial level animal husbandry and these operations should be block from being built in the Buffalo River Watershed.

Thank you. Ken Leonard 207 NW O St Bentonville, AR 72712

### Comment from: John Slater

P-113-1

The Buffalo National River is a big reason to be proud of Arkansas, "The Natural State". We need to do everything we can to protect it and that means moving the KAFO out of the Buffalo River watershed ASAP. Plus never allowing this to happen again. The Buffalo River runs through karst topography which allows contaminants to move through underground water pathways and enter the river. Plus the waste applied to pastures gets into the river as well.

Please move the KAFO ASAP.

## **Comment from: Marvin Schwartz**

#### P-114-1

I support the assignment of a permanent moratorium of medium and large CAFO's near the Buffalo. The issue has been throughly discussed and the appropriate temporary steps have been taken. The permanent status of the moratorium must follow.

#### Comment from: Randall Hollenbeck

#### P-115-1

We need to preserve our natural and beautiful resources. They should not be destroyed for the almighty dollar. There are plenty of places to have a hog farm that is properly build, just not ina watershed that feeds one of our stated most precious natural resources. You don't need to be a genius to know that, just have some common sense. The Farm Bureau's position on this issue is disgusting and despicable.

#### **Comment from: Kimberly Rabon**

P-116-1

I support a.moratorium on big and small CAFOs in Arkansas. Please, do your part and vote along these lines. It is important for our state and for local communities. More important is that it is important for life!

#### Comment from: Bryan Signorelli

#### P-117-1

I support the governors proposed ban on CAFOs near the Buffalo National River. This watershed is that of a National River under the care of our state and is a jewel that should be protected.

The drainage area is underlain by the Boone Formation which is karst geology, making the Buffalo watershed particularly vulnerable to pollutants. Additionally, CAFO waste is spread on pastures using the Arkansas Phosphorus Index (API) which fails to account for groundwater or karst and soils in the Buffalo River watershed are too thin to accommodate industrial level distribution of CAFO waste.

The track record of the single (mistakenly) permitted operation shows agency concerns and degradation. The real life test showed that the Buffalo National River watershed is not an appropriate location for industrial scale farming.

#### **Comment from: Susan Moore**

P-118-1

We just moved hear from the city. One of the reasons we moved here was because of all the outdoor activities and to kayak on rivers like the buffalo. I do not understand why a few hog farmers would be allowed to contaminate what thousands of people enjoy every year for their own profit. Please protect the only really valuable resource this state has to offer and keep the rivers clean and usable.

#### Comment from: Ann Owen

P-119-1

I'm writing today in FAVOR of a permanent moratorium of medium and large CAFOs near the Buffalo River, a National River under the care of our state. We know that the geology of the drainage area is underlain by the Boone Formation which is karst geology, making the Buffalo watershed particularly vulnerable to pollutants. CAFO waste is spread on pastures using the Arkansas Phosphorus Index (API) which fails to account for groundwater or karst. Soils in the Buffalo River watershed are too thin to accommodate industrial level distribution of CAFO waste. The record shows agency concerns and degradation in regard to the single facility permitted.

#### **Comment from: Cay Miller**

P-120-1

I am writing to urge DEQ to enact a permanent on CAFO's in the Buffalo National River watershed. The state of Arkansas has control over the land that drains into this scenic river way. The use of manure spray from on the thin soils of the Ozarks eventually leads to contamination of what is meant to be a pristine waterway. The soils are unable to absorb much of the spray, and the karst topography that exists under the surface can provide a direct route for the liquified manure to pollute the aquatic ecosystem. The Buffalo River is a treasure of great natural beauty, and it is also a treasure chest of economic benefit to the many canoe outfitters, restaurants, gift shops, and lodging that is frequented by over a million visitors who spend nearly 60 million dollars in the surrounding communities. Pollution of the Buffalo River not only violates the spirit of the enacting legislation that created the nation's first scenic river, but represents a threat to the livelihood of many people who depend on tourism for their income.

#### **Comment from: Diana Angelo**

P-121-1

Please place a moratorium on medium and large animal feeding operations within the watershed of our sensitive national treasure, Buffalo River.

#### Comment from: Steve Kopp

P-122-1

Please put the permanent moratorium on CAFOs in place. We must not allow our natural resources to be controlled and destroyed by corporations - including the Farm Bureau.

It is my understanding that the C&H operation is owned by a Brazilian multinational. This corporation received tariff bailout money in the tens of millions of dollars. They can take or leave Arkansas with no remorse, move on to the next state that makes the mistake of granting a permit. Arkansas is left with the mess to clean up.

#### Comment from: Johon Fritz

P-123-1

The following is my comment on Reg 5&6 as it concerns the Buffalo River: Keep the title as "regulations", meaning, do not change "regulations" to "rules". Maintain the moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed, in keeping with The American Public Health Association's (APHA) new policy statement advising federal, state, and local governments and public health agencies to impose a moratorium on all new and expanding concentrated feeding animal operations (CAFOs). Thank you. John J. Fritz.

#### **Comment from: Karen Seller**

#### P-124-1

Wow. Here we are again and again proving what everyone already knows. THE Buffalo National River (the first National River In the USA) deserves to be protected even though some consider it not worth it. My point is that not ALL of us are represented by Farm Bureau, which is an insurance company. How in the world did they get so political? And, how can one of their paid employees not have a conflict of interest in this matter. That being said, the State of Arkansas needs more economic activity other than Ag. And the state is big enough for more than just Ag. Facts prove that tourism in this state is very lucrative and that activity generates revenue for the state unlike Ag that doesn't pay much tax. The economic impact of the Buffalo River Watershed is more important than any economic impact Ag could produce in that watershed.

#### **Comment from: John Courtway**

P-125-1

I write in favor of a permanent moratorium of medium and large CAFOs near the Buffalo River. There are several reasons why, primarily because the watershed is that of a National River under the care of our State of Arkansas.

### Comment from: John Ray

P-126-1

I support having a permanent moratorium on medium and large hog CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. The watershed is that of a National River under the care of our state. The geology of the drainage area is underlain by the Boone Formation which is karst geology, making the Buffalo watershed particularly vulnerable to pollutants. CAFO waste is spread on pastures using the Arkansas Phosphorus Index (API) which fails to account for groundwater or karst. Soils in the Buffalo River watershed are too thin to accommodate industrial level distribution of CAFO waste. Do the right thing - institute a permanent moratorium on medium and large hog CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed.

Thank you,

John Ray

# Comment from: Ginny Masullo

P-127-1

December 7, 2019 Jacob Harper Arkansas Department of Energy and Environment 5301 Northshore Drive North Little Rock, AR 72118

Dear Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality,

Re: APC&EC Reg 5&6 Revisions or Rulemakings

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

1) The watershed is that of a National River under the care of our state. The river is but a sum of its tributaries

2) The geology of the drainage area is underlain by the Boone Formation which is karst geology, making the Buffalo watershed particularly vulnerable to pollutants. Dye trace studies cited by the Big Creek Research Extension Team's report show just how far and how fast water can run underground.

3) CAFO waste is spread on pastures using the Arkansas Phosphorus Index (API) which fails to account for groundwater or karst.

4) Soils in the Buffalo River watershed are too thin to accommodate industrial level distribution of CAFO waste.

5) The record shows your agency concerns and degradation in regard to the single facility permitted. Buffalo River and Big creek on draft 303d list of impaired streams.6) In 5 years or less the fields where waste was spread became saturated for phosphorous. This could be stored in the soil's profile and continue to leach into groundwater over long periods of time.

Big Creek and 14 miles of the Buffalo River were placed, by the Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality, on the 303d draft list of impaired streams in 2018. While there may be more than one factor contributing to this water quality damage, the largest producer of waste in the Buffalo River watershed for the last 5 years has been an industrial sized hog farm.

Since the industrialized farm's inception in 2013, raw swine sewage has been stored in two waste ponds, with 2.5 million gallons of it spread each year onto fields in the Buffalo National River watershed. Fields have received far more nutrients than the vegetation could possibly use, and the soil has become heavily saturated with stored phosphorous. After the CAFO is closed and the spraying stops, this "legacy phosphorous" will continue to leach into the underlying karst. It contaminates groundwater and comes back to the surface in seeps and springs that feed Big Creek and the Buffalo River.

If only one swine concentrated feeding operation can, after only 5 years of operation, contribute to declining water quality in the Buffalo River watershed what would many or several do?

Please approve the permanent moratorium and preserve this natural resource and viable economic engine for tourism .

#### Comment from: Susie Parker

P-128-1

Dear Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality,RE: APC&EC Regulation 5—the Commission's Liquid Animal Waste Management Rule—and APC&EC Regulation 6.Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed.Big Creek and 14 miles of the Buffalo River were placed, by the Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality,; on the 303d draft list of impaired streams in 2018. While there may be more than one factor contributing to this water quality damage, the largest producer of waste in the Buffalo River watershed for the last 5 years has been an industrial sized hog farm.;Since the industrialized farm's inception in; 2013, raw swine sewage has been stored in two waste ponds, with 2.5 million gallons of it spread each year onto fields in the Buffalo National River watershed. ; Fields have received far more nutrients than the vegetation could possibly use, and the soil has become heavily saturated with stored phosphorous. After the CAFO is closed and the spraying stops, this "legacy phosphorous" will continue to leach into the underlying karst. It contaminates groundwater and comes back to the surface.

## Comment from: Laura Villegas

P-129-1 December 7, 2019 Jacob Harper Arkansas Department of Energy and Environment 5301 Northshore Drive North Little Rock, AR 72118

Dear Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality,

Re: APC&EC Reg 5&6 Revisions or Rulemakings

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

1) The watershed is that of a National River under the care of our state. The river is but a sum of its tributaries

2) The geology of the drainage area is underlain by the Boone Formation which is karst geology, making the Buffalo watershed particularly vulnerable to pollutants. Dye trace studies cited by the Big Creek Research Extension Team's report show just how far and how fast water can run underground.

3) CAFO waste is spread on pastures using the Arkansas Phosphorus Index (API) which fails to account for groundwater or karst.

4) Soils in the Buffalo River watershed are too thin to accommodate industrial level distribution of CAFO waste.

5) The record shows your agency concerns and degradation in regard to the single facility permitted. Buffalo River and Big creek on draft 303d list of impaired streams.6) In 5 years or less the fields where waste was spread became saturated for phosphorous. This could be stored in the soil's profile and continue to leach into groundwater over long periods.

Name: Laura Villegas

Address: 5005 Bonita Place, Springdale AR 72762

## Comment from: Karen Bartle

P-130-1

I left my home 3 miles from Mt. Judea because the air no longer smelled good, because the river was no longer fit to swim in, and finally because all the springs and wells are now polluted. It is going to take years to heal the Buffalo, please assure it can happen by protecting it forever.

# Comment from: Virginia Booth

P-131-1

I support banning the CAFO's from the Buffalo River watershed. A person from the state forestry told me that there had been a ban on them until about 10 years ago when it 'timed out' and wasn't renewed. And that's where the problems started. People just got complacent and didn't realize this could happen, and indeed, it did happen, in a rather secretive way with no public notice or debate. Worst of all, no push back from the Buffalo National River. That to me means that it is a very hot issue that is taking a lot of 'small people' to fight. Just think of all the time, money, and publicity spent in fighting this CAFO.

We must protect our high quality water resources for future generations since there are so few remaining. The Buffalo is our state's jewel in the crown. It will be increasingly loved to death by tourists and rental and retirement cabins. So it will be an ongoing problem to keep the water pristine. Having the threat of a major or mid-size CAFO in the watershed does not help matters.

This is NOT about small farms being persecuted, it is about large corporations, owned overseas to my understanding, controlling our land and resources and acting detrimentally. If they were required to get 'environmental insurance' for the damage they may cause, they could not afford to build here (in the worst of spots) and would use some common sense and go to flat lands away from schools and recreation where their refuse can 'age out' on level ground as it is designed to do.

I have been totally confused by the funding of the Farm Bureau to support Farm Bureau. We are their customers. How is it that they are using 'our' money to support the environmentally risky CAFO's. There are many of us local customers who do not support this risk to the National River. It has been very insulting for them to do this with money from a company we are customers of.

Thank you for your time. This is my second letter, so I hope it counts.

#### Comment from: susan fields

P-132-1

SAVE THE BUFFALO. It may not be once and for all, who knows what challenges water will face in the future? Do what we CAN DO NOW. Save the Buffalo River and it's watersheds from commercial/corporate feeding operations. Let farmers farm and the river flow cleanly.

#### **Comment from: Nancy Harris**

P-133-1

It seems really not much more needs to be said but to continue to protect the Buffalo River watershed. It's so common sense...please support the moratorium of medium/large hog CAFOs there.

You know what the majority of Arkansans want, please listen to them and not the special interests that would have the area damaged or destroyed....for what? Please do the obvious conscientious thing. We all have to live in the environment we affect in so many ways. Let's keep it healthy. Thank you so much for all you do.

### **Comment from: Robert Pekel**

P-134-1

I support a permanent moratorium on medium and large confined animal feeding operations.

Thank you

Robert Pekel

### **Comment from: Frederick Paillet**

P-135-1

I enthusiastically support a moratorium on cafo operations in the Buffalo River watershed. As a professional geologist and environmental scientist I believe that the karst-riddled substrate (Boone Formation) and the cherty soils derived therefrom are fundamentally unsuitable for waste disposal associated with cafo's. These uses are not appropriate for a National River watershed, period.

### **Comment from: Howdy Doodie**

P-136-1 TEST

#### **Comment from: Michele Jackson**

P-137-1

I am in favor of having the moratorium on medium and large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed permanent. The risk of pollution of the national treasure is a real concern for so many reasons: recreation, drinking water, etc. Please proceed with disallowing hog farms permanently.

#### Comment from: Randy Jackson

P-138-1

Please make the temporary moratorium on swine CAFOs in the Buffalo National River area permanent. This type of activity is inconsistent with protecting the health of our national river. Such activities should not be permitted and taxpayers should not be forced into buyouts and legal battles to prevent or reverse decisions to allow them.

#### **Comment from: Albefrta Wells**

P-139-1

We are grateful to the Governor for supporting a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed. After all that has been accomplished, please dont let the Farm Bureau or anyone change this and create another long, expensive, meaningless fight.

Alberta Wells, Bass, AR

#### **Comment from: Melissa White**

P-140-1

Growing up in the Buffalo River area and living on the White Rivers for decades, I have seen these rivers go from beautiful clean, clear waters to waters full of slimy green algae. I hope these measures can stop or reverse this process and bring back the beautiful waters of my childhood.

#### **Comment from: Susan Benton**

P-141-1

As a frequent visitor to the Buffalo River area I hope you will limit uses that contribute to the pollution of the beautiful Buffalo River area.

#### **Comment from: Heather Hudgens**

P-142-1

My family would like a permanent ban on large and medium hog CAFOs in the watershed.

Thank you,

Heather Hudgens

#### Comment from: Steve Singleton

#### P-143-1

How many times do we have to say it? Large scale factory farms have no place in the Buffalo River watershed. This was never a family farm, which by my definition means that people actually live on the land they farm. Please honor the reasonable agreement struck by the governor and the Nature Conservancy to make the investors whole and remove this thorn in the side of our national river. The moratorium on future such developments should be extended in perpetuity.

Steve Singleton

#### **Comment from: Dorothy Bailey**

P-144-1

I am FOR no more hog farms at all. Please protect our first National river. Do the right thing for our planet that was given to us to enjoy. Be protectors. I speak for the river that has no voice. Thank you.

#### **Comment from: Katherine Weaver**

P-145-1

Hog CAFO's are inconsistent with the health of the first national river, and Arkansas should avoid any future lengthy battles and buyouts.

#### Comment from: Ryan Duncan

P-146-1

What's the best flavor? Bacon! Where does bacon come from? Pigs? What do pigs drink? Water! Stop polluting it! Thanks!

#### Comment from: Dave and Nan Johnson-Spencer

P-147-1

The Big Creek Research Extension Team's (BCRET) final report show that there is documented water quality impact from one hog concentrated feeding operation (CAFO) in the **Buffalo** River Watershed after only 5 years of operation. Statements from BCRET report, the data of BCRET study and the conclusions of the expert panel of the BCRET report advise both impact and the potential for impact, thus supporting the need for a permanent moratorium on swine CAFOs in the Buffalo National River watershed. • Application of hog waste onto Buffalo River watershed fields has resulted in phosphorous overloading. (See p. 6 explaining consequences of Legacy Phosphorus and page 2 for graphs from BCRET.)

BCRET: "Future additions of any nutrients (i.e., as mineral fertilizer, swine slurry, or poultry

litter) to fields, which received slurry from C&H Farms, should be carefully managed, so as

not to lead further increases in soil test P .  $\{1\}$ 

• BCRET graphs show :Significant increase in nitrates and phosphorous downstream from C&H BCRET "{2}

• Karst geology in the watershed leads to significantly increased radius of contamination

transport

BCRET: "The Big Creek Watershed below the C&H Farm and application field locations, lie

within a karst hydrologic system of great complexity exhibiting intimate connection of surfacewater and groundwater regimes. These characteristics endow the hydrologic system as an

important recreational resource locally and regionally, but also render the system vulnerable to

contamination." {3}

• Impaired status of Buffalo River and Big Creek

Using BCRET and other water sample data, 19 miles of Big Creek and 14 miles of the Buffalo, at

the confluence of Big Creek, were declared 303(d) impaired in 2018. {4} If only one swine concentrated feeding operation can, after only 5 years of operation, contribute to declining water quality in the Buffalo River watershed what would many or several do? Please support a moratorium of medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

### **Comment from: Dee Elkins**

P-148-1

After the expenditures of millions of both private and taxpayer dollars, it would be irresponsible to allow this kind of environmental threat to occur again. Make the moratorium against medium and large Hog CAFOs permanent.

This is justified as scientific reports (BECRET) show that both excess Phosphorous and Nitrogen are leaching from surface runoff and through the porous Karst into the Buffalo.

## **Comment from: Grant Scarsdale**

P-149-1

I feel like the Buffalo River and White River watersheds are valuable economic drivers for the North Arkansas Ozark region.

I am completely in favor of a permanent moratorium of CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. This area is a unique treasure that we Arkansans are blessed to have as a natural resource. The hard fought battles of the Ozark Society against them US Corps of Engineers are a legacy that a new generation has taken up. The players are different, but the goal is the same- the conservation and preservation of one of our Nation's and our State's most valuable treasure- the pristine beauty of the Buffalo National River. Emotional reasoning aside, scientific studies and research has proven that Karst topography is not a suitable geological terrain to locate large CAFOs that produce millions of gallons of untreated waste. Karst features allow for contaminant movement that is unpredictable, thus creating unforeseen pollution problems. Due to the subterranean nature of Karst, contamination remediation is uncharted territory. These problems could last for decades, even after a facility becomes antiquated, outlives its useful life, and is ultimately decommissioned.

I urge decision makers to leave a legacy of the preservation of Arkansas's crown jewel: the Buffalo National River. Please don't leave a legacy of pollution that sullies the gift of beauty God has given us in the spectacular glory of the Buffalo National River and its surrounding areas.

Thank you for your time and consideration.

## Comment from: debbie galbraith

P-150-1

As a frequent user of the Buffalo river and lands I am strongly opposed to allowing big hog or any confinement farming anywhere in the watershed area. This is one of the few pristine rivers in the US and more money could be made on tourism than large CFs that send their money out of state

## Comment from: Eileen Neukranz

P-151-1

I lived in beautiful northwest Arkansas for 9 years, asked the then-governor to save the Buffalo again, and I am appealing to you to save this national river from any chance of being despoiled again. Please learn the lesson and heed the millions of dollars and voices raised to not repeat this mistake. Thank you.

# Comment from: Gail King

P-152-1

I strongly support making the moratorium against medium and large Hog CAFO's permanent in Arkansas. After months in courts, and the spending of millions of dollars by private and taxpayer dollars to block the CAFO threatening the pristine Buffalo National River, it seems irresponsible, even ridiculous, to let this threat to occur again. Scientific reports (BCRET) have shown that excess levels of phosphorous and nitrogen are leaching from the surface runoff of waste from the hog farm and into the porous

karst, where it contaminates the Buffalo River and the creeks that feed into it. Thank you for acting to protect Arkansas' unique natural resource, the Buffalo National River, our nation's first.

#### Comment from: Robert van Rossum

P-153-1

Please make the moratorium against medium and large Hog CAFOs permanent.

This is justified as scientific reports (BCRET) show that both excess Phosphorous and Nitrogen are leaching from surface runoff and through the porous Karst into the Buffalo.

## **Comment from: Karen Crocker**

P-154-1

a permanent moratorium should be mandated for the Buffalo River Watershed.

## **Comment from: Paul Vickers**

P-155-1

After the expenditures of millions of both private and taxpayer dollars, it would be irresponsible to allow this kind of environmental threat to occur again. Make the moratorium against medium and large Hog CAFOs permanent.

## Comment from: Louise Mann

P-156-1

For Pete's sake please make this CAFO moratorium permanent and let's start holding staff accountable for giving permits in areas where they sholud not be given. Those tourists dollars and that gorgeous river are worth protecting for generations to come. Thank you. Louise Mann 629 Gray Avenue Fayetteville, AR 72701 P.O. Box 1185 72702.

# Comment from: Beth Goodwin

P-157-1

Please assure the public that the moratorium is permanent concerning farming near the Buffalo National River. The phosphorus and nitrogen are likely to be in the runoff because of the karst that is there. We have so much as a state to save the river; please don't let it be in vain. Thank you for believing in preserving the Buffalo National River.

## Comment from: judi Nail

P-158-1

There needs to be a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. After so much time, effort, and money has been used to get the C and H CAFO out of the river watershed please keep this from being an issue again. Put a permanent moratorium on CAFOs (everywhere, I do not put that in my body, no one should).

### Comment from: SCOTT STANLEY

#### P-159-1

The Federal Government and National Park Service actually took land from people to protect the Buffalo River for future generations. It is our duty to continue this protection. It would be a disservice to everyone to allow the waterway to be further polluted or allow others to create these risk.

The previous CAFO was corporate welfare. We had to pay to prove they were a risk then we had to pay them to leave. The nutrients (poisons) they left behind will continue to leach out for years.

After the expenditures of millions of both private and taxpayer dollars, it would be irresponsible to allow this kind of environmental threat to occur again. Make the moratorium against medium and large Hog CAFOs permanent.

This is justified as scientific reports (BCRET) show that both excess Phosphorous and Nitrogen are leaching from surface runoff and through the porous Karst into the Buffalo.

### Comment from: Roger Burke

P-160-1

To Whom This Concerns:

It is obvious that in order to prevent this situation from ever happening again, the moratorium that presently disallows medium and large hog CAFO's near the Buffalo River, needs to be permanent. The Buffalo River does not belong to us, we are merely charged with the task of protecting it for future generations. Nothing matters more. Thank you in advance, for doing the right and ethical thing here.

Sincerely, Roger Burke

## **Comment from: Dean Castle**

P-161-1

We need to put a permanent ban an CAFO in the Buffalo watershed . This "farm" never should've been allowed to happen with how porous that landscape is there . We have spent millions of dollars of taxpayers money that shouldn't have even been spent if this was not allowed to happen .

### Comment from: M K Elkins

P-162-1

This doesn't not include the air pollution. We have gone to Sam's Throne and it smell almost be unbearable

### Comment from: Vanessa Tomczak

P-163-1

Make the moratorium on medium and large scale hog CAFOs permanent for the health and safety of Arkansans.

#### **Comment from: Roxanne Thompson**

P-164-1

Please make medium and large hog farms illegal on the Buffalo River watershed. We don't want another mess to clean up. Protect the Buffalo River for ourselves and future generations to enjoy.

### **Comment from: Marshall dickey**

P-165-1

The Buffalo River is of higher value than any hog farm is worth to the state economy. please make the effort to ban medium to large operations so as to not disrupt this priceless ecosystem and commodity that our state is so lucky to have.

### **Comment from: Gene Sparling**

P-166-1

The ban on large scale hog farms in the Buffalo River water shed should be made permanent! The ban should be expanded to include any industrial / large scale livestock production. The protection of this national treasure should be top priority. There are plenty of suitable locations for such agricultural operations that do not risk such an irreplaceable asset.

#### **Comment from: Michael Stoecker**

P-167-1

How can water cleanliness be a divisive issue? It's the very product we depend on to live. My family is from Arkansas and I value the ability to return to a clean healthy state that values its water and not the polluting industries that abuse it.

### **Comment from: Margaret Sands**

P-168-1

This should not be temporary - it MUST be a permanent banning of ANY possibility of polluting the Buffalo River. It is sacred land and water and I pray it remains so

### **Comment from: Kim Smith**

P-169-1

Let's not ever have this divisive, difficult, embarrassing, expensive, and environmentally destructive mess happen again. Protect our state's most valuable and famous natural resource and all the income and livelihood that springs from it. The moratorium should be permanent if we want the river to recover from the damage already done to it by a single CAFO.

Thanks so much.

# **Comment from: Karen Seller**

P-170-1

The last litter of piglets should be weaned and on their way out of the Mt Judea hog factory soon. This chapter of SAVE THE BUFFALO RIVER AGAIN is over but there is more to be done. First and foremost is making the temporary moratorium against medium and large hog CAFOs permanent. This requires ADEQ action and approval from the legislative council. The comment period is open again so please take the time to send an email (link below)

My comments for the club: After the expenditures of millions of both private and taxpayer dollars, it would be irresponsible to allow this kind of environmental threat to occur again. Make the moratorium against medium and large Hog CAFOs permanent.

This is justified as scientific reports (BCRET) show that both excess Phosphorous and Nitrogen are leaching from surface runoff and through the porous Karst into the Buffalo.

# Comment from: Cary Roth

P-171-1

I am writing to express my strong support for a permanent moratorium on medium and large CAFOS in the Buffalo River Watershed. Please get this done.

# **Comment from: Kenneth Carle**

P-172-1

As a resident of Searcy County, I support a ban on any medium to large size cafo's in the Buffalo River watershed. The Buffalo River is a national treasure and should be treated as one.

# **Comment from: Roger Jones**

P-173-1

I am a small business owner, President of Compton Rural water Association, on the Board of Newton County Chamber of Commerce, and a land owner in Newton County. I am a capitalist and conservative libertarian. The Buffalo National River is the lifeblood and present and future economic engine of this area, and the crown jewel of Arkansas. That should be the end of the discussion, any wise person could instantly understand and recognize that CAFOS should not be allowed in any part of the watershed, there is no debate and the will of the people is obvious.

## **Comment from: Edd French**

P-174-1

The moratorium on medium and large swine CAFO's should be permanent

### Comment from: Jan VanSchuyver

P-175-1

Please make the ban on CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed permanent. It is irresponsible to do otherwise, as we've learned in dealing with the closure of the current CAFO polluting the watershed.

### Comment from: Glenn Benson

P-176-1

The Buffalo River is one of the Natural State's most valuable treasures & should be protected in the future at all costs. There never should have been, nor should there ever be any Hog farms anywhere with 100 miles of the river or any of it's tributaries now or anytime in the future. It should be permanently illegal to build any Hog farms anywhere in the karst landscape area anywhere near or around the National River.

## **Comment from: Cheryl Rutledge**

P-177-1

After the expenditures of millions of both private and taxpayer dollars, it would be irresponsible to allow this kind of environmental threat to occur again. Make the moratorium against medium and large Hog CAFOs permanent.

This is justified as scientific reports (BCRET) show that both excess Phosphorous and Nitrogen are leaching from surface runoff and through the porous Karst into the Buffalo.

It would be horrendous to allow this to happen again! Please save our National river treasure and all sources of our precious water.

### Comment from: tsunemi yamashita

P-178-1

After the expenditures of millions of both private and taxpayer dollars, it would be irresponsible to allow this kind of environmental threat to occur again. Make the moratorium against medium and large Hog CAFOs permanent.

Please work to see that individuals do not have to fight against these threats to our public lands and waterways.

# **Comment from: Jeff Hood**

P-179-1

The Arkansas Phosphorus Index (API) a formula that allows more waste to be spread than the crops can absorb, does not account for groundwater contamination or karst environments. The geology of the entire drainage area is underlain by the Boone Formation which is karst geology, making the Buffalo watershed particularly vulnerable to pollutants.

It is abundantly clear to nearly everyone in the state that is not directly associated with the hog farm, that this is a sensitive area that holds some of Arkansas' most abundant natural resources. Keeping this area protected from future farms similar to what was once there will ensure our ability to remain The Natural State and provide adequate protection for the watershed.

### **Comment from: Fay Knox**

P-180-1

Dear Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality, Re: APC&EC Reg 5&6 Revisions or Rulemakings.

I am writing to ask approval on a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

Each time a request for comments is asked for, I have replied and am grateful that a solution has been put in place that is fair to owners and will do remediation to the land that was C&H Hog Farm.

Fourteen miles of the Buffalo National River along with Big Creek was declared impaired in 2018. Do not take the risk of further declining the water quality of our nation's first national river, a major natural and economic resource for Arkansas.

It is my understanding that the comment that was previously closed was reopened to include the results of the Big Creek Research Extension Team's (BCRET) final report. The report states in the following quotes the fact of increased phosphorous present downstream from C&H and that the complex karst hydrologic system is vulnerable to contamination.

The following quotes from the limited BCRET report illustrate need for moratorium: • In Chapter 7 of the BCRET report increased phosphorous is seen downstream from the one existing CAFO in the watershed. BCRET states that : 'Future additions of any nutrients ( i.e. as mineral fertilizer, swine slurry, or poultry litter) should be carefully managed so as not to lead to further increases in soil test P. ( BCRET Final Report, October 24,2019, Chapter 7, pp 30-31).

• "The Big Creek Watershed below the C&H Farm and application field locations, lie within a karst hydrologic system of great complexity exhibiting intimate connection of surface-water and groundwater regimes. These characteristics endow the hydrologic

system as an important recreational resource locally and regionally, but also render the system vulnerable to contamination." (BCRET Final Report, Oct. 24, 2019 Chapter 2, p.2).

Please keep Arkansas the natural state and approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

Sincerely, Fay Knox HC 62 Box 692 Deer, AR 72628

# **Comment from: James Seawel**

P-181-1

The Buffalo is too precious a national resource for Arkansas to take any chances with its natural state. We can be pro agriculture and be good guardians of the USA's first national river at the same time. Arkansas has done so for years. Now is not the time to cave.

# Comment from: Judith DUGUID

P-182-1

MY husband have written many letters to stop CAFO from existing in the watersheds, especially here in Ark. We have spent many wonderful hours on the rivers of Arkansas. Keep our rivers and lakes clear and clean, please. Thank you for the work to support this cause. JUDITH DUGUID and Elmer Gall.

# Comment from: Michael Rapp

P-183-1

I ask the Arkansas Dept. of Environmental Quality to make the temporary moratorium on medium and large swine CAFOs permanent in north Arkansas, in order to protect the water quality of the Buffalo River watershed. I moved from central Arkansas to Tennessee three years ago, yet I still visit Arkansas regularly. I submitted a critique of the draft Environmental Impact statement in August, 2015, and that critique is attached. Further studies since that time corroborate the damage being done to the watershed and to the groundwater. Measurements have shown clearly that large CAFOs are incompatible with necessary water quality in the area.

# **Comment from: Richard Barnes**

P-183-1

This matter needs to be put to rest with a permanent moratorium on all cafo's in our watersheds.

## **Comment from: Karen Harris**

P-184-1

Please make the CNH moratorium permanent, and keep keep our cherished Buffalo River clean for current and future generations.

# Comment from: richard gray

P-185-1

Hogs have no place anywhere around any body of water.

## Comment from: Elaine Appel

P-186-1

1) The watershed is that of a National River under the care of our state.

2) The geology of the drainage area is underlain by the Boone Formation which is karst geology, making the Buffalo watershed particularly vulnerable to pollutants.

3) CAFO waste is spread on pastures using the Arkansas Phosphorus Index (API) which fails to account for groundwater or karst.

4) Soils in the Buffalo River watershed are too thin to accommodate industrial level distribution of CAFO waste.

5) The record shows agency concerns and degradation in regard to the single facility permitted.

### **Comment from: Brad Green**

P-188-1

I support a permanent moratorium on swine CAFO in the Buffalo River watershed.

# **Comment from: Camille Carpenter**

P-189-1

I strongly support a permanent moratorium on any sort of hog farm and or CAFO in Big Creek/Buffalo River area.

### **Comment from: Autumn Gillmore**

P-190-1

The Buffalo National River is a national treasure and very important to Arkansas's tourism industry. We've taken the important first step of eliminating the C&H hog farm. Please now take the step to make this protection permanent, by enacting a permanent moratorium on hog farming in this area of the state.

# Comment from: Joe Golden

P-191-1

It should be obvious to anyone in State Government that the residents of North West Arkansas will fight to keep the moritorium in place permanently. We vote and we will replace legislators who try to allow CAFO's in the Ozarks.

# Comment from: Genia Bennett

#### P-192-1

Please quit polluting our national river. It has an international following. It seems to me it's a travesty to allow a very few to benefit to the detriment of the rest of us!

## Comment from: Dara Yeager

P-193-1

My family is afraid to canoe and swim in the river now. My family and friends no longer want to come to Arkansas for their vacations. You need to permanently fix this and fast!

# Comment from: Sylvia Scott

P-194-1

Please, please, please impose a permanent moratorium against allowing hog farms or any similar operation anywhere near the Buffalo River watershed. Our first National River was once the cleanest. It is a precious resource to be protected for the enjoyment of future generations! I grew up swimming and floating almost daily in the Buffalo. My dad's favorite activity was fishing there. He not only enjoyed the sport of catching fish; he loved cooking them with homemade hushpuppies, potatoes and onions. He shared with others and was well.known in the area for his fish fries. Fish also helped subsidize our food budget. We ate fish at least weekly. I wholeheartedly support the moratorium!

## **Comment from: Maria Smith**

P-195-1

Please keep the hog farms off our waterways. Protect not pollute. Thank you

# Comment from: Ronald Stark

P-196-1

I support the rule changes that create a permanent moratorium on large-scale hog farms in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: Martha Ragar

P-197-1

I support the rule changes that create a permanent moratorium on hog farming in the Buffalo River area.

# **Comment from: Marty Mignard**

P-198-1

I am very much in favor of having a permanent moratorium on all large scale swine production facilities in the Buffalo River watershed. This is a beautiful river, and I do not want it polluted by pig waste water run off.

# **Comment from: Michael Adelman**

P-199-1

For many years as a resident of Arkansas, and volunteer in the Buffalo River National Park and Ozark National Forest, I am well acquainted with the fragile wonder of the 'Natural State'. Living as I do now, in New England, I see the damage done by less enlightened generations to our ecosystems.

Regulation 5 & 6 - made permanent - are important opportunities to preclude degradation to the rough kind of beauty that is Arkansas. I support and urge making the regulations permanent.

## Comment from: Debbie Alexy

P-200-1

I write to urge a permanent moratorium on middle and large size confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs) in or near the Buffalo National River and its watershed area and in the entire State of Arkansas.

The C&H CAFO experiment resulted in the Buffalo National River impairment after less than 5 years of operation from just a single CAFO operation. Multiple CAFOs would destroy the river and the environment permanently. CAFOs are inhumane and inefficient methods of farming large animals. The cost for cleanup of these operations is excessive and always passed to the taxpayer rather than the corporate owners. THIS. MUST. STOP. PERMANENTLY.

Water resources are finite in Arkansas. Population growth is expanding. State regulatory policies should focus on preventing municipal, commercial, industrial, agricultural, and recreational polution of all water ways in Arkansas, starting with the Buffalo National River. Policy development should include a 5 year, 10 year, 20 year and 50 year conservation/environmental plan on a regional basis in the State with hands on educational and funding assistance.

This would ideally become part of the larger issues of the Governor's recent focus on flooding, dams, canals, etc.

Agriculture in Arkansas (aka Farm Bureau) should not be the only player at the table to decide these fundamental issues for the State and for all Arkansans.

Three elements to support human life: Air, water, and food. A human will die within minutes without air; within days without water. It takes a few weeks to starve from food deprivation.

Water trumps food in the survival chain. It should also trump agricultural industries in political policy decisions.

# **Comment from: Terry Karnes**

#### P-201-1

So as with any industry there can be overuse and the community left behind has long term effects. As I get older, even a 5 year effect lessens my quality of life. As to the hog farms, it makes common sense not to put large scale ops in a state. I flew across TX and saw barn after barn - a city of hogs. CAFO's (medium and large) pollute the soil and air. Are we turning into China? Are these just for Americans? Or just to put money in someone else pocket? Why pollute our oasis, have waste imbedded in the soil for years to come? The industry is set up where it is the farmers fault if pollution happens. Think of the abandoned ponds in North Carolina. If you would not live next to one, don't expect other Arkansans to. I mean, we have septic systems, sewage treatment plants... we don't dump large amounts of waste on the ground - even in powered form. Why let them? The farms are just moving from state to state with low regulations - after uproar in one state, they move to another...WE are the Natural state - lets keep it that way and put a permanent moratorium against medium and large hog farms.

### Comment from: Raymond Herschend

#### P-202-1

Hi, Thanks for listening. I own land in the headwaters - next valley over from Lost Valley. What I do on my land directly effects water quality in the buffalo river area. I feel responsible to protect the legacy of the park. Last year I was offered to sell to a turkey plant. I didn't. My down stream neighbors deserve my best.

I grew up spending most weekends in The Buffalo River drainage basin, In caves, off cliffs in canoes. I remember hearing about the overwhelming work it took to create this legacy, the people who created a protected area we call the buffalo river, but we know it goes far beyond the stream bed. All the karst features come together with one shared fate. The drainage system actually goes outside park boundaries a bit, so we depend on our good neighbors to not pollute our water. Imagine how upset we'd be if they poisoned / polluted our resource. How crazy it would be to Poisson/pollute it ourselves.

YOU are now the caretakers of that huge resource, owned by the people, used by the people. But YOU make decisions that will sustain the legacy, or end it painfully. What will be your legacy? Will you be the idiots that allowed poision / polution in to destroy the amazing overwhelming resource? Your children and their children will know. Someone either screwed up this resource, or they protected it.

There is a place in the world for medium and small hog farms (factories). Turkey and chicken plants too, have their place in the world. BUT IT IS NOT IN KARST! There is plenty of places, that are not in karst, that can accommodate their needs. You wouldn't want that plant next to your house, above your well. Over your drinking water. The water your kids play in.

My grandchildren are growing up spending much time in the buffalo river area. YOUR

LEGACY can be the voice making decisions to protect that resource.

Can you imagine the task of creating the protected area. What would it feel like if you were the families that got, well, kicked out, so the park could take your land. And then, what if they allowed pollution to ruin what they gave up their homes to create. Those families made a sacrifice so others could enjoy a unique resource. Please don't let hog/turkey/chicken plants to ruin their sacrifice. Their legacy was disturbed to make this one, the one you are commissioned to protect.

Thank you for taking time to listen. I am very hopeful. I believe you will make good choices, work hard protecting the legacy.

\_Bruce\_Herschend. Just another boy playing in the river, for 57 years.

# **Comment from: Blake Stone**

P-203-1

I'm a former geology student of karst in the Buffalo National River watershed, and current master's student of karst hydrogeology. It is good to see policy makers acknowledging geology and environmental hazards in their decision making. I support a permanent moratorium on large and medium size CAFOs in the BNR watershed.

## **Comment from: Will Larkin**

P-204-1

I support a permanent moratorium on CAFO's in the Buffalo National River watershed. I've enjoyed the natural beauty of the Buffalo river area for the last 20 years, and would like to see it protected for future generations. There are plenty of other areas for CAFO's in Arkansas. Please keep them away (permanently) from the Buffalo river area.

# **Comment from: Harvey Pierce**

P-205-1

I want to express my support for making the temporary moratorium on medium and large swine CAFO's permanent. There never should have been a CAFO in the area and there shouldn't ever be one again.

# Comment from: Dr Ray Hall

P-206-1

I strongly support the rule changes that create a permanent moratorium on large scale hog farms in the Buffalo River watershed.

# Comment from: Jackie Lamar

P-207-1

Please limit the size of animal farms in the Buffalo River watershed. It is a national treasure and the refuse from the now closed hog farm was already showing increased algae in the river and more pollutants in the water. Keep the Buffalo as pure and natural as possible.

## **Comment from: Donnie Hutchens**

### P-208-1

There should have NEVER been a Hog farm of anything near the scale of what was allowed to take place near this river. We are a large country with land that could be used for large scale agriculture in many places. The Buffalo River is a small area compared to the rest of the country. NO LARGE SCALE AGRICULTURE ANY WHERE NEAR THIS RIVER.

## **Comment from: Donnie Hutchens**

P-209-1

There should have NEVER been a Hog farm of anything near the scale of what was allowed to take place near this river. We area large country with land that could be used for large scale agriculture in many places. The Buffalo River is a small area compared to the rest of the country. NO LARGE SCALE AGRICULTURE ANY WHERE NEAR THIS RIVER.

# **Comment from: Richard Olson**

P-210-1

Please consider the devastating impact on the rivers health.

# Comment from: Kathryn Searcy

P-211-1

I am in support of rule changes to create a permanent moratorium on large-scale hog farms in the Buffalo River basin. The Buffalo River is the first national river and is a gift to generations—those preceding us and those following us. We must do our part to protect its condition and restore its water quality as we preserve the River for our great grandchildren.

Please create a permanent moratorium by promulgating and enforcing rules which protect the Buffalo River.

# Comment from: Roxanne Thompson

P-212-1

Please ban medium and large CAFO's from the Buffalo River watershed permanently. We don't want to clean up another expensive mess!!!

# Comment from: Ted Porter

P-213-1

Save the buffalo, a most beautiful

Wild and scenic river. It would be doing the state of Arkansas a disservice to keep polluting such a treasured gem. I've spent many a day on that river, enjoying the scenic beauty. No more Cafo!!

# **Comment from: Robert Merritt**

#### P-214-1

Make region 5 & 6 the beautiful environment it was meant to be.

## **Comment from: Don Hamilton**

P-215-1

I SUPPORT THE PROPOSAL.

## **Comment from: Linda Schuck**

P-216-1

I support the permanent removal of anything that may damage the beauty of environment in, near or around the Buffalo Natl Park.

### **Comment from: Karen Bartle**

P-217-1

I own land just 3 miles from the C&H Hog Farm. They were one of the reasons I have left the area. I can think of better things to smell than hog manure in the morning. The Buffalo River is a National Treasure that must be protected. To make protections only temporary is ludacris. There is not going to be some point in the future where the geological formations under Newton county will suddenly make CAFCOs safe for the Buffalo. There will never be a point at which factory farms will be economically sound for a tourist destination. There will never be a point when CAFCOs are no longer massively polluting and destructive of the environment they are in. Please make the moratorium permanent. I might even move home.

# **Comment from: Robert Smith**

P-218-1

I live on the white River downstream from the confluence of the buffalo river and the white river. I frequently use the buffalo and white for fishing and swimming. I do not want a hog farm on any creek dumping into the buffalo contaminating the water. Also the real investors of the hog farm are from Brazil so it's not even American. Stop it. Move it. The people have spoken. Choose the next hog farm site better. Non karat environment and away from streams rivers and lakes.

# **Comment from: Paula Breid**

P-219-1

How many times must the people who love Arkansas and our Buffalo River tell you to close down this polluting hog farm permanently.

# Comment from: Mike McMullin

P-220-1

I strongly believe that a permanent ban on medium and large hog farms near the Buffalo River is necessary to protect our priceless resource.

# Comment from: Lorraine Heartfield, PhD

#### P-221-1

I am in favor of a permanent moratorium on CAFO's in the Buffalo River watershed. This National River belongs to the public and corporate interest should not be allowed to endanger this valuable treasure. The risks to the integrity of the Buffalo Watershed from CAFO's are many and include, for example, karst topography that is particularly vulnerable to allowing pollutants to enter subsurface waters that drain into the watershed.

Please keep this watershed clean for the health and safety of this exceptional riverine system and for the people of Arkansas and our visitors.

### Comment from: julian clark

P-222-1

please protect the buffalo river water quality by adopting the permanent on cafo's in the buffalo river watershed.

### Comment from: mary adams

P-223-1

In total favor of a permanent moratorium to protect the Buffalo River from any and all hog farms or any pollutants to said river.

### **Comment from: Winston Smith**

P-224-1

hello

### **Comment from: Winston Smith**

P-225-1

hi

# **Comment from: Tom Parsons**

P-226-1

I care deeply about the water quality in Arkansas.

# **Comment from: Kathleen Trotter**

P-227-1

Please put into effect a PERMANENT MORATORIUM on any Contained Animal Feeding Operations in the Buffalo River watershed. I am a regular recreational user of the Buffalo River. Research has demonstrated that the soil above the karst rock is too thin to absorb animal waste and that spreading it does pollute the river. This is a travesty for the thousands of Arkansans who appreciate the river's current pristine condition, AND pollution will seriously damage the tourist industry in Arkansas.

Thank you.

# **Comment from: Tom Parsons**

#### P-228-1

I care deeply about the water quality in Arkansas.

# **Comment from: Glenda Allison**

P-229-1

I support the proposed moratorium on all CAFO's -large, medium, or small - in the Buffalo River Watershed. I think what has happened in the past six years should have taught us that a karst region such as this is not a place for a CAFO of any size.

I live in Carroll County. I kayak and support all the rivers in our state. We take clean water for granted in this country. We must protect our water.

I do not understand why this comment period had to be repeated. I made comments for the first comment period, many did. Is ADEQ hoping less people are paying attention? I support the proposed moratorium on CAFO's to help protect the Buffalo River.

# **Comment from: John Shelton**

P-230-1

I strongly support the permanent moratorium on CAFO's in the Buffalo National River watershed. The effects of these types of operations in this delicate area of our beautiful state and National Park can be devastating to the environment, businesses, and tourism which is vital to

our state.

# **Comment from: Tom Parsons**

P-231-1

I care deeply about the water quality in Arkansas.

# **Comment from: Steven Singleton**

P-232-1

We need the moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed to be permanent. How many times must we go through this fight over too much effluent applied over thin soils and porous subsurface geology? Given that the C&H farm permit should never have been granted in the first place, particularly without input from the public or the professionals on staff at the Buffalo National River, the solution the governor has brokered is a good one for all parties, except the taxpayers of our state. But let's not leave the door open for more such eventualities.

# Comment from: JP Willis

P-233-1

While I fully support commerce there are times by products can create harm. I believe these concentrations of waste should be controlled. With the numbers of animals these CAFO have there is nothing on the horizon but problems. We can do better

# Comment from: Mike Kelly

P-234-1

I am a member of North Arkansas Fly Fishers and strongly support doing whatever is necessary to protect the water quality in the Buffalo River, including establishing a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

The C&H permit was flawed and ADEQ should never had approved the permit. To the extent that its hands were tied, the answer must be to restrict CAFOs within the Buffalo River Watershed. Please protect the National River and the extraordinary resource that it is. We should not be required to buy out every environmental problem. An once of protection is required.

## **Comment from: Katy Hinegardner**

P-235-1

I would like to state how important I feel it is to keep large hog farms away from the Buffalo River watershed. Feces from confined animals of any kind should not be allowed in runoff that flows into rivers.

# Comment from: MAGELL CANDELARIA

P-236-1

As a new member of North Arkansas Fly Fishing club I received word of the temporary moratorium on CAFO along drainage flowing into Buffalo River waterway. I am a fly fisher and kayaker and plan on enjoying a portion of the Buffalo River via kayak soon, consequently I strongly support enacting policy and procedures as deemed beneficial and necessary to protect the water quality for indigenous aqueous species and public use of the Buffalo River. This position includes establishing a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed for enjoyment and future use by all.

# **Comment from: Shelley Buonaiuto**

P-237-1

Dear Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality, Re: APC&EC Reg. 5&6 Revisions or Rulemakings. Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

The C&H CAFO was approved without adequate oversight or information provided to the public and was allowed to operate for 6 years. The resulting contamination of the Buffalo River and cost to taxpayers to remove the operation was unnecessary. To prevent repeats of this ecological and economic injustice there must be a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. The karst infrastructure of the watershed is well known, as is the economic dependency on tourism along the Buffalo River. The people of Arkansas, as well as the many from across the nation who come to float the beautiful river, will continue to fight to defend the area's ecological health. That such a fight with the agency created to protect our environment has been necessary is troubling. Hopefully now the ADEQ has sufficient data and experience to reject further encroachment of CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

Thank you, Shelley Buonaiuto

## **Comment from: Robert Dunn**

P-238-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C&H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C&H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### **Comment from: Carol Storthz**

P-239-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: Cassie Gill

#### P-240-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

## **Comment from: Nonah Olesen**

### P-241-1

I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: William Wellner

### P-242-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

Arkansas is fortunate to have a nationally recognized river and should do its utmost to protect this heritage for now and the future generations. Having canoed the river and personally taken in its beauty and tranquility I definitely want to keep the opportunity for others to do the same.

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: JOHN LAYSON

#### P-243-1

As a native Arkansasan, frequent Buffalo River visitor, and national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

#### Comment from: james hicks

P-244-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

#### Comment from: Suzie Bell

P-245-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: Shirley Bailey

P-246-1

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### **Comment from: William Etges**

P-247-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: Marian Johnson

P-248-1

I believe the State of Arkansas needs to put in place a permanent moratorium against all medium and large scale CAFO'S subject to all breeds of animals that could be farmed, birthed, grown and processed in and around the Buffalo River Watershed and it's large or small tributaries. We, the people of the State of Arkansas do not want or need to be payors of any more monies to private or corporate individuals in order to compensate them for business that should not be allowed to start-up in this area...IN THE FIRST PLACE. I can readily see unsavory business entities putting a CAFO or equivalent business in these areas because of remoteness of location...just in hopes the State of Arkansas will pay money to remove said business. Hence a "get rich quick scheme" be facilitated for those who intentionally do not follow "best management practices". Sincerely, Marian L. Johnson

# **Comment from: Christine Perry**

P-249-1

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: Gregory Flower

P-250-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: Peggy Volland

P-251-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: Mike Swanner

P-252-1

The damage to such a national & espically an Arkansas treasure is a complete violation of the trust we expect from our leaders. If this goes through I will be sure that every official that allowed this to happen is recognized as a completely undeserving of any of our support.

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# **Comment from: Joseph Hewgley**

### P-253-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### **Comment from: Jack Stewart**

P-254-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: Terry Dailey

P-255-1

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### **Comment from: Carolyn Watts**

P-256-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: Michael Sprunger

P-257-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: Jo Johnson

P-258-1

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

#### **Comment from: Jean Smith**

P-259-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: Carol Patterson

P-260-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### **Comment from: Carol Patterson**

P-261-1

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

I speak not only for myself but for the Northwest Arkansas Audubon Society.

# Comment from: Gail King

P-262-1

I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs). As a supporter of our National Parks, and someone who has enjoyed the Buffalo National River and appreciates the unique nature of that precious natural resource, I strongly object to allowing any operation that degrades the water quality of the Buffalo River.

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: Kara Beach

P-263-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: Ed Laster

P-264-1

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: Judith Griffith

P-265-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: Karen Garrett

P-266-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# **Comment from: Sandy Pianalto**

P-267-1

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: Beverly Glass

P-268-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: Brent Boughn

P-269-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: Deborah Meldahl

P-270-1

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

Please continue on this positive path! You have my never ending support!

# Comment from: Teresa Crawford

P-271-1

Hog "farms" and any other meat factory that harms the ecosystem should not be allowed to exists at all, never the less in the Buffalo River area. It's a beautiful and very significant part of our wild life habitats in NWA. It is a vital part of our world and should not be threatened by the produce line of an animal. Please get and keep them out and put in a safe location; or just find another way to dispose of toxic materials. Many others feel this way!

# **Comment from: Charles Lowrey**

P-272-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: Sidney Graham

P-273-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### **Comment from: Susan Jenkins**

#### P-274-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: Cynthia Patton

#### P-275-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

We live in NWA and visit the Buffalo regularly. It is not hyperbole to say it is a truly wonderful, rejuvenating, spiritual place to connect with nature. We have so few of these gems where people from everywhere can appreciate being citizens of what a wonderful country we have. There are many, many others places where farms can exist. There is no other place our natural wonders can exist other than where they are. Their home in our country.

I appreciate you Governor Hutchinson for brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

#### **Comment from: Elisabeth Olsson**

P-276-1

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

#### **Comment from: Laura Hutzel**

P-277-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

#### **Comment from: Natalie Mannering**

P-278-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: D. Dunagin

P-279-1

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### **Comment from: Shirley Pharis**

P-280-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### **Comment from: Larry Hedrick**

P-281-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: Don Castleberry

P-282-1

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### **Comment from: Joe Murphy**

P-283-1

I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C&H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. This type of business should never have been allowed near an Arkansas treasure like the Buffalo River.

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson's efforts to get rid C&H and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# **Comment from: Danny Jenkins**

P-284-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: Lisa Schoultz

P-285-1

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

#### Comment from: Bill Beall

P-286-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: Karen Keith

P-287-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: James Haguewood

P-288-1

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

#### Comment from: Julia Tucker

P-289-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: Lynell Withers

P-290-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: Scott Luchesi

P-291-1

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: Jerome Jansma

P-292-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson's brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# **Comment from: Gregory Floyd**

#### P-293-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# **Comment from: Wendy Luna**

P-294-1

Please don't let this happen again. We must establish a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed

# Comment from: Tammy Alexander

#### P-295-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### **Comment from: Pat Yates**

#### P-296-1

The Buffalo River is a national treasure and a jewel in the landscape of The Natural State of Arkansas. As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C&H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed.

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C& H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

As the first National River in our country, this special area deserves all the protection it is due.

### Comment from: Brenda Tirey

P-297-1

As one who has enjoyed the Buffalo River and its surroundings over many years, I support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed, such as proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson's arranging the purchase of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys proposed regulations to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### **Comment from: Carol Patterson**

P-298-1

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: David Harju

P-299-1

I an 56 years old. I was a Boy Scout. I worked at Camp Orr on the BRV as a teenager. When I visit the BRV now days I see an obvious degradation in the water quality compared to that of the 1970's. It saddens me.

The effects already inflicted on the Buffalo River Water Shed will leave a mark for years to come. Please make this a permanent moratorium. We are still learning about the effects of human impacts on ecosystems.

There are ways, already in practice, to raise animals for slaughter that are exponentially better for the environment, the animals, and better nutritionally. We should learn to coexist, not control and overpower our environment.

Thanks David Harju

# **Comment from: Susan Leslie**

P-300-1

I wholeheatedly support the change proposed by ADEQ to Rule 5 and 6 that would institute a permanent moritorium on issuance of permits for any medium and large CAFO's in the Buffalo National River Watershed. The watershed deserves our utmost care. It is very vulnerable to pollutants due to its Karst geology. Personally, I have enjoyed this watershed through hiking the trails, and floating trips on the Buffalo River ever since my arrival to Arkansas in 1970. I was an out of State student to attend college at U of A. The watershed area is one of my reasons I remained in Arkansas after my graduation. Let's continue to protect it from any further harm.

# **Comment from: Chris Daniels**

P-301-1

I was born in Clearwater Florida. I grew up here and watched greed destroy my beautiful home. Over development is causing countless problems. The oceans off out coast are dying, because of what this had become. Don't let greed destroy this irreplaceable invaluable place. The greedy are coming. Protect & Restore

## **Comment from: Barry Bennett**

P-302-1

I support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C&H Hog Farms, Inc. I also support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

## **Comment from: John Andrews**

P-303-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

I want say that my support for protecting the Buffalo River comes from respect for the wonderful land God has given us, and I respect those people who really care for, and who are grateful for, our earthly home. Thank you for your attention.--John M. Andrews

# Comment from: Pamela Westerman

P-304-1

I bought property that borders the park property on the lower Buffalo River. I moved here from out of state with my family because of the beauty and protected status of the Buffalo River. My children were raised here and I started a business- point being the protected clean waters of the Buffalo River continuously feeds and grows the economies of the small Ozark towns along the river valley. We care about this river and no one wants to live down wind or down stream from an industrial hog feeding facility. Please make the moratorium permanent for the sake of growing children, river lovers, property owners and future generations.

# **Comment from: Lynn Christie**

P-305-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

#### **Comment from: Gerald Weber**

P-306-1

No CAFOs should be allowed permits any where in the Buffalo River watershed. Any farmer or rancher who wants to raise more than a dozen hogs for sale should be required to obtain a permit from ADEQ under a regulation 5 permit and this must include public notices in local media, a public comment period. Regulation 6 should be discarded.

## **Comment from: Carol Patterson**

P-307-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

## **Comment from: Carol Patterson**

P-308-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

## **Comment from: Caitlin Cassidy**

#### P-309-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

## Comment from: Glenda Allison

P-310-1

I support a permanent moratorium on all CAFO's in the Buffalo River Watershed. I read in the BCRET final report that legacy phosphorus will take several decades if not more to resolve due to the 5 years of operation of C&H Farms. Is this not enough to support the permanent moratorium?

I live in Carroll County. I am a paddler and camper. I support clean water. NW Arkansas has clean water for now. I feel this degradation of the Buffalo River by C&H Farms should be a lesson in what not to do again.

Yes to the permanent moratorium.

# **Comment from: Bruce Petray**

P-311-1

This was a mistake from the start. I am glad to see that it is being corrected. Hopefully we won't make these type of mistakes again!

# Comment from: Diane Mikrut

P-312-1

"I am a member of Friends of the North Fork and White Rivers and strongly support doing whatever is necessary to protect the water quality in the Buffalo River, most especially including establishing a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed."

# Comment from: Glenda Allison

P-313-1

Karst geology is a fact in the Buffalo River Watershed. It is a large part of what creates the beauty and mystique of the amazing Buffalo River. I feel like we have now seen what a large CAFO will do in a karst region. Many miles of Big Creek and the Buffalo are now on the impaired list. I sit on the board of the Kings River Watershed in Carroll County. I know what this list is and what it means.

Nationally Arkansas may still have a reputation of having stupid backward hillbillies filling it's hills. We who live here know that isn't true. We love living here. But if we don't learn from this mistake that has compromised the Buffalo then we are stupid. I support a permanent moratorium on medium and large -no ALL- CAFO's in the Buffalo River Watershed.

We all live downstream. We all must have clean water.

## **Comment from: Larry Olesen**

P-314-1

I strongly support doing whatever is necessary to protect the water quality in the Buffalo River, especially establishing a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

The karst geology and the increasing numbers of high flow, stormwater, peak rain events that flush untreated wastes into the tributaries and main channel of the Buffalo National River are evidence that the only solution to preserving this national treasure is to prevent concentrated wastes from entering its waters.

A permanent moratorium is an excellent means toward that end.

# Comment from: Ray Stahl

P-315-1

Dear Mr. Harper,

I have lived in Arkansas for over 40 years. During this time I have come to appreciate and enjoy the Buffalo National River. I applaud the actions by many in the state to close the C&H confined agricultural farming operation and to take initial steps to protect the Buffalo. I encourage you and your department to take further action to establish a permanent moratorium on future CAFO facilities in the area of the Buffalo National River. Only a permanent solution will help reserve this national treasure for this and future generations of Arkansans. Respectfully, Ray E. Stahl

# Comment from: Marc McCord

P-316-1

As a member of Friends of the North Fork and White Rivers, and a frequent Arkansas visitor who has spent many years canoeing the Buffalo, White, and most other Arkansas Rivers I am grateful for the decision to close C&H Hog Farm operations, but that is just the first step. There needs to be a permanent prohibition against any commercial operations along any Arkansas river that imperils the quality, health and safety of our waterways, which are the lifeblood of ALL living things on this planet.

Cleanups are costly and time-consuming. Preventing the need to clean up these messes is both environmentally responsible AND a major financial benefit to taxpaying citizens who are usually saddled with the cleanup costs when commercial operators choose bankruptcy to avoid their fiscal responsibilities.

I strongly urge passage of permanent prohibitions against CAFO or other commercial operations in the drainage basins of Arkansas streams to protect the tremendous and significant tourism industry that is so vital to Arkansas.

## Comment from: Dr Janice LaBrie

P-317-1

Thank you for allowing my comments. In June 2019 four of my friends and I floated from Boxley to Rush on the Buffalo river. This may be the only place in Arkansas where a long float on a protected river is possible. The beauty of the Buffalo River is so important fo so many people who frequent the waters whether it be for floating, fishing, family gatherings etc... The health of the river is very important for the wildlife that live near it and in it. We saw otters, lots of fish and birds and a very special siting of what we believe is a "dark morph of a broad winged hawk".

# Comment from: Geniece Yates

P-318-1

As a 35-year Buffalo River lover, Im writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed.

Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C&H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: joseph long

P-319-1

I am a member of the Arkansas Wildlife Federation and a retired wildlife biologist.

I strongly support doing whatever is necessary to protect the water quality in the Buffalo River, including establishing a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

It is critical we protect the water quality in this state and national treasure.

#### Comment from: Samantha Blanchard

P-320-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### **Comment from: Bennie Scott**

P-321-1

I am in favor of a permanent moratorium to provide permanent protection to the Buffalo River watershed against any future CAFOs.

### **Comment from: Christine Carlson**

P-322-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

#### **Comment from: Paula Pope**

P-323-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

## Comment from: Dennis W Wright

P-324-1

As a long time user of The Buffalo River, I will support any activity that will insure the continued water quality of the river. I trust you will exert your energies to accomplish the same.

## Comment from: Dave Stahle

P-325-1

Please do not permit large confined animal feeding operations within the watershed of the Buffalo National River.

Much obliged, Dave

## Comment from: Kirk Wasson

P-326-1

All concentrated animal growing farms of any size should not be allowed on watersheds of National Rivers and Wild and Scenic Rivers. More scientific data and research should be mandatory for approving any hog, bovine or poultry operations of any size. Major plans on monitoring and waste management should be place with monetary guarantees and criminal penalties before approving even small farms in other watersheds. Cows should be limited to one animal per acre. Hogs should be limited to the number of acres of land that the waste can be spread on. X? number of hogs per acre. All potential spread fields should be evaluated for potential runoff rates, absorption, karst and vegetation to be grown before approving concentrated animal businesses.

I have winter time concentrated cattle feeding operations close to where I live that should be monitored and stopped if violating environmental laws. Some days the smell is strong and who knows what the runoff does to Bridge Creek and on downstream.

While I believe in property rights, activities on my land should not affect neighbors and public lands

Please ban all concentrated animal factories in drainages for all public water systems and any waterbody my grandchildren may swim in. Thanks, Kirk Wasson

# **Comment from: Nancy Pierson**

P-327-1

the engineering standards adequate to a karst area are not rigorous enough to protect our national scenic river - the buffalo river - and the big creek drainage to it. Remediation methods for waste disposal are not financially and technologically feasible. Since it has been proven that c&h has polluted with excess nutrients, there is no reason to imagine that any other large-scale livetock/agricultural concern would be able to keep the waste and excess nutrients contained in such a way, in our geology, to keep from polluting further our natural resource so important to tourism and quality of life.

Permanent moratorium!

### **Comment from: Frank Meeks**

P-328-1

This is to voice my support for ADEQ's rule change that provides for a permanent moratorium of medium and large swine Confined Animal Feeding Operations (CAFO's) in the Buffalo National River Watershed. I have attended ADEQ meetings and watched the tensions develop between economic, political and ecological interests. Throw in a dollop of poor (or biased science) and you have the mess we, and the river, are in today. Here is the right choice to resolve the issues. You have E. Coli, phosphorus and nitrate levels that have been poorly managed in the past and now need a permanent fix. Lacking this change, we will be continually visiting pollution issues to the detriment of the river, public safety and Arkansas' image in being the Natural State.

## **Comment from: Claudia Carberry**

P-329-1

As a frequent floater and outdoor enthusiast, it was disturbing to learn that very high E. coli levels in Big Creek have been found regularly above the safe human contact level. DEQ has found that engineering standards as applied to this facility in a karst area were not adequate to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River. Also, possible remediation methods for waste disposal (sewage treatment, sludge removal, concrete holding tanks, or phosphorus removal from the watershed) have not proven to be technically or financially feasible. Therefore, a permanent moratorium is the best solution.

# Comment from: Elizabeth Bradford

#### P-330-1

I am in favor of an Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ) rule change that provides for a permanent moratorium of medium and large swine Confined Animal Feeding Operations in the Buffalo National River Watershed. DEQ has found that engineering standards as applied to this facility in a karst area were not adequate to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River. Also, possible remediation methods for waste disposal (sewage treatment, sludge removal, concrete holding tanks, or phosphorus removal from the watershed) have not proven to be technically or financially feasible. Therefore, a permanent moratorium is the best solution.

I hope that our engineers and our governmental leaders have learned from the mistakes made from the problems caused to the Buffalo and feeding creeks by inadequate waste disposal. Please do not let any of our waterways be damaged anytime in the future.

### **Comment from: Rebecca Evans**

P-331-1

Please enact a permanent moratorium of medium and large swine Confined Animal Feeding Operations (CAFO's) in the Buffalo National River Watershed. The Buffalo River is a treasure for all of us.

## Comment from: James E Wimberly

P-332-1

In addition to all the technical comments, I think it is time to seriously look at the broader implications. This is a national river, and it is promoted and used by national and even international consumers. People from everywhere come to Arkansas to "float the river". The river is a national use park, just like other national units, such as national parks and historic sites. I have met international people in Big Ben Tx and Colorado, talking about going to Arkansas to float the river. We are proud of this river, and wish to continue to keep it clean and useful for others to enjoy.

# Comment from: Joseph D. LaFace

P-333-1

Please consider the following

1. DEQ has found that engineering standards as applied to this facility in a karst area were not adequate to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River. Also, possible remediation methods for waste disposal (sewage treatment, sludge removal, concrete holding tanks, or phosphorus removal from the watershed) have not proven to be technically or financially feasible. Therefore, a permanent moratorium is the best solution.

Main point 2: There is strong evidence that the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by C&H with excess nutrients. If this were replicated on several other tributaries the Buffalo River, water quality, recreational opportunities, and aquatic life would surely suffer. Hence the need for a permanent moratorium. Respectfully yours, Joseph LaFace

# Comment from: Steve Heye

P-334-1

Supporting this action is a no brainer. Please pass the rule banning medium and large CAFOs in the Buffalo watershed. Thank you.

## Comment from: Glenn PEARSON

P-335-1

The Buffalo River is a National treasure that cannot be protected enough. We were embarrassed when taking family members on the river in late summer when the algae bloom was high. My mother in law swears she got a rash from it and won't come back.

Please ensure that the Hog Farms doesn't reopen!!

## **Comment from: Dorothy Bailey**

P-336-1

Thank you for the research on Big Creek in the Buffalo River watershed. I am FOR the permanent moratorium on no more CAFCO operations! Dot Bailey

## Comment from: Abel Tomlinson

P-337-1

There needs to be a moratorium on CAFO hog farms near the Buffalo River and beyond. Nothing is more vital to human life, and ultimately the fundamental basis of a sustainable economy, than clean water. We are cutting the throats of our kids and grandkids when we allow pollution of our waters. We know hog feces are getting into the river and polluting it. This must stop permanently. Nature needs to be viewed as sacred, and God created it for us to love and respect, not to disrespectfully destroy and pollute. Destroying God's artwork is a giant middle finger to the Divine Creator.

# Comment from: Cody Wyatt

P-338-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

## **Comment from: Francie Bolter**

P-339-1

I strongly support the Arkansas DEQ rule change that would create a permanent moratorium of medium and large swine CAFO's in the Buffalo National River Watershed. THE BCRET Final Report made clear that nitrate levels have increased and current methods of waste disposal are inadequate for preventing such increases. As the sole stewards of the Buffalo River Watershed, Arkansans must do the utmost to maintain the water quality of our nation's only national river, which is why a permanent moratorium is necessary.

#### **Comment from: Lucy Rhodes**

P-340-1

The natural beauty of our state is one of our primary calling cards. Please do all you can to protect our national River, the Buffalo. People come from around the world to fish, swim and play in the Buffalo and the White rivers. Extend the moratorium on pollution of this area. We can't afford to lose it!

#### **Comment from: Winifred Hirsch**

P-341-1

Please DO pass the new regulation concerning hog farming. This has been needed for a long time, to preserve the quality of the water in the Buffalo River, where I have canoed and camped and enjoyed the outdoors for years.

Thank you!

#### Comment from: Ken Duncan

P-342-1

As we begin the new year , let's look out into the future. It would appear to be both logical and reasonable to finish the task at hand and pass the Permanent Moratorium on the establishment of more businesses that may endanger the quality of our water resources. The facts have already been presented! Let's not allow this costly process to continue !! Close the loophole and protect our rivers and wildlife for generations to come !! Thank You, Ken Duncan

#### **Comment from: Jim Pfeifer**

P-343-1

I want to protect the Buffalo River. My family has loved it for generations. Obviously I am not smart enough to scientifically describe a solution so I am transcribing the following details provided by others. I am grateful that Gov Hutchinson has chosen to save the river and hope DEQ follows suit in this situation.

DEQ has found that engineering standards as applied to this facility in a karst area were not adequate to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River. Also, possible remediation methods for waste disposal (sewage treatment, sludge removal, concrete holding tanks, or phosphorus removal from the watershed) have not proven to be technically or financially feasible. Therefore, a permanent moratorium is the best solution.

There is strong evidence that the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by C&H with excess nutrients. If this were replicated on several other tributaries the Buffalo River, water quality, recreational opportunities, and aquatic life would surely suffer. Hence the need for a permanent moratorium.

#### **Comment from: Charles Mullins**

P-344-1

I am 100% in favor of a moratorium on hogs farms on the Buffalo River. There are many very good reasons for this moratorium but anything that will help preserve this jewel of Arkansas must be implemented. The BCRET report has many points in it which indicate a need for this. I list two below:

Main point 1. DEQ has found that engineering standards as applied to this facility in a karst area were not adequate to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River. Also, possible remediation methods for waste disposal (sewage treatment, sludge removal, concrete holding tanks, or phosphorus removal from the watershed) have not proven to be technically or financially feasible. Therefore, a permanent moratorium is the best solution.

Main point 2: There is strong evidence that the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by C&H with excess nutrients. If this were replicated on several other tributaries the Buffalo River, water quality, recreational opportunities, and aquatic life would surely suffer. Hence the need for a permanent moratorium.

### **Comment from: Eugene Milus**

#### P-345-1

I lived in Fayetteville, AR, from 1988 to 2016 when I retired to Colorado. During my time in Arkansas I visited the Buffalo River many times and floated everything below Ponca. I am dismayed and a bit angry about the ecological disaster that was allowed to evolve at C&H hog farm. It took a lot of time and money to stop further damage with the purchase of a "conservation easement", and there is still no feasible remediation plan for high nutrient and E. coli levels. I sincerely hope that the powers that be back in Arkansas will see fit to ban future CAFO's in the Buffalo drainage.

#### Gene Milus

# Comment from: Joe Neal

#### P-346-1

I am commenting specifically on a permanent moratorium of medium and large swine Confined Animal Feeding Operations (CAFO's) in the Buffalo National River Watershed. I am a wildlife biologist with an MS from University of Arkansas-Fayetteville and retired from a career with USDA Forest Service. I have been a regular visitor and have participated in bird studies in the Buffalo watershed for many years. I am satisfied that wastewater discharged from the existing (now closed) hog CAFO has damaged aquatic ecosystems associated with the Buffalo. I recognize this point is debated and not settled science. However, there is no room for error here. Common sense informs that in terms of water integrity, adding heavy unnatural loads of nutrients to this ecosystem pushes it in the wrong direction. Since the Buffalo cannot be replaced, and may or may not be repairable in an ecological sense, common sense requires caution. In this case, barring future agricultural operations whose wastewater discharges can push the aquatic ecosystems into unknown territory. There are bird species native to Arkansas involved, like Louisiana Waterthrush. Research conducted in the Buffalo watershed demonstrated deleterious impacts on them resulting from degrading of key habitats. The wise course is to first do no harm.

## **Comment from: Scott Yaich**

### P-347-1

I live near the Buffalo National River, and enjoy canoeing it frequently. It is a very special place and deserves special attention to maintain the quality of its water and surroundings. Recent years has seen increasing problems with algae blooms in the river related to unnaturally high levels of nutrients. In recognition of this growing problem, I strongly encourage and support the Governor's proposed permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. This will not only benefit the river and environment, but ultimately the long-term health of the region's economy which is so highly dependent upon tourism and nature-based recreation. Thank you for the opportunity to provide comment.

## Comment from: Klaus Kupfersberger

P-348-1

I am writing in support of a permanent

Moratorium. The rapid loss in water quality just a few years after C&H began operating made it clear that areas with porous limestone geology are extremely vulnerable to pollution via run off and trickle down of excess nutrients and E.coli.

The cost to our shared resources far exceeds the tradeoff of cheaper and less nutritious foods. This unhappy episode reveals how inadequate our environmental protections are and how vital it is that we learn a lesson from this expensive fiasco. Regulations need to be strengthened, not weakened, and we must have better data and better standards in place so that we can identify issues long before lasting damage is done. Arkansas is recognized nationally for our free flowing rivers. Why should we trade this valuable tourist draw off to corporations with a long history of cutting corners and forcing growers into virtual servitude?

As a taxpayer-supported agency, ADEQ should concentrate on protecting resources.

# Comment from: Klaus Kupfersberger

P-349-1

I am writing in support of a permanent

Moratorium. The rapid loss in water quality just a few years after C&H began operating made it clear that areas with porous limestone geology are extremely vulnerable to pollution via run off and trickle down of excess nutrients and E.coli.

The cost to our shared resources far exceeds the tradeoff of cheaper and less nutritious foods. This unhappy episode reveals how inadequate our environmental protections are and how vital it is that we learn a lesson from this expensive fiasco. Regulations need to be strengthened, not weakened, and we must have better data and better standards in

place so that we can identify issues long before lasting damage is done. Arkansas is recognized nationally for our free flowing rivers. Why should we trade this valuable tourist draw off to corporations with a long history of cutting corners and forcing growers into virtual servitude?

As a taxpayer-supported agency, ADEQ should concentrate on protecting resources.

## Comment from: Cindy Majoros

P-350-1

Any future farms of this source really needs to be reviewed and locations considered before making a crucial decision as they didn't on this one.

### Comment from: James Krieger

P-351-1

Comments on Regulation 5 & 6:

I am a member of The National Audubon Society, The North Central Arkansas Master Naturalists and The Buffalo National River Partners and strongly support doing whatever is necessary to protect the water quality in the Buffalo River, including establishing a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed. Among others, one of the reasons for protecting this resource is that it brings millions of visitor dollars each year to the surrounding economies.

## **Comment from: Kelsey Mayans**

P-352-1 "I am a member of North Arkansas

Fly Fishers and want to protect the water quality in the

Buffalo River. Please Support the Permanent Moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed"

# Comment from: Adam Schaffer

P-353-1

Make the large CAFO ban in the Buffalo watershed permanent!

# Comment from: Michelle Trost

P-354-1

My family and I frequent the Buffalo River kayaking and hiking and felt this beautiful land and watershed needed to be protected. The C and H Hog Fram were owned and operated by an International Company from Brazil, who clearly had no interest in the preservation and protection of the Buffalo Nation River Park. This National Forest needs to be preserved for the next generation to appreciate the wildlife, flora, crystal clear rivers and amazing hiking trails. I and my Naturalist Friends are supportive in the permanent closure of the C and H Hog Farm.

### Comment from: Jack Land

P-355-1

Please make this moritorium permanent and allow no more hog farms in the Buffalo River watershed

We can not afford to ruin this national treasure

## Comment from: Phillip Taylor

P-356-1

Engineering standards were not sufficient to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River. All the remediation methods for waste disposal have not proven to be technically or financially feasible. Therefore, a permanent moratorium is the best solution.

## **Comment from: Crystal Rust**

P-357-1

I support a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. Our national treasures should be treated as such. Thanks.

## Comment from: Sara Wittenberg

P-358-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# **Comment from: Dwan Garrison**

P-359-1

I am a member and former president of the Arkansas Master Naturalists. I strongly support the protection of the Buffalo National River including the establishment of a moratorium on CAFO's in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### **Comment from: Paul McCune**

P-360-1

My wife and I support a moratorium on CAFO operations in the Buffalo River Watershed. The National River is a precious resource and deserves permanent protection. Research has proven beyond a doubt that the C and H facility was an expensive miscalculation, and it surely doesn't need to be repeated.

### Comment from: Jess VanderStek

P-361-1

I am thankful the c&h hog farm has been closed and our waterways have a chance of remaining clean. Please keep a permanent moratorium on these types of farms so Arkansas can keep our environment clean for all and future generations. Thanks

## Comment from: joan meeks

P-362-1

I am strongly in favor of ADEQ's proposed rule change providing for a permanent moratorium of significant, i.e. commercial, Confined Animal Feeding Operations in the Buffalo National River Watershed. It's hard to understand how we got to this point for a predicament that could not have even passed a simple smell test - pun intended. The Buffalo is a national treasure for Arkansas and the nation, along with being a source of tourist revenue, and a symbol for ecological accountability. How could reasonable people ignore a situation of such scope for this long, a national river polluted with E. Coli, nitrates, phosphorus over- load, and sludge? I hesitate to introduce my grandchildren to this type of pollution. So, let's fix it and move on. I want your cooperation to make our actions applauded by all of our grandchildren and their children.

## **Comment from: Heather Smith**

P-363-1

DEQ has found that engineering standards as applied to this facility in a karst area were not adequate to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River. Also, possible remediation methods for waste disposal (sewage treatment, sludge removal, concrete holding tanks, or phosphorus removal from the watershed) have not proven to be technically or financially feasible. Therefore, a permanent moratorium is the best solution.

There is strong evidence that the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by C&H with excess nutrients. If this were replicated on several other tributaries the Buffalo River, water quality, recreational opportunities, and aquatic life would surely suffer.

# Comment from: Frits Druff

P-364-1

I'm a member of Audubon and strongly support doing whatever is necessary to protect the water quality in the Buffalo River, including establishing a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: Lora Dail

P-365-1

Please make sure this never happens again. The Buffalo is so important to our area, we must strive to keep it healthy and beautiful.

No one won in this situation, and the risk was huge.

Please dont let a CAFO happen in the Buffalo watershed again.

# Comment from: Kirk Rhoads

P-366-1

ALL hog farms in the Buffalo River Basin must be closed.

# Comment from: Robert Duncan

P-367-1

ADEQ - I appreciate the efforts to close the pollution generating HOG farm. The State of Arkansas should never be in that predicament again! Tax Payers don't deserve footing the enormous bill that was paid to the Owners. Time is NOW to ensure it is a one time occurrence. Fix it permanently. Add my name to the super majority of individuals and organization that this has impacted. Looking forward to see ADEQ do the right thing soon.

# Comment from: Dana Steward

P-368-1

I support the moratorium on medium and large CAFOs on the Buffalo River watershed.

# Comment from: Bill Steward

P-369-1

The moratorium on large and medium hog farms in the Buffalo River watershed will hopefully prevent the repeat of the mistakes made in allowing the Mt. Judea farm. I absolutely support the moratorium.

# **Comment from: Francis Millett**

P-370-1

I have been a resident of Arkansas since 1972, and have canoed and hiked on the Buffalo National River every year since it became the first National River in 1972 by an act of congress. Our children were born and raised in Arkansas, and have spent a great deal of time on the river both with us and as part of scouting and youth church activities. The Buffalo National River is a national treasure, and draws over 1 million visitors a year from all over the world, and contributes over \$40 million a year to the state's economy.

I strongly support the Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ) rule change that provides for a permanent moratorium of medium and large swine Confined Animal Feeding Operations (CAFO's) in the Buffalo National River Watershed.

DEQ has found that engineering standards as applied to C&H CAFO near Big Creek in a karst area were not adequate to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River. Also, possible remediation methods for waste disposal (sewage treatment, sludge removal, concrete holding tanks, or phosphorus removal from the watershed) have not proven to be technically or financially feasible. Therefore, a permanent moratorium is the best solution.

There is strong evidence that the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by C&H with excess nutrients. If this were replicated on several other tributaries the Buffalo River, water quality, recreational opportunities, and aquatic life would surely suffer. Hence the need for a permanent moratorium.

Sincerely, Francis Millett

#### **Comment from: Cornelia Beck**

P-371-1

I am very concerned that the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by C&H with excess nutrients. If this were replicated on several other tributaries the Buffalo River, water quality, recreational opportunities, and aquatic life would surely suffer. Therefore, I am in favor of a permanent moratorium.

#### **Comment from: Kathleen Beattie**

P-372-1

I am in favor of a permanent moratorium on medium and large CAFOs in the Buffalo National River Watershed We need to protect animal life and recreation.

#### **Comment from: William Beattie**

P-373-1

Sirs:

I am writing in regard to the moratorium on allowing large scale swine operations within the Buffalo National River Watershed. Frankly, I am stunned that any sane environmental professional would consider for a moment lifting this ban. Events over the last several years have demonstrated that the geologic structure is unsuitable for containing swine waste either from surface or ground water supplies. I shouldn't have to point out to ADEQ that the area through which the Buffalo flows is fractured allowing contaminants to leach into the water table and into the tributaries of the Buffalo. Why any permit for this type of operation was approved in the first place boggles the mind.

Environmental issues aside, we the taxpayers in this wonderful, but relatively poor state. have just recently spent millions of dollars to close the existing facility. Why on earth would ending the moratorium be on any agenda?

I am not opposed to large scale swine operations, but I am strongly opposed to the issuing of permits where surface and ground water supplies could potentially be compromised. In short, I encourage ADEQ to institute a permanent moratorium on large scale operations in the Buffalo River watershed. PJAU

Sincerely

William C. Beattie BS(NatRes), MS(NatRes)

## **Comment from: Diane Newcomb**

P-374-1

Large scale hog growing CAFO is not sustainable, disgusting.if they can't process that waste like cities do then there should be no allowance of all that poo.

## **Comment from: Steve Davis**

P-375-1

A hog farm in the watershed of the only National River in the U.S. should never have happened. It must never happen again.

# **Comment from: Amy Strickland**

P-376-1

As someone who has taken many trips to Arkansas over the last 20 years, including to our nation's beloved Buffalo National River, just to enjoy the state's natural beauty and its people, I urge you to enact a permanent moratorium on medium and large concentrated animal feeding operations within the Buffalo River Watershed. This river is a national treasure, a regional economic engine, home to thousands of species, and our legacy for future generations, please take the necessary steps to protect it. Thank you!

# **Comment from: Chris Hankins**

P-377-1

I'm commenting in support of a permanent moratorium for large-scale industrial agricultural facilities in the Buffalo River Watershed.

#### **Comment from: Doug Holmes**

#### P-378-1

The studies have shown that the river is already being seriously polluted. The proposed solutions are clearly insufficient and unworkable, so a permanent moratorium is the only meaningful solution. Please protect the Buffalo!

### Doug Holmes

### Comment from: Bert Kell

P-379-1

Dear Sir or madam,

First, a huge thank you for removing the hog farm. The Buffalo is one of, if not the greatest asset our state has. We need to do all we can to protect this wonderful treasure that Dr. Neil Compton and the Ozark Society fought so hard to become a national treasure. I am a native Arkansan, but grew up in the Delta. It seems for most of my life I've heard about how Arkansas has so many problems with poverty, education, obesity etc.

When I relocated to NW AR25 years ago I discovered the Buffalo. Wow! Every time I'm there I'm in awe and I try to introduce as many as possible to it.

So again, thank you for removing the hog farm and thank you in advance for keeping the Buffalo in pristine condition.

Sincerely, Bert Kell

# **Comment from: Corey Pettett**

P-380-1

I want to express my opinion that I support the rule changes that create a permanent moratorium on large-scale hog farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. The Buffalo National River is a treasure and and the state should treat it as such so that generations into the future can enjoy the Buffalo National River. Allowing hog farms in the watershed of the Buffalo National River treats the River like a disposal site for the hog farms. Please support the Buffalo National River moratorium rule on large-scale farms in the Buffalo National River water shed.

# Comment from: Shaylee Wallace

P-381-1

Agriculture has been a long standing and important factor to environmental sustainability. Science has shown time and time again that agriculture is not causing harm to our natural forests and rivers. Fear mongering from the opposition should not be tolerated, they are driven by their own agenda. This is dissolves any rights that farmers have and gives dangerous power to anti-agriculturalists to fuel their desire to end all animal agriculture (which plays a vital role in maintaining a sound, balanced environment). We aim to raise safe sustainable food, yet fear mongers who have no

knowledge or authority on the subject are pushing us around. We cannot stand for it any longer!

## **Comment from: Brian Pruitt**

P-382-1

I will definitely not stand for this action because the national park service is putting raw untreated human waste in the water every flood with the vault toilets in the flood plan

## Comment from: Karen Walls

P-383-1

Please ensure that there will never be a CAFO on any part of the Buffalo watershed. To allow this was an incredibly risky enterprise. With further scientific evidence and research it is obvious it was (in my opinion) an almost criminal action to grant a license in the first place.

# Comment from: Tatum Tarvin

P-384-1

Please be carful as you consider this regulation, Arkansas farmers deserve the respect of our state. They work tireless to feed the people of the great states of America. Federal law already requires so much of our farmers, and they respect the reasons for rules and regulations, however I do not believe there is enough unbiased proof to make this ruling on regulations 5 & 6! Thank you for you time.

## **Comment from: Michael Brotherton**

P-385-1

NO to your ridiculous "Ban". I have no reason to believe ADEQ, The Buffalo River Watershed Alliance (BRWA), or the State of Arkansas have the best intentions for the Buffalo National River or especially Newton/Searcy counties with this action. Certain people want to keep the area "poor" and promote "tourism" in ways that serve only their own business interests. C&H Farms demonstrated the best intentions and operated in a manner exceeding the requirements set by law, and were harassed and punished for it. Meanwhile the REAL cause of damage to the river (overcrowding by humans) is buried under falsified misleading propaganda & biased pseudo-science to the extent that it ought to be considered criminal. There is not a shred of decency or moral character at ADEQ & BRWA and THEY should be held accountable for promoting the degradation of the Buffalo National River in the interest of Greed.

# **Comment from: Sharon Boatright**

P-386-1

I am in favor of permanently excluding hog factories from the Buffalo River watershed.

# Comment from: Duane Woltjen

P-387-1

I am writing in full support of permanent prohibition (moratorium suggests any prohibition is temporary--it better not be temporary) of CAFOs such as C&H anywhere in the Buffalo River watershed. Please see my previous comments of 12-14-19.

By now even BCRET is able to visually realize that the holding lagoons of C&H are leaking even though BCRET was able to avoid finding or acknowledging an abundance of evidence as Big Creek and the Buffalo were suffering the effects. You might take a look at the rainfall since the last washout of the C&H barn, determine the amount of precipitation increase in the stage of the lagoons during this idle period, subtract estimated evaporation--and ponder why the lagoons are lower stage than you expected.

However, according to BCRET, the lagoons are not leaking. They steadfastly refused to look for leaks where the obviously are---UNDER THE LAGOONS, NOT ALONG SIDE THEM!

Presumably the comment period is extended to January 22, 2020 to accommodate the preparation of BCRET Final Report. The version of that report presently available to the public is so full of incorrect determinations it must not be allowed to stand as representing the "facts" of the C&H fiasco. ADEQ owes the public and future generations of Arkansas an accurate report of facts and accurate interpretation of them, lest the tragedy of C&H be repeated in decades to come because someone accepts that there is no meaningful effect from this operation.

I question is why ADEQ takes the word of the incompetent "professionals (??!!!)" of BCRET? ADEQ is responsible for the truth, completeness, and accuracy of any final report in this matter.

Duane Woltjen

## Comment from: Lee Cowan

P-388-1

Medium and large animal farms have not been proven safe in the short or long term without extremely expensive waste management systems are in place and monitored by a third party twice a month. Please; keep our Buffalo River and its watersheds safe. Throughout time, please have them locate elsewhere. Thank you.

## Comment from: Zane Colvin

P-389-1

As a resident of Arkansas, student at the University of Arkansas, and countless-times visitor to the Buffalo National River, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C&H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 &6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C &H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

More needs to be done to protect the Buffalo River, one of our most important and stunningly beautiful natural landscapes, but this is a great and very important step in the right direction.

Thank you, Zane Colvin

#### Comment from: Darla Wroblski

P-390-1

"Since 2013, raw swine sewage has been stored in two waste ponds, with 2.5 million gallons of it spread each year onto fields in the Buffalo National River watershed. Fields have received far more nutrients than the vegetation could possibly use, and the soil has become heavily saturated with stored phosphorous. After the CAFO is closed and the spraying stops, this "legacy phosphorous" will continue to leach into the underlying karst. It contaminates groundwater and comes back to the surface in seeps and springs that feed Big Creek and the Buffalo River. Too much phosphorous causes algae blooms. The dye trace study cited in the BCRET Final Report shows how far and how quickly water can travel underground. Cleaning up what is left behind will take many years and require persistence and monitoring. In a 2013 article co-authored by the principle investigator of BCRET, Andrew Sharpley the seriousness of legacy phosphorous is stated: "... we face unprecedented challenges in meeting water quality targets, given that P legacies from past land management may continue to impair future water quality, over time scales of decades, and perhaps longer." ".....How could this ever have happened?!!! Ever have been allowed to happen!.....NEVER AGAIN!!

## **Comment from: Nathan Pennington**

P-391-1

This regulation would set a DANGEROUS standard. If farms cannot be in a watershed then there will not be any farms. We must work together to educate people about the truth and not knee jerk regulate farms away. Farms can operate in a responsible manner. C & H never caused any issue yet they were ran off. This is a very bad idea.

## Comment from: Bonnie Jaeckle

P-392-1

Main point 1. DEQ has found that engineering standards as applied to this facility in a karst area were not adequate to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River. Also, possible remediation methods for waste disposal (sewage treatment, sludge removal, concrete holding tanks, or phosphorus removal from the watershed) have not proven to be technically or financially feasible. Therefore, a permanent moratorium is the best solution.

Main point 2: There is strong evidence that the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by C&H with excess nutrients. If this were replicated on several other tributaries the Buffalo River, water quality, recreational opportunities, and aquatic life would surely suffer. Hence the need for a permanent moratorium.

If you want to state more specific reasons based on the new BCRET study, here is a more detailed list of evidence for the moratorium:

Ever rising nitrate levels in the "house" well and ephemeral stream adjacent to the waste lagoons.

Nitrate levels in Big Creek more than double as it passes the farm.

Groundwater nitrate levels below the farm are elevated by as much as 4 times as ground water levels above the farm.

The phosphorus load (mass transport off the land) downstream is double the upstream load.

Field phosphorus levels in C&H have increased significantly, which is to be expected when field application rates greatly exceed agronomic needs.

Very high E. coli levels in Big Creek, regularly above the safe human contact level.

## Comment from: Carol Percifull

P-393-1

I strongly support a permanent moratorium of medium and large swine Confined Animal Feeding Operations (CAFO's) in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Our karst environment cannot support the large amounts of waste produced by such an operation.

# **Comment from: Michael Berry**

P-394-1

A permanent moratorium is needed.

## Comment from: Emma Hickey

P-395-1

Well, of course we should NEVER allow another CAFO near any body of water!!!! This has never been a battle about folks operating a CAFO! Simply, keep all of that sludge far away from any areas that could impact any ground water! Please let us stop this in the future! I totally support a moratorium!

#### **Comment from: Johnny Furness**

#### P-396-1

I very much support the Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality rule change to permanently probite the operation of large and medium Hog farms in the Buffalo River Watershed. I feel there is convincing evidence in the Final Big Creek Research and Extension Team report that Hog Farms are major contributors to pollution and contamination to Arkansas Rivers and Natural Resources. I support the BCRET's conclusion that the waste disposal methods have not proven to be technically or financially feasible and the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by the Hog Farm waist which contains excessive nutrients. The research is conclusive. the nitrate levels have doubled as it passes the farm, the phosphorus load has doubled the upstream load and the the E. Coli levels are unsafe for human contact. It is time to protect our National River and all rivers from future pollution caused by Hog Farms.

#### **Comment from: Carolyn Wilkins**

P-397-1

I have seen the results of hog litter on land, it kills the trees, grass, and everything green. We don't want that to happen near or in the Buffalo river.

#### **Comment from: Grant Scarsdale**

P-398-1

The proposed Regulations No. 5 and No. 6 rulemaking changes for the Buffalo River watershed moratorium should encompass ALL medium and large animal feeding operations. The language of the proposed moratorium only applies to swine; however, medium and large poultry and dairy animal feeding operations pose an equivalent threat to our first national river.

#### Comment from: JOANN SARAYDARIAN

#### P-399-1

I'm an Arkansas Master Naturalist and am very aware of the dangers animal waste has on our environment. The proposed moratorium under Regulation No. 6 will make it impossible to keep the Buffalo River, our National Treasure, clean! Listen to the scientific facts. What will it take to make it clear that many species depend on the purity of this river. It is a crime against the entire planet. Naturalists and tourists around the globe are attracted to our state to experience the beauty of this river. Our state is cutting off its own arm. Once it is polluted, the damage can not be reversed!

#### **Comment from: Nancy Deisch**

P-400-1

To Whom it May Concern:

The loopholes in Regulations 5 and 6 need to be closed to make sure that medium and large-scale animal (swine, poultry, and livestock) feeding operations are covered in the moratorium on the Buffalo River watershed. If all the Arkansas watersheds were covered, wouldn't that be something? Arkansas--a cutting-edge example of pollutants control?

It is beyond belief that this could STILL be a matter of public concern after all this time. We need to get it right before too much damage is done. Please fix the regulations--once and for all, for the good of everyone in the state! Sincerely,

Nancy Deisch

# **Comment from: Ginny Masullo**

P-401-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: Ray Quick

P-402-1 To Whom This May Concern:

The citizens of the State of Arkansas have spoken with respect to not allowing the C&H concentrated animal feeding operation (CAFO) to continue operating in the watershed of the Buffalo National River. ADEQ does not want to make another "mistake" by permitting any animal CAFO in the watershed of the Buffalo National River.

Therefore, the proposed Regulations No. 5 and No. 6 rulemaking changes for the Buffalo River watershed moratorium should encompass ALL medium and large animal feeding operations. The language of the proposed moratorium only applies to swine; however, medium and large poultry and dairy animal feeding operations pose an equivalent threat to our first national river. In particular, given the fact that the the geology is primarily limestone/karst.

# Comment from: Ammen Jordan

#### P-403-1

The proposed Regulations No. 5 and No. 6 rulemaking changes for the Buffalo River watershed moratorium should encompass ALL medium and large animal feeding operations. The language of the proposed moratorium only applies to swine; however, medium and large poultry and dairy animal feeding operations pose an equivalent threat to our first national river.

## Comment from: Ann Bendy

P-404-1

I kindly ask that the permanent moratorium for swine operations in the watershed area be voted against. As long as farms are following proper procedures and regulations there should be no reason for this moratorium. Find a better way to do it, don't just ban it all together. The moratorium would also have an economic impact by causing a loss of products, loss of jobs, and loss of economic diversity, which would have a negative impact on the area. Vote no to the moratorium on swine operations in the watershed area.

## **Comment from: Mark Smith**

P-405-1

I support the changes proposed by ADEQ to Rule 5 and Rule 6 that would institute a permanent moratorium on issuance of permits for CAFOs in the Buffalo National River watershed for the following reasons:

1) Soils in the area are too thin to entrain the large quantities of animal wastes associated with these facilities.

2) The underlying Karst provides a transport path for these wastes to the Buffalo National River and/or feeder streams, resulting in pollution of these waterbodies.

3) Instituting the moratorium will prevent the need to use taxpayer funds in the future to correct the condition should a permit be issued in the future.

4) The Buffalo National River, as one of the few remaining free-flowing streams in Arkansas and the U.S. is a much too important resource to risk pollution in the future.

# Comment from: Masen McCutcheon

P-406-1

I OPPOSE any moratorium of any type for the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: Cheryl McCutcheon

P-407-1

I OPPOSE any moratorium of any type for the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: Andy McCutcheon

P-408-1

I OPPOSE any moratorium of any type for the Buffalo River Watershed.

# **Comment from: Pat Robinette**

P-409-1

The proposed Regulations No. 5 and No. 6 rulemaking changes for the Buffalo River watershed moratorium should encompass ALL medium and large animal feeding operations.

## Comment from: Zach Turner

P-410-1

Keep Arkansas the Natural state. Pleas don't operatively choose myopic protections that would contaminate our natural resources and wildlife for short term gains.

## Comment from: Laurie Fisher

P-411-1

I am a long time user and supporter of the beautiful Buffalo Natl River. Please do not allow hog farms to contaminate it.

We noticed much more green algae growth the last years. Thank you.

# **Comment from: Cindy Jetton**

P-412-1

CAFO Animal waste will seep through the karst and run off into streams and creeks that hikers depend on for water sources, especially those who are in multi day trips. Filters and boiling will not remove all contaminates and enough water cannot be carried on multi day back country trips. This area relies on tourism dollars spent in concessionaires, restaurants and supply stores. One person becoming ill or perhaps dying while on trail would sway other hikers to avoid the area with tax dollars being lost which would funnel down to loss of jobs.

This permanent moratorium needs to be put i. Place to protect and preserve the area for present and future generations.

Thank you for the opportunity to give comments. Cindy

# **Comment from: Cathy Shingledecker**

P-413-1

Protect our natural resources and keep Arkansas the "Natural State!

# Comment from: Faith Shah

P-414-1

I am against all CAFOs and believe we need to support small family FARMS not factories. Our water resources must not be taken for granted. There is not an endless supply.

The state makes more in tourism tax dollars than CAFOs.

How is this a hard decision to make? People do not pay to see or smell UGLY

Neighbors living within the stench should not have to suffer. CAFOs and large Chicken houses are now a constant source of noise and light pollution. I know this personally. My once quiet and dark nights are invaded by the hum of fans and the glow of lights. Arkansas can lead the way towards intelligent use of land/water/scenic resources and that does NOT include more CAFOs

## Comment from: Kai Coggin

#### P-415-1

Please protect our watershed and halt all medium and large feeding operations, including poultry and dairy. This river is a national treasure and a once thriving habitat for natural species. The tourism potential to this river is one of Arkansas' underutilized financial state-benefiting resources. Animal feces and bacteria SHOULD NOT be flowing into this beautiful wonder of the world. Live up to your mission and protect the quality of the environment which you have been designated to protect!

The proposed Regulations No. 5 and No. 6 rulemaking changes for the Buffalo River watershed moratorium should encompass ALL medium and large animal feeding operations. The language of the proposed moratorium only applies to swine; however, medium and large poultry and dairy animal feeding operations pose an equivalent threat to our first national river.

## **Comment from: Michael Frank Shah**

P-416-1

Dear God, please don't let our politicians create another CAFO mistake that will threaten our water table, rivers and streams.

That Hog Farm Fiasco cost us almost 7 million dollars. Do we not know that we have only this place, this state and this Planet to protect for our children and grandchildren.

WHAT ARE THE COST AND BENEFIT FACTORS, including environmental, of this proposal.

At your wisest, stop, think, research options before you proceed. There is no hurry when you consider the consequences of a mistake.

## Comment from: Donna Peterson

P-417-1

I am registering my support for a permanent moratorium of medium and large CAFOS in the Buffalo River Watershed.

Arkansas should be proud of having a National Wonder in our state and should be concerned in the preservation of the water and land from contaminants caused by CAFOS. Take to heart the seriousness of the detrimental effects of CAFOS. An individual does not have to be a scientist to see and understand the damage done to the land and water by CAFOS in and around our treasured Buffalo River Watershed. There have been scientific studies made that prove these facts. Vote for a permanent moratorium.

Comment from: Lanie Carlson

#### P-418-1

Please protect our watershed and halt all medium and large feeding operations, including poultry and dairy. This river is a national treasure and a once thriving habitat for natural species. The tourism potential to this river is one of Arkansas' underutilized financial state-benefiting resources. Animal feces and bacteria SHOULD NOT be flowing into this beautiful wonder of the world. Live up to your mission and protect the quality of the environment which you have been designated to protect! The proposed Regulations No. 5 and No. 6 rulemaking changes for the Buffalo River watershed moratorium should encompass ALL medium and large animal feeding operations. The language of the proposed moratorium only applies to swine; however, medium and large poultry and dairy animal feeding operations pose an equivalent threat to our first national river.

## **Comment from: McKendra Adams**

#### P-419-1

Amend proposed Regs. 5 & 6 to include ALL medium and large animal feeding operations. The proposed Regulations No. 5 and No. 6 rulemaking changes for the Buffalo River watershed moratorium should encompass ALL medium and large animal feeding operations. The language of the proposed moratorium only applies to swine; however, medium and large poultry and dairy animal feeding operations pose an equivalent threat to our first national river.

## **Comment from: Mary Heller**

#### P-420-1

I am writing to let you know that our family is in favor of an Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ) rule change that provides for a permanent moratorium of medium and large swine Confined Animal Feeding Operations (CAFO's) in the Buffalo National River Watershed. We understand that possible remediation methods for waste disposal (sewage treatment, sludge removal, concrete holding tanks, or phosphorus removal from the watershed) have not proven to be technically or financially feasible. Therefore, a permanent moratorium is the best solution. In addition, the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by and C and H with excess chemicals

# Comment from: Melissa Klipp

## P-421-1

We as land owners and homesteaders should have the right to raise what ever animals that we need to feed our families. We worked hard for our land and we should have the opportunity to freely have our land support our families. Our children also raise pigs for 4h and compete in county fairs. Our rights should not so easily be taken away.

#### **Comment from: Randy McCutcheon**

#### P-422-1

As a life long resident of Searcy County Arkansas and resident of the Richland Vally just a few miles from the Woolum crossing of the Buffalo river. I am against these regulations which will not solve the problems with the river. I don't believe the Government should have this much power over a free people. The US constitution does not grant such powers to the government. This just erodes the rights of the people.

Randy McCutcheon

### **Comment from: Jon Bonney**

P-423-1

I am a member of Friends of the North Fork and White Rivers and strongly support doing whatever is necessary to protect the water quality in the Buffalo River, including establishing a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed," will be very helpful.

#### **Comment from: Thomas Emerick**

P-424-1

Please disallow the siting of any COFO in the Buffalo River Watershed. As a National Heritage River it is important to protect the natural beauty of the Buffalo River and its water quality for all to enjoy. Compromising the water quality from this type of "farming" will decrease the recreational value for down stream users and negatively affect property values as well.

## **Comment from: Dixie Keyes**

#### P-425-1

The proposed Regulations No. 5 and No. 6 rulemaking changes for the Buffalo River watershed moratorium should encompass ALL medium and large animal feeding operations. The language of the proposed moratorium only applies to swine; however, medium and large poultry and dairy animal feeding operations pose an equivalent threat to our first national river.

#### **Comment from: Lisa Kessler**

#### P-426-1

I support the Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ) rule change that provides for a permanent moratorium of medium and large swine Confined Animal Feeding Operations (CAFO's) in the Buffalo National River Watershed. I have visited the Buffalo River since the 1970's and want it to continue to be a clean and free flowing landmark in Arkansas for future generations to enjoy.

## **Comment from: Sarah Cumnock**

P-427-1

Protect our natural world. Save these waterways!

### **Comment from: Ryan Crow**

P-428-1

I don't agree with any of this. Quit over reaching.

### **Comment from: Louise Mann**

P-429-1

I apologize if I sent this already but I want to be sure I weighed in. We need a permanent ban on all CAFOS. Thank you. Louise Mann

## Comment from: John Shultz

P-430-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

### Comment from: Ashley Miner

P-431-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

## Comment from: Joe Rath

P-432-1

I care about permanent protection of the Buffalo National River through approval of a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine feeding operations in its watershed. This national treasure should be protected through a permanent prohibition of such operations.

## Comment from: Mike OConnell

P-433-1

Dear ADEQ,

Please enact permanent protection for the Buffalo River it is a national treasure. My family and friends frequently travel to Arkansas to paddle the Buffalo and spend money supporting the local tourism economy. More importantly we are able to experience the remarkable beauty and pristine waters of the Buffalo and surrounding natural areas.

Generations to come will look back with pride on the work you are doing to preserve and protect this jewel that all in Arkansas are blessed to have in your wonderful state. Sincerely

Mike O'Connell

## **Comment from: Thomas Keel**

P-434-1

I support a complete and permanent moritiruim on any Concentrated Animal Feeding Operations in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: Brian Thompson

P-435-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed. If only one swine concentrated feeding operation can, after only 5 years of operation, contribute to declining water quality in the Buffalo River watershed what would more do? A permanent moratorium protects one of Arkansas' greatest natural resources for future generations.

# **Comment from: Cliff Barnes**

P-436-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed. The Buffalo is a vital part of Arkansas' tourism industry and a national treasure. Please take this opportunity to protect it.

# Comment from: Carol Ann Lasater

P-437-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on CAFO's in the watershed of the Buffalo River or Little Burffalo River.

Help us protect our national treasure. Thank you.

# Comment from: Bill farrell

P-438-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed. We really won't know for years the extent the pig farm harmed the river.

B.F.

# Comment from: Karen Bartle

P-439-1

I have been until recently a resident of Newton County Arkansas. It is likely that I shall return now that my home will no longer bear the stench of hog manure. One of the primary reasons I left was because the air was permeated with the smell of hog manure that was being spread next door. The farm itself was less than two miles from me as the crow flies. My take on whether or not to make the moratorium permanent is much like deciding if you want you child to be cured of a disease or just made a little better for just a little while. Or do you want your house fire put all the way out? Or perhaps just spraying some water on one corner? Let's save the Buffalo forever, not just until the next big CAFCO decides that the Buffalo would make an ideal cesspool!

### **Comment from: Charles Phillips**

#### P-440-1

C&H should not had received a permit to raise large numbers of swine in the Buffalo National River watershed. Thankfully, thousands of Arkansas and hundreds of Americans intervened and voiced their opposition to this ill conceived idea. The Buffalo National River is a National Park and belongs to all Americans. CAFO's have no purpose anywhere because they have a long history of fouling water, air, and soil. In the future, stop permitting behemoth livestock impoundments.

Thanks for allowing the public to respond to the closing of this public nuisance.

#### **Comment from: Bennie Scott**

P-441-1

I am in favor of establishing a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine, chicken, and cattle CAFOs in the Buffalo and other Arkansas watersheds.

#### Comment from: Teri Patrick

P-442-1

Please vote for a permanent moratorium on all concentrated animal feeding operations anywhere near the Buffalo River watershed. The Buffalo River a gem all Arkansans can be proud of. We saw how destructive just one CAFO can be. Please approve a permanent stop to CAFOs now. Thank you.

#### **Comment from: Jerry Cagle**

P-443-1

If only one swine concentrated feeding operation can, after only 5 years of operation, contribute to declining water quality in the Buffalo River watershed what would many or several do? Please support a moratorium of medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

#### **Comment from: Steve Hesse**

P-444-1

I fully support the proposed Regulation 5 & 6

#### **Comment from: Claiborne Morton**

P-445-1

Please pass legislation to ensure no CAFO operations ever exist in the Buffalo River watershed. We must keep this region in pristine condition for our state, the nation, and the world! America's first National River must be kept free and clean!

#### Comment from: Barry Haas

P-446-1

I am strongly in favor of establishing a permanent moratorium on all medium and large swine CAFOs (Confined Animal Feeding Operation) in the Buffalo River watershed. At a minimum the Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality (ADEQ) should have learned a valuable lesson from the C & H Hog Farm debacle- an industrial scale animal facility in the nation's first national river watershed on karst terrain is totally incompatible and must never be repeated.

It has cost more than \$6 million in taxpayer and private funds just to buy out and undo the damage done when C & H was granted a permit to operate. How many hours and taxpayer dollars has ADEQ wasted during the C & H fiasco? And that doesn't even include huge legal expenses the past seven years paid by C & H and its opponents, or the value of time invested by thousands of Arkansans to ensure such a mistake never happens again.

Arkansas has a national treasure in the Buffalo River. We have seen first hand how one CAFO can negatively impact water quality in the Buffalo River, and that may be the case for many years to come no matter what mitigation steps are undertaken. The underground landscape near C & H will not heal overnight. Tourists don't come from all across the country to float the Buffalo in hopes of witnessing hog waste first hand.

We can't ignore the karst environment in this part of the state that keeps disposal of animal waste products from being economically feasible unless we allow the public environment to be used as a free dumping ground. That's unacceptable.

Given the C & H nightmare, do the right thing and approve a permanent ban on medium and large scale swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. Do it for your children. Do it for your grandchildren. Do it for all Arkansans, and for folks from other states who come to experience the treasure that is the Buffalo River.

#### **Comment from: Roger Reep**

#### P-447-1

I strongly support protection of the water quality of the Buffalo River, and thus a moratorium on hog farm operations that have been demonstrated to adversely affect water quality. Let's protect not only the rivers and streams but also the health of our children and grandchildren so they can enjoy the Buffalo River wilderness experience!

#### **Comment from: Gene Dunaway**

P-448-1

I am not sure whether I've filed a comment yet.

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed."

## **Comment from: Laura Timby**

#### P-449-1

I submit to ADEQ that a permanent moratorium be put in place on any medium to large Swine Confined Animal Feeding Operations(CAFO) proposed within the Buffalo River watershed. Because of the Karst topography of this region any such operation poses an extreme risk to, and likelihood of,contamination of the groundwater. Furthermore, it is my opinion that any CAFO type operation in the watershed of the Buffalo National River poses an increased risk of contamination of the Buffalo National River, negatively impacting the water quality, health of visitors and the local economy and tourism industry and,therefore,is not an acceptable land use/farming practice. Respectfully, Laura Timby

### **Comment from: Trudi Rust**

P-450-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. This current one has cost us water quality and tax payer dollars just to return it to its natural state.

#### **Comment from: Nancy Miner**

P-451-1

With the closing of C&H Hog farm and it's extremely negative impact on the Buffalo National River's watershed, I wish to express my concern that there should be a permanent moratorium on ALL CAFOs in the watershed. Our water quality is of utmost importance for our health as well as the tourist industry that drives this area.. PLEASE APPROVE A PERMANENT MORATORIUM ON CAFO OPERATIONS IN THE BUFFALO RIVER WATERSHED. Thank you,

Nancy and Harrison Miner

## Comment from: William Eaton

P-452-1

I support legislation and associated regulation that prohibits large animal operations from the watershed of any potentially affected fragile stream. I grew up on a large cattle operation in NE Arkansas and know of the magnitude of animal waste that is created and the potential consequences to local streams. Waste handling and disposal methods affecting nutrient transport is the issue. The underlying science related to local geology, including soil mechanics and aquifer recharge should inform lawmakers and regulatory agencies, not politics and lobbying groups with an agenda to discredit and discount science. I have a 48 year background in Engineering, and I know the difference between scientific data and politics.

## Comment from: Joe Massey

P-453-1

I greatly appreciate the actions taken by the Governor, ADEQ, C&H farms, the Nature Conservancy, BRWA and others to close the large swine CAFO along Big Creek and strongly support a permanent moratorium on additional large- and medium-size CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. Thank you, Joe Massey.

## Comment from: Ruth Weinstein-McShane

P-454-1

Don't repeat the worst environmental decision in the history of NC Arkansas (permitting the C & H hog CAFO)! Put in place a PERMANENT moratorium on all medium and large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed. Preserve our natural treasure.

# Comment from: Joseph McShane

P-455-1

We don't need more industrial-agricultural runoff in our streams and rivers. Declare a permanent moratorium all medium and large hog CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. Our river is a treasure to the state, the nation and the planet. Keep industrial agriculture out of it.

# Comment from: Peg McCoy

P-456-1

Please approve permanent moratorium on CAFO's.

Buffalo River is irreplaceable. Please do right so it's clean clear & beautiful for now & future generations to respect & enjoy.

# **Comment from: Janette Groves**

P-457-1

Greetings.

I am a lover of your natural state, and also a property owner in the Buffalo River area. Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

Thank you so much. Your support impacts many generations ahead, and protects OUR national treasure.

With regards,

Janette Groves

# Comment from: John Ray

P-458-1

Please approve a Permanent Moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed. There is strong evidence that the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by C&H with excess nutrients. Such contamination can have an extremely negative impact on the Buffalo River water quality, recreational opportunities, and aquatic life. The DEQ has found that engineering standards as applied to this facility in a karst area were not adequate to

protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River. Possible remediation methods for waste disposal (sewage treatment, sludge removal, concrete holding tanks, or phosphorus removal from the watershed) have not proven to be technically or financially feasible. Therefore, a permanent moratorium is the best solution.

## **Comment from: Steven Foster**

P-459-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed, as well as other Karst-formation watersheds in the Ozarks. It's just common sense. Thank you!

## **Comment from: Richard Stauffacher**

P-460-1

The Fuffalo river and its watershed should be protected, and development not allowed. The recreational benefits collectively infinitely outweigh the limited benefits of development.

## **Comment from: Jerome and Harriet Jansma**

P-461-1

We are hoping you will have the wisdom and public spirit to decide to make permanent a rule that will not allow medium and large CAFOs (as they are commonly called) in the Buffalo River watershed. It has been a long battle to close down the one CAFO that had the potential to do terrible damage to this area. We are grateful to the owners of the operation for their public spirit in agreeing to close it. We hope you will follow their lead.

J and H Jansma retirees, residents of Arkansas since 1964

# Comment from: Katie Deakins

P-462-1

Reg. 5.105 Exemption

Any confined animal operation using a liquid waste disposal system shall be exempt from the requirements of this regulation if the owner or operator obtains and maintains active coverage under either an National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System individual or general permit for discharges from a concentrated animal feeding operation.

I am not comfortable with the proposed Reg. 5.105 Exemption. This is not strict enough to protect watershed areas in our state that are dominated by karst topography. Please do everything possible to ensure a PERMANENT moratorium on such CAFO's in the Buffalo River watershed as well as others in our beautiful Natural State. I appreciate the work Gov. Hutchison has done so far, and it is my hope he can make this a lasting legacy forever.

### **Comment from: Carmen Quinn**

### P-463-1

I care about protecting the Buffalo River and its watershed. I urge you to approve a permanent moratorium on large and medium CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. It will take years for the river to recover from the damage from C&H. It would be a travesty to allow another industrial farm to operate in the watershed.

### Comment from: Willem DeBruijn

### P-464-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on ALL swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed becouse If only one swine concentrated feeding operation can, after only 5 years of operation, contribute to declining water quality in the Buffalo River watershed what would more than one do?

### **Comment from: Terrie Martindale**

P-465-1

We do not want another issue with keeping the quality of our national in good condition. Getting the hog farm off of Big Creek was expensive, both for the environment and for tax payers. I don't want it to happen again because of a loophole that someone takes advantage of (as C & H Farms did!). The proposed Regulations No. 5 and No. 6 rulemaking changes for the Buffalo River watershed moratorium should encompass ALL medium and large animal feeding operations. The language of the proposed moratorium only applies to swine; however, medium and large poultry and dairy animal feeding operations pose an equivalent threat to our first national river.

## **Comment from: Barry Martindale**

P-466-1

Please, we do not need another threat to the Buffalo River that will cost taxpayers money. We float and we vote.

## **Comment from: Lolly Tindol**

P-467-1

Thank you for closing the hog farm CAFO, And please do not allow another to pollute the Buffalo seeing that it is a wild and scenic river protected by that act of Congress many years ago. We must be careful about pollution in general now that the Earth is suffering from Climate Change. I know that many of you in the Republican Party have espoused what the President has said that climate change is a Chinese Hoax. However I work with scientists who tell the truth, climate change is real and not to be toyed with. Please do all you can to mitigate the catastrophic effects of fossil fuel pollution, that includes what Big Ag has also done such as the state of Arkansas allowing giant animal feed operations which do harm to the animals as well as the people who eat the animals. Please, you are only allowing this for money, we need to work together to not harm our only nest, the Planet Earth.

### Comment from: Jan Wilson

P-468-1

Please continue the good /Godly movement you started by permanently placing a moratorium on CAFOs for medium/large swine not only in the Buffalo National River watershed, but in ALL of our precious Arkansas.

I am grateful for your attention to this matter and hope you will have the wisdom needed to protect God's precious waterways for Arkansas.

## **Comment from: Jon Hackler**

P-469-1

I favor a permanent injunction against any swine operation near the Bufffalo River .

## Comment from: Sherri Ramseyer

P-470-1

I was a park ranger at the Buffalo National River for two summer seasons and saw, first hand, the river quality go down hill in just a few years. I believe it had a lot to do with the swine operation on one of the tributaries of the Buffalo River. Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

Thank you

Sherri Ramseyer

# **Comment from: Keaton Smith**

P-471-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on CAFOs within the Buffalo River watershed. If one facility can cause measurable damage within 5 years of operations, we do not need to repeat this experiment at great cost to the state, surrounding landowners, and the CAFO business itself.

## **Comment from: Al Agnew**

P-472-1

I have floated the entire length of the Buffalo River, and some sections numerous times, as well as hiked many of the trails along the river. I've also floated almost every river in the Arkansas and Missouri Ozarks, and the Buffalo is by far the most scenic of all of them. As a National River it has national significance, not just to the state of Arkansas, and deserves all the protection of its watershed that is necessary to maintain the water quality of the river. I am absolutely in favor of a permanent moratorium banning all CAFOs from the watershed of the Buffalo. I believe the evidence shows that the CAFO on Big Creek has had a very significant effect on the water quality of this tributary. According to the new BCRET study, nitrate and phosphorus levels on Big Creek below this CAFO are greatly increased on Big Creek and these loads have entered the river, plus the creek is highly contaminated with E. coli. If other CAFOs were allowed within the watershed, greatly decreased water quality in the river would

be inevitable, and there is really no feasible way of reducing the contamination. It is the height of shortsightedness and stupidity to allow this to happen on this nationally important river.

### **Comment from: Karen Spence**

### P-473-1

Please issue a permanent moratorium on any CAFO in the Buffalo River watershed--the karst rock does not adequately support the runoff, and the amount of nutrients in the waters are visible. I have floated the Buffalo since I was little, and it is an amazing river. Now, the algae growth at the lower end is unbelievable--it is heart-wrenching to think that future generations will never know the beauty of the river if these CAFOs are allowed to continue. Please protect this beautiful Arkansas resource for the world and the future.

# Comment from: Mary Agnew

### P-474-1

I have floated the entire length of the Buffalo River, and some sections numerous times, as well as hiked many of the trails along the river. I've also floated almost every river in the Arkansas and Missouri Ozarks, and the Buffalo is by far the most scenic of all of them. As a National River it has national significance, not just to the state of Arkansas, and deserves all the protection of its watershed that is necessary to maintain the water quality of the river. I am absolutely in favor of a permanent moratorium banning all CAFOs from the watershed of the Buffalo. I believe the evidence shows that the CAFO on Big Creek has had a very significant effect on the water quality of this tributary. According to the new BCRET study, nitrate and phosphorus levels on Big Creek below this CAFO are greatly increased on Big Creek and these loads have entered the river, plus the creek is highly contaminated with E. coli. If other CAFOs were allowed within the watershed, greatly decreased water quality in the river would be inevitable, and there is really no feasible way of reducing the contamination. It is the height of shortsightedness and stupidity to allow this to happen on this nationally important river.

# Comment from: Betty L Scott

## P-475-1

A permanent protection of the (first)National Buffalo River is necessary for the river and it's waters protection. This is already known. Nothing changes the fact. Do we really need to continue repeating the obvious. Long may she flow free of hog shit!!!

# Comment from: Yolanda Dreher

P-476-1

I support a a permanent moratorium of medium and large swine Confined Animal Feeding Operations (CAFO's) in the Buffalo National River Watershed.

# Comment from: James McPherson

### P-477-1

On behalf of my self, my Wife Grace my three children and my five grandchildren and two great-grandchildren I write to urge the approval of a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed. We seriously missed using the Buffalo River Carver landing for our families summer recreation because we were afraid to expose our family to the swine produced waste pollution seeping into Big Creek and subsequently into the River just a short distance from our Favorite spot at Carver Landing. Carver Landing on the Buffalo has been a family tradition summer recreation spot for generations. Please make the CAFOs moratorium permanent. Thank you, James McPherson 2 miles from Carver Lnading.

### **Comment from: Alisa Dixon**

P-478-1

Karst terrain has been shown to be inadequate to support any type of hog farm because the waste cannot be contained. There is also strong evidence that the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by C&H with excess nutrients. If this were replicated on several other tributaries the Buffalo River, water quality, recreational opportunities, and aquatic life would suffer.

I am expressing my concerns and I support a permanent moratorium on hog farms in the Buffalo River watershed to protect it for future generations. It is a great natural treasure for the great state of Arkansas.

Sincerely, Alisa Dixon

Concerned Citizen

## Comment from: Richard P. Osborne

P-479-1

I support a permanent moratorium on commercial farming in the Buffalo River basin.

### **Comment from: Debora Carpenter**

P-480-1

I am in favor Of the DEQ rule change that provides for a permanent moratorium on swine farms in the Buffalo River watershed.

### Comment from: Jamie White

P-481-1

If only one swine concentrated feeding operation can, after only 5 years of operation, contribute to declining water quality in the Buffalo River watershed what would more do? Please vote to ensure the future safety of this beautiful river!

Thank you,

Jamie

### **Comment from: Jill Acree**

P-482-1

I support a permanent moratorium on medium and large animal feed lots. As you well know, the geology does not support this kind of agriculture, and the Buffalo River is far too precious a natural resource to destroy in this way.

## **Comment from: Charles Johnson**

P-483-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed. The Buffalo River is a national treasure, it needs to be protected now and for future generations.

## Comment from: pamela ellwood

P-484-1

please adopt regulations prohibiting future hog farms within the buffalo river watershed. Lets live up to our motto "the natural state" and keep our bueatiful and free flowing Buffalo river free from future hog CAFO/S waste and bi-products as i have grandchildren who love to swim and float the river.

# Comment from: Tammy Tennyson

P-485-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations in the Buffalo National River watershed. It is disgraceful one was ever allowed in the first place.

## Comment from: Robert Shingledecker

P-486-1

Please stop this CAFO insanity! The Buffalo River Watershed is not the only place these factory farms are targeting. The Arkansas River Valley is in their sights as well. Keep the Natural State from becoming the "Nasty State"!

# Comment from: Kevin Ehemann

P-487-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed

# Comment from: Rebecca Holden

P-488-1

Clean water is necessary for good health, any form of concentrated pollutants should be treated before surface or ground water can be affected. Houses/homes intended for human occupation generally include a septic system for sewage treatment in order to protect the ground water to some degree, towns develop waste treatment facilities for relatively small populations of humans. A Confined Animal Feeding Operation is considered, by some, to be farming but the concentration of animal waste becomes a pollutant at that level. There are recommended population per acre guidelines for responsible husbandry that could be followed and would help protect water quality.

## **Comment from: Cathy Ross**

P-489-1

According to the Department of Environmental Quality, There is strong evidence that the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by C&H with excess nutrients. I am opposed to any CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed. I am in favor of a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed. Thank you. Cathy Ross

## Comment from: Daniela Tamayo

P-490-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# **Comment from: Michael Armstrong**

P-491-1

I STRONGLY SUPPORT a permanent moratorium on swine Confined Animal Feeding Operations as defined by ADEQ Regulation 5 within the Buffalo River watershed. Thank you for this opportunity to comment.

## Mike Armstrong

# **Comment from: Carol Storthz**

P-492-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed.or

# Comment from: ANDREW PROCTOR

P-493-1

DEQ has found that engineering standards were not enough to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River. Furthermore, remediation methods for waste removal from the watershed) were not shown to be technically or financially possible. Thus, a permanent moratorium is the best solution.

Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by C&H with excess nutrients so if this were replicated on other tributaries the Buffalo River, water quality, recreational opportunities, and aquatic life would surely suffer. Hence the need for a permanent

### moratorium.

### Comment from: Mary E. Fitzgerald

P-494-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine CAFO's on the Buffalo National River's Watershed.

This issue is important to me as an Arkansas resident. The Buffalo National River is a jewel, and must be protected.

Swine CAFOs near the watershed contribute to a decline in the water quality. Please approve a permanent moratorium.

### **Comment from: William Threet**

P-495-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

## Comment from: Gladys Tiffany

### P-496-1

I'm very grateful that ADEQ and other agencies have chosen to protect the Buffalo River from swine facility pollution. And thank you for considering the long-term protection of our first national river.

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

### Comment from: Lauri Patterson

### P-497-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed." or "If only one swine concentrated feeding operation can, after only 5 years of operation, contribute to declining water quality in the Buffalo River watershed what would more do? ". Or feel free to refer to BRWA's more extensive comments found here. The important thing is to let ADEQ know, loud and clear, that you care about permanent protection of the Buffalo National River.

### **Comment from: Nancy Hartney**

### P-498-1

"Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed." or "If only one swine concentrated feeding operation can, after only 5 years of operation, contribute to declining water quality in the Buffalo River watershed what would more do?

### Comment from: Joseph D. LaFace

P-499-1

Main point 1. DEQ has found that engineering standards as applied to this facility in a karst area were not adequate to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River. Also, possible remediation methods for waste disposal (sewage treatment, sludge removal, concrete holding tanks, or phosphorus removal from the watershed) have not proven to be technically or financially feasible. Therefore, a permanent moratorium is the best solution.

Main point 2: There is strong evidence that the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by C&H with excess nutrients. If this were replicated on several other tributaries the Buffalo River, water quality, recreational opportunities, and aquatic life would surely suffer. Hence the need for a permanent moratorium.

### Comment from: STEPHEN BAILEY

P-500-1

I fully support and ask that the Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality impose a permanent moratorium on any medium or large scale swine (or any other animal) concentrated animal feeding operations in the Buffalo National River watershed. Thank you.

## **Comment from: Fred Goldthorpe**

P-501-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### **Comment from: Kathrine Jones**

### P-502-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### **Comment from: Kay Ewart**

P-503-1

Please continue with the plan to provide a permanent moratorium of medium and large CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

The fragile karst in this area allows too much of the dangerous byproducts to enter the streams as evidenced by scientific data.

This state and national natural resource is too valuable to the people of our state, as well as the tourism industry, to risk further contamination.

Thank you

## Comment from: Janet Nye

P-504-1

I am commenting in favor of DEQ's rule change that provides FOR a PERMANENT MORATORIUM of medium and large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo National River. From a review of the process to build the C&H hog CAFO, DEQ found that the engineering standards used were not adequate to protect Big Creek or the Buffalo National River in karst geology. I find this totally unacceptable and a strong reason to support this permanent moratorium.

There has been strong evidence that the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated with excess nutrients. Since Big Creek is a major tributary of the Buffalo National River this is totally unacceptable. A permanent moratorium on medium and large CAFOs in the Buffalo National River watershed is critical to water quality, aquatic life, bird life and recreational activities.

Nitrate and phosphorous levels in Big Creek are doubled as the Creek passes C&H Farm. These high levels of contaminants continue downstream to the Buffalo National River.

Another huge concern is the very high levels of E. coli in Big Creek.

DEQ's rule change to prohibit future medium to large CAFOs in the Buffalo National River is the course for America's first National River. To protect this resource for the state of Arkansas, the country and for all who visit is critical. Protecting the river for its water quality, the flora and fauna is our responsibility as protectors of this country's resources.

I support this rule change that provides for a permanent moratorium on medium and large CAFOs in the Buffalo National River watershed.

## Comment from: Pamela Phillips

P-505-1

Please support the permanent moratorium on hog CAFOs in the Buffalo National River watershed. The waste application in this karst region has caused phosphorus overloading in the water and made a substantial contribution to the algae problem along the river, which has caused illness among people and their pets. The ecological and financial impacts are too great to risk again. Thank you for your consideration of my comments.QR5K

## **Comment from: Janet Parsch**

P-506-1

Hello, I am writing in support of a permanent moratorium on medium and large CAFOs (confined animal feeding operations) in the Buffalo National River watershed. This is a karst area and engineering standards have not been adequate to protect water quality for storing and disposing of waste in this sensitive area. Distributing nutrients generated by CAFOs to this degree on land in this watershed would only continue to exacerbate conditions, and, so, therefore, I support a permanent moratorium in the BNR watershed. Moreover, more careful reviews and stricter standards need to be addressed throughout Arkansas before permitting large CAFOs anywhere in the state so as not to jeopardize other water resources. Thank you.

## Comment from: Debbie Howorka

P-507-1

FOR: Permanent moratorium of medium and large swine Confined Animal Feeding Operations (CAFO's) in the Buffalo National River Watershed

## REASONS:

1: DEQ has found that engineering standards as applied to this facility in a karst area were not adequate to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River. Also, possible remediation methods for waste disposal (sewage treatment, sludge removal, concrete holding tanks, or phosphorus removal from the watershed) have not proven to be technically or financially feasible. Therefore, a permanent moratorium is the best solution.

2: There is strong evidence that the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by C&H with excess nutrients. If this were replicated on several other tributaries the

Buffalo River, water quality, recreational opportunities, and aquatic life would surely suffer. Hence the need for a permanent moratorium.

Here is a more detailed list of evidence for the moratorium:

Ever rising nitrate levels in the "house" well and ephemeral stream adjacent to the waste lagoons.

Nitrate levels in Big Creek more than double as it passes the farm.

Groundwater nitrate levels below the farm are elevated by as much as 4 times as ground water levels above the farm.

The phosphorus load (mass transport off the land) downstream is double the upstream load.

Field phosphorus levels in C&H have increased significantly, which is to be expected when field application rates greatly exceed agronomic needs.

Very high E. coli levels in Big Creek, regularly above the safe human contact level.

## Comment from: Tim Eubanks

P-508-1

Please put me on the record in favor of a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine CAFO's in the Buffalo River watershed. The current engineering standards for handling the waste water are not adequate. The karst topography of the area is not suitable for these kinds of operations.

There is strong evidence that the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated from the C&H farm and more CAFO's on other tributaries could only further negatively impact the overall water quality of the Buffalo River.

The Buffalo River provides a major economic boost the the counties through which it flows. If the water quality is degraded by agriculture, swine operations specifically, that economic benefit would certainly be reduced.

## Comment from: Laura Fleetwood

P-509-1

I am very much in favor of a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine Confined Animal Feeding Operations in the Buffalo National River Watershed. For many years the Buffalo River has been a favorite canoeing and picnicking spot for our family. It is very important that this beautiful river be free of waste disposal and a clean river for folks all across the country to enjoy!!

## Comment from: Joy Henning

P-510-1

We live in Marshall, 15 minutes from the Buffalo National River. We retired here so that we could enjoy the Buffalo River and surrounding land. We have been greatly relieved that the hog farm has been permanently closed. It should never have happened. We ask you to please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

Thank you for listening to the people of Arkansas who are concerned about maintaining the quality and beauty of our national treasure, the Buffalo National River.

### Joy and Bill Henning

## **Comment from: William Dailey**

### P-511-1

My family and I visit Arkansas as often as four times a year including Hot Springs, Conway and Little Rock. We have always been humbled by Arkansas waterways and the Ozarks. We recognize the need for economic investment but limiting entry and permitting for some industries, e.g. paper mills and pig farms, dependent on dilution of their wastes in local public waterways is essential. Thank you.

## Comment from: Dara Yeager

P-512-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed."

### Comment from: Tim Yeager

P-513-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed."

## Comment from: Brenda Miller

### P-514-1

I am in favor of an Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ) rule change that provides for a permanent moratorium of medium and large swine Confined Animal Feeding Operations (CAFO's) in the Buffalo National River Watershed for all the following reasons:

DEQ has found that engineering standards as applied to this facility in a karst area were not adequate to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River. Also, possible remediation methods for waste disposal (sewage treatment, sludge removal, concrete holding tanks, or phosphorus removal from the watershed) have not proven to be technically or financially feasible. Therefore, a permanent moratorium is the best solution.

There is strong evidence that the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by C&H with excess nutrients. If this were replicated on several other tributaries the Buffalo River, water quality, recreational opportunities, and aquatic life would surely suffer. Hence the need for a permanent moratorium.

Ever rising nitrate levels in the "house" well and ephemeral stream adjacent to the waste lagoons.

Nitrate levels in Big Creek more than double as it passes the farm.

Groundwater nitrate levels below the farm are elevated by as much as 4 times as ground water levels above the farm.

The phosphorus load (mass transport off the land) downstream is double the upstream load.

Field phosphorus levels in C&H have increased significantly, which is to be expected when field application rates greatly exceed agronomic needs.

Very high E. coli levels in Big Creek, regularly above the safe human contact level.

## Comment from: Dina and Jeff Nash

P-515-1

Re: Regs 5 and 6: Docket 19-002-R:

Our family is opposed to any future permits for CAFOs in the Buffalo River and Big Creek Watersheds. For that matter, we don't want CAFOs or polluting industries anywhere in the Extraordinary Resource Waters of the state, either; for example, the Mulberry, the Caddo, Illinois Bayou, the Little Red, etc. The data contained in the BCRET final report should be enough for the ADEQ's rule change to create a permanent moratorium on polluting CAFOs or other businesses in these sensitive karst-based soil formations, which eventually pollutes our rivers, streams, and lakes.

We canoe and swim in the Buffalo, and we count on it to be clean. We have seen the long algal blooms in the river, and we know the minerals and conditions which give rise to these toxic growths in our waters. We have seen the increased green slime in the Buffalo which was never there before the C& H Hog Farm! In North Carolina where such CAFOs abound, the fish have nasty growths on their bodies, and no one wants to swim in the local rivers anymore: what a shame!

Create a permanent moratorium on such farms and other polluting businesses in our beautiful, important waters! Thank you!

Dina and Jeff Nash and family and friends

## **Comment from: Jill Valenti**

P-516-1

Please elect to create a permanent moratorium on CAFO's on the Buffalo National River and it 's watershed. It is a national treasure which means it's to be enjoyed by our entire nation and it's precious. The impact of a single CAFO after 7 years was substantial impact on the quality of the river and the entire ecosystem therein.

## Comment from: schuyler schwarting

#### P-517-1

Good afternoon,

I would like to comment in favor of an Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ) rule change that provides for a permanent moratorium of medium and large swine Confined Animal Feeding Operations (CAFO's) in the Buffalo National River Watershed.

DEQ has found that engineering standards as applied to this facility in a karst area were not adequate to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River. Also, possible remediation methods for waste disposal (sewage treatment, sludge removal, concrete holding tanks, or phosphorus removal from the watershed) have not proven to be technically or financially feasible. Therefore, a permanent moratorium is the best solution.

There is strong evidence that the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by C&H with excess nutrients. If this were replicated on several other tributaries the Buffalo River, water quality, recreational opportunities, and aquatic life would surely suffer. Hence the need for a permanent moratorium.

Please, Please, Please consider these changes to allow for this National River to be around in its best condition for generation to come. Sincerely,

Schuyler Schwarting

### **Comment from: Alan Nye**

P-518-1

In brief, I respectfully request that the moratorium regarding siting and operation of medium and large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo National River watershed be made permanent.

I have attached my technical criticism of the Big Creek Research Extension Team report. To the extent that the Big Creek Research Extension Team report is used as a decision-making tool in whether or not to make the moratorium permanent, I request that my comments be thoughtfully considered.

One result of the BCRET report is very clear. During the operation of C&H Farm, the nitrate concentrations downstream of the farm were approximately double those of the

upstream sampling station. These results are the "smoking gun" strongly implying C&H Farm is a source of nitrate pollution to Big Creek and the Buffalo National River watershed.

I would urge the ADEQ to make the conditions of the moratorium permanent, thereby avoiding future nutrient loading to Buffalo National River watershed and the high costs incurred to undo the mistake of allowing C&H Farm and its like to be sited and operated in the watershed.

## Comment from: Jim Bush

P-519-1

It is painfully obvious that confined animal feeding operations do not belong in environmentally sensitive areas such as the Buffalo River watershed. There is strong evidence of pollution in Big Creek from C&H hog farm. There should be a permanent moratorium on such operations. The Buffalo National River is a special resource for the entire nation and deserves optimal protection.

## **Comment from: Carol Christoffel**

P-520-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium not only on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) but any such feeding operation for cattle, chickens etc. in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

## **Comment from: James Frederick**

P-521-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed. Gross negligence on the part of ADEQ has already ruined a large portion of the river and cost Arkansas residents millions of dollars. Don't repeat this. Approve a permanent moratorium on CAFO's!

## Comment from: BRYAN MANIRE

P-522-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed. Gross negligence on the part of ADEQ has already ruined a large portion of the river and cost Arkansas residents millions of dollars. Don't repeat this. Approve a permanent moratorium on CAFO's!

# **Comment from: Mark Richards**

P-523-1

Dear Sir or Madam:

I am in support of the permanent moratorium of medium and large swine Concentrated Animal Feeding Operations("CAFOs") in the Buffalo River Watershed ("BRW"). Not only am I in support of a permanent moratorium on swine, I also support a moratorium on all medium and large CAFOs within the BRW.

The negative impact of just one CAFO over a five year period on the water quality of the Buffalo River is now clearly documented in the taxpayer funded BCRET final report. The report documents numerous problems including phosphorus overloading, pond leakage and storm runoff, all of which have contributed to the impaired water quality of both Big Creek and the Buffalo River.

I encourage ADEQ to impose a permanent moratorium on all medium and large swine CAFOs in the BRW.

Mark Richards 11 W Razorback Rd Rogers, AR 72758

## Comment from: Gerald Toler

P-524-1

If contamination from excess nutrients were replicated on tributaries to the Buffalo River, water quality, recreational opportunities, and aquatic life would surely suffer. So there is an eved for a permanent moratorium

## Comment from: David Peterson

P-525-1

I fully support the current temporary moratorium permanent. I agree with the DEQ moratorium proposal and the published rationale. I believe the engineering standards as practiced at C&H Farms have not been adequate to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River from nutrient pollutants, bacteria, and other swine-associated contaminants. Furthermore, possible remediation methods of waste treatment, including those described in the BCRET Final Report (e.g. sewage treatment, sludge removal, concrete holding tanks, phosphorus removal from the watershed, P application at agronomic rates) have not proven to be technologically and financially and/or acceptable or manageable by the CAFO owner. Therefore, permanent protection of the watershed is necessary for Arkansas' national river.

The Final Report identifies significantly elevated nitrate levels downstream from the farm. The nitrate levels in the house well and the ephemeral stream point to the CAFO as the only possible source which could continue to elevate levels starting in 2014. In addition, the more variable TP loading estimates suggest elevated TP loads far higher

below the farm than above the farm. Several conclusions from the Final Report recommend applications of TP be limited to agronomic needs but this is not what happened at C&H and this is not the general CAFO model for liquid waste from swine.

In doesn't make sense to repeat this 6.2 million dollar mistake in other areas of the Buffalo River watershed. 1.3 people visited the Buffalo River last year. They want and deserve a clean and safe experience.

### Comment from: Virginia Hartnett

P-526-1

Arkansas is a land of wonder and beauty, and the Buffalo River highlights this Natural State. As our National River, it deserves our respect and protection. We Arkansans are duty bound. Its waters are still being adversely affected as a result of the CAFO hog farm that has been shut down. It will take time and care to recover. It is critical that further damage be avoided. Changes to Regulations 5 & 6 should expand the moratorium to include ALL (not only swine) medium and large scale animal feeding operations in the Buffalo River Watershed.

## Comment from: Sarah Thompson

P-527-1

I strongly agree that there should be a permanent moratorium on any type of CAFO being permitted in the Buffalo River watershed. Despite arguments that no one would ever attempt to establish or be able to attain funding for such a permit, I feel that the only way to ensure it never happens again, is to make the moratorium final NOW!

## Comment from: Grimsley Graham

### P-528-1

Dear Sirs: I am strongly in favor of declaring a permanent moratorium on large and medium swine operations in the Buffalo National River watershed. The excess nutrient loads detected in Big Creek and in the Buffalo River downstream from C&H threaten this national treasure.

Thank-you

# Comment from: Timothy Dean

### P-529-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I

support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: Harrie Farrow

P-530-1

Due to the fact that the engineering standards applied to this karst area are not adequate to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River, and that the possible remediation methods for waste disposal have not proven to be technically or financially feasible, a permanent moratorium is the only reasonable solution.

Our tourism economy is dependent on the Natural State's protection of our unique, and thus high demand, natural features. Aesthetics and health are among Arkansas' most valuable resources.

Justice of the Peace, Carroll County, Harrie Farrow

## Comment from: Lynn Phillips

P-531-1

I am heart broken that the beautiful Buffalo National River and the Big Creek area has been damaged/polluted by inadequate engineering and what seems like either ignorance or lack of care for Arkansas' own National River. The River and the adjacent area has been a real source of beauty and pride for all of Arkansas. It seems restoration of the area is hanging in the balance. I'm praying it's not just left hanging! There are many difficult challenges, financial feasibility issues , and no guarantees of a real clean up.

I hope and pray that there can be a permanent moratorium to stop any other potential polluting concerns and prevent additional or further degradation to this area and beyond.

We ALL live down stream!

Respectfully,

Lynn Phillips

## Comment from: Mark Alderman

P-532-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: Philip Gibson

P-533-1

Although my address is out of state, I own land boarding the Buffalo National River and come there often. I have been coming for 20years. I may retire on that land and become a full-time resident of Arkansas. All because if that river.

### Comment from: Ralph Rexroad

P-534-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

## Comment from: Eva Coffee

### P-535-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed

regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

## Comment from: Laura Villegas

P-536-1

If only one swine concentrated feeding operation can, after only 5 years of operation, contribute to declining water quality in the Buffalo River watershed what would more do? Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations (CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River watershed. Protect our beautiful national river!

## **Comment from: James Cohea**

P-537-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed. Thank you.

# Comment from: Derek Linn

P-538-1

Regulation 5 and 6 rule making comment period

Good afternoon,

Thank you for this opportunity to comment. Please note my strong support for the Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ) rule change that provides for a permanent moratorium of medium and large swine Confined Animal Feeding Operations (CAFO's) in the Buffalo National River Watershed.

1. DEQ has found that engineering standards as applied to this facility in a karst area were not adequate to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River. Also, possible remediation methods for waste disposal (sewage treatment, sludge removal, concrete holding tanks, or phosphorus removal from the watershed) have not proven to be technically or financially feasible. Therefore, a permanent moratorium is the best solution.

2. There is strong evidence that the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by C&H with excess nutrients. If this were replicated on several other tributaries the Buffalo River, water quality, recreational opportunities, and aquatic life would surely suffer. Hence the need for a permanent moratorium.

3. Significant findings from the Big Creek Research and Extension Team (BCRET) Final Report include:

\* Nitrate levels in Big Creek more than double as it passes the farm.

\* Groundwater nitrate levels below the farm are elevated by as much as 4 times as

ground water levels above the farm.

\* The phosphorus load (mass transport off the land) downstream is double the upstream load.

\* Field phosphorus levels in C&H have increased significantly, which is to be expected when field application rates greatly exceed agronomic needs.

\* Very high E. coli levels in Big Creek, regularly above the safe human contact level.

Thank you for all you do, especially through carrying out the DEQ mission of protecting, enhancing, and restoring the natural environment for the well-being of all Arkansans.

Respectfully,

Derek Linn 807 NW 9th St. Bentonville, AR 72712

### Comment from: Kay Abney

P-539-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### **Comment from: Margaret Fortuny**

P-540-1

I agree that Swine farms need to be prohibited close to the Buffalo River (perhaps keep a distance of 20 miles). Chemical, feed and bioproduct runoff can and has produced unprecedented blooms of red algae in the Buffalo River. The Cargill plant has adversely affected Jasper and the surrounding areas not only environmentally, but in Tourism (camping, canoeing and kayaking). Visitors to the area enjoy these amenities of the Buffalo River, stay in hotels, eat in restaurants. These are all viable means of bolstering the local economy, and should not be threatened.

## **Comment from: John Sutherland**

P-541-1

As an Arkansas resident, Buffalo River paddler, and national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulations 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### **Comment from: Glenn Jones**

P-542-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

## Comment from: Ann Mesrobian

P-543-1

Re: Reg. 5 and 6 Revisions--Permanent Moratorium on swine CAFOs in Buffalo National River watershed

I support a permanent, enforceable moratorium on all swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed and I urge ADEQ and all relevant agencies in Arkansas to adopt such a rule in perpetuity.

It is abundantly clear to me and an overwhelming majority of the public that when lobbying for designation of the Buffalo as our country's first National River, the founders intended not only to protect the river from yet another Army Corps of Engineers dam, but also to preserve the quality of the water within its banks. Without clean water in it, none of the recreational uses presently supported by the river would be possible. Nobody visits a polluted river on holiday.

I assisted with ongoing water quality monitoring conducted by volunteers from Buffalo River Watershed Alliance and the dye trace studies and additional field work performed by Dr. Van Brahana's Karst Hydrology of the Buffalo National River team. I am familiar with the work done by BCRET.

Local residents already know, and most visitors to the Buffalo National River quickly learn, that the karst terrain underlying its watershed is highly vulnerable to the kind of leakage and seepage all CAFOs emit. Yet somehow this fact was ignored by the U. S. Farm Bureau when that agency enthusiastically encouraged construction of C&H CAFO in the first place, using federally-insured Small Business Administration loan(s). Presence of karst in the region was subsequently denied by regulators when they granted C&H their permit in 2011. In the meantime, the damage has spread far beyond the property housing the facility itself.

Present regulations for CAFOs like C&H allow vast quantities of untreated raw swine sewageevery bit of what the 3500 resident swine produce-- to be spread on nearby receiving fields.

This accepted practice may be safe enough in areas without vulnerable hydrogeology that have plenty of deep, nutrient-depleted soils capable of absorbing and utilizing all those excess nutrients. But in the thin soils overlying sensitive karst terrain of the Buffalo National River watershed, the practice backfires. Overwhelmed by nutrient loading, C&H's over-saturated receiving fields pass some excess nutrients into runoff while the rest seep through fractured karst and enter the groundwater, en route to the Buffalo. This creates a persistent issue of legacy phosphorous in the river. Long after C&H CAFO has closed its doors, we will endure yearspossibly decades--of hyper-charged algae blooms that make the river seasonably unusable. We do not know how long it will take for all the phosphorous to be consumed and this is from just one CAFO in operation for less than 8 years. This is why a permanent moratorium on such facilities in the Buffalo River Watershed is both appropriate and necessary.

The Buffalo National River is highly valued and internationally revered as a wilderness destination, placing Arkansas on the bucket list of many nature tourists. The Buffalo National River is largely recognized as THE economic driver for the region and is worth protecting from this preventable pollution.

Allowing one CAFO in the watershed was a profound mistake that even the regulators and at least two Arkansas governors regret. Clean, free-flowing rivers will only increase in value as they become ever more scarce.

This is a new decade and time is of the essence. Let's make the right choice and use 2020 FORESIGHT to protect this natural jewel for future generations. The Buffalo National River deserves protecting. It's time to make those protections permanent.

Sincerely,

Ann Mesrobian 19 W Pike St Fayetteville, AR 72701 January 20, 2020

### Comment from: Gary Bivens

#### P-544-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: Sam Mcclea

P-545-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

Support this ban to support the ban on rivers in the natural state.

## **Comment from: Mary Schlatterer**

P-546-1

I am writing to comment in favor of an Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality rule change that provides for a permanent moratorium

Of medium and large swine animal feeding operations (CAFO's) in the Buffalo National River Watershed. A permanent moratorium is imperative after studies conducted by Big Creek Research and Extension Team showed rising nitrate levels in the "house" well and ephemeral stream adjacent to the waste lagoons....increased nitrate levels in Big Creek.... an increase in groundwater nitrate levels below the farm...the phosphorus load downstream was double the upstream load.....high levels of E. Coli in Big Creek....increase in field phosphorus levels from field applications. A permanent moratorium is the only solution for this fragile environment.

## Comment from: Jolynn Loftus

### P-547-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

## Comment from: Emily Linn

### P-548-1

I support a moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed! I want my daughter to be able to enjoy the same beautiful river I have today. Don't allow the meat industry to rob her of that.

### **Comment from: Eunice Millett**

P-549-1

I have been a resident of Arkansas since 1972, and have canoed and hiked on the Buffalo National River since it became the first National River in 1972 by an act of congress. Our children were born and raised in Arkansas, and have spent a great deal of time on the river both with us and as part of scouting and youth church activities. The Buffalo National River is a national treasure, and draws over 1 million visitors a year from all over the world, and contributes over \$40 million a year to the state's economy.

I strongly support the Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ) rule change that provides for a permanent moratorium of medium and large swine Confined Animal Feeding Operations (CAFO's) in the Buffalo National River Watershed. DEQ has found that engineering standards as applied to C&H CAFO near Big Creek in a karst area were not adequate to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River. Also, possible remediation methods for waste disposal (sewage treatment, sludge removal, concrete holding tanks, or phosphorus removal from the watershed) have not proven to be technically or financially feasible. Therefore, a permanent moratorium is the best solution.

There is strong evidence that the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by C&H with excess nutrients. If this were replicated on several other tributaries the Buffalo River, water quality, recreational opportunities, and aquatic life would surely suffer.

Hence the need for a permanent moratorium.

### Sincerely, Eunice Millett

### **Comment from: Philip Waters**

P-550-1

I support the AR DEQ rule change that provides a moratorium of medium & large swine CAFO's in the Buffalo National River Watershed. If nitrate & phosphorus levels were w/in a tolerable range, then I would say, environmental & economic interests are in balance. Right now, they're not. You have to figure out what's not working & fix it before you can proceed w/any new CAFO's; otherwise, AR will be hurting its tourist industry not to mention all the health issues this will invoke. Let's not add to the problem. Thank you & good luck!

### **Comment from: Danny Coleman**

### P-551-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### **Comment from: Ellen Tutt**

P-552-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

## **Comment from: Andrea Ross**

P-553-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### **Comment from: Marin Miller**

P-554-1

As a national park advocate and lover of the Buffalo River, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### Comment from: Sue Lupien

P-555-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

## **Comment from: Valerie Dunn**

P-556-1

CAFO's are not natural in nature and are highly toxic to the environment. For the people living around these farms, it's a health hazard. When the wind blows, windows and doors must be shut and clothes on the line are soiled. The inhumane treatment of animals within these facilities make them nothing better then Auschwitz for animals. Workers tragically become desensitized to the suffering. Concentrated toxic waste buildup overloads the land and streams natural abilities to process waste products. The time is now to shut down all these operations and insist on the moratorium.

## Comment from: Stuart Reaves

P-557-1

I support making the ban permanent. Protect the Buffalo river from future pollution.

## **Comment from: Miles Riley**

P-558-1

I live at the confluence of the White & Buffalo River. The function of government in this case is to protect the people's karst geological areas from corporate waste. Corporate restriction is not a violation of individual freedom or civil rights. High impact corporations, like these, not only "leave their trace" but a mess and a smell to go with it. The people are wise to demand restriction in these types of cases. If DEQ is blind to this, then we need new management and leadership. A good government protects the people first over the profiteer's interests. The permanent moratorium in this case will do exactly that.

## Comment from: Rebecca Corley

P-559-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed. This watershed is my home. There has already been impairment to the Buffalo National River since the establishment of the wrongly permitted C&H Hog Farm. Sections of the Buffalo and of Big Creek have been placed on the 303(d) list due to impairment. This watershed has never been and never will be an acceptable location for such an operation due to karst geography. The spreading of millions of gallons of raw sewage on thinly soiled fields in the watershed over time affects the water quality of the Buffalo National River. The karst geography of the watershed as the BCRET Report states: "renders the hydrologic system vulnerable to contamination due to the complexity of surface-water and groundwater regimes".

The BCRET report even with its flaws, redactions and corrections indicates that C&H is contributing substantially to the cumulative N and P loading in Big Creek. Legacy phosphorus from this CAFO operation will be a problem for years to come.

The watershed of the Buffalo National River should and must be protected from any new large to medium swine CAFO's within its watershed. CAFO's have no place in this fragile ecosystem.

One mistake has already been made. This has cost the state and citizens millions of

dollars. It has threatened one of our most valuable natural resources and tourism attraction. If only one swine concentrated feeding operation can, after only 5 years of operation, contribute to declining water quality in the Buffalo River watershed what would more do?

I support the establishment of the Permanent Moratorium included in the rule making changes.

### **Comment from: Burnetta Hinterthuer**

P-560-1

Clean water is one of our real needs, essential to life and health. Please protect one of our most mportant resources for generations to come. Give them what they will need

## Comment from: Sonja Williams

P-561-1

Please protect our beautiful Buffalo River from any future pollution.

## **Comment from: Dale Heath**

P-562-1

I vote against CAFOs on the Buffalo River watershed.

## **Comment from: Clay Parton**

P-563-1

Please establish a complete moratorium on CAFO operations in the Buffalo and White River watersheds, including crooked Creek. All of these streams are national treasures, and important economic contributors to the local and statewide economy. Thank you for all the work you do!

## Comment from: Stephen Ballard

P-564-1

I fully support a permanent moratorium on medium or large feeding operations in the Buffalo River watershed. This river is too valuable to ever consider allowing any threat to its water quality to operate, even with tight restrictions. Why take the chance of damaging a national treasure for the economic benefit of a few. Please pass the moratorium.

## **Comment from: Howard Aleshire**

P-565-1

The Buffalo River is one of the most beautiful natural rivers in our country! We MUST protect our natural beauty for our future generations and keep the environment healthy. Please DO NOT allow any type of pollution in our Buffalo River National Park or any business close by that would potentially pollute the area. Make wise decisions to ensure we have survival of ALL the indigenous ecosystems in and around the Buffalo River and the park!

Thank You

### **Comment from: Kevin Christian**

P-566-1

I want to express my support for the proposed rule changes to Regulations 5 and 6, that would place a permanent moratorium of medium and large hog farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. To allow any further such farming operations in this area of our state would be unconscionable considering the unnecessary risk of environmental damage these types of farms pose to the watershed. The Buffalo River is our state's premier natural attraction. A failure to enact the proposed rule changes would demonstrate that the interests of a few commercial enterprises are being placed above the need to protect a treasured part of the state. Every step possible should be taken by ADEQ to preserve the Buffalo River River watershed's environmental integrity so that Arkansans can enjoy it for years to come.

Best regards, Kevin Christian

**Comment from: Angela Head** 

P-567-1

To whom it may concern,

DEQ has found that engineering standards as applied to this facility in a karst area were not adequate to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River. Also, possible remediation methods for waste disposal (sewage treatment, sludge removal, concrete holding tanks, or phosphorus removal from the watershed) have not proven to be technically or financially feasible. Therefore, a permanent moratorium is the best solution.

There is strong evidence that the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by C&H with excess nutrients. If this were replicated on several other tributaries the Buffalo River, water quality, recreational opportunities, and aquatic life would surely suffer. Hence the need for a permanent moratorium.

Please also take the following facts into consideration:

Ever rising nitrate levels in the "house" well and ephemeral stream adjacent to the waste lagoons.

Nitrate levels in Big Creek more than double as it passes the farm.

Groundwater nitrate levels below the farm are elevated by as much as 4 times as ground water levels above the farm.

The phosphorus load (mass transport off the land) downstream is double the upstream load.

Field phosphorus levels in C&H have increased significantly, which is to be expected when field application rates greatly exceed agronomic needs.

Very high E. coli levels in Big Creek, regularly above the safe human contact levels.

Thank you, Angela Head

### Comment from: LA Tann

P-568-1

Please insure that a permanent moratorium is instated to prevent large or medium sized confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs) in the Buffalo River watershed. We should not have to continue to "Save The Buffalo" as it is a priceless treasure and deserves common sense protections. Thank you in advance.

## **Comment from: Lolly Tindol**

P-569-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

## Comment from: Christopher Walters

### P-570-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

## **Comment from: James Jones**

P-571-1

Arkansas has been entrusted with caring for this beautiful waterway. We must not allow any concentrated feeding operations near Any of the tributaries. Based on data collected from this unapproved experiment, the water was contaminated and the quality negatively impacted. I'm no scientist, but I understand how the soil can not handle this type of farming. Please, please do your job and protect this sensitive ecosystem and preserve it for our future generations.

## Comment from: James Strack

### P-572-1

Too much poop makes for the Buffalo an algae-filled stream. And think about the stink. Ever been downwind from one of these slaughterhouse operations? Don't go there, it's bad. Show your intelligence, create a permanent moratorium on large or medium-sized confined animal feeding operations in the Buffalo River watershed. Don't be afraid to go further, restrict the size of these inhumane operations in all watersheds. Ba-aabe!

## Comment from: Dennis W Wright

P-573-1

I would like to go on record as supporting The Buffalo River, keeping it free from pollution

## Comment from: Hamilton Bell

P-574-1

Please make it a permanent ban on large scale Hog farming in the Buffalo River watershed. The risk to the river is too great.

Thanks, Ham

## **Comment from: Evelyn Sammons**

P-575-1

We have done a great thing taking care of the Hog Farm problem but we need to make sure that others will not follow in their footsteps and pollute our rivers and streams. Keep a lid on and put in guarantees that will insure our future clean water in this beautiful state.

## Comment from: Lynn R

P-576-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed

regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

### **Comment from: lyn Caveness**

P-577-1 help the buffalo river, please.

### **Comment from: lyn Caveness**

P-578-1

help the buffalo river, please.

### **Comment from: Natalie Dettmann**

P-579-1

The Buffalo River is a place that many traveler and campers enjoy; Myself included. It breaks my heart to see what has happened to it over the past years. Please consider donating in any way you can! Give your money and time to help save the river!

### Comment from: James Brandenburg

P-580-1

I'm commenting on the proposed moratorium on large scale confined animal feeding operations in the Buffalo River watershed. I am in favor of making this moratorium permanent for the following reasons.

1) The Buffalo River is a nationally recognized tourist destination which supports many jobs and the economy of the area that has developed to service those tourists. Any potential adverse effects of a CAFO would have a negative impact on existing jobs and the economy of the area, and impact larger than the potential gain of jobs or to the economy from new development of CAFO's.

2) Considering the lack of clear science whether or not the C&H Farm was impacting the watershed, it seems prudent to keep future operations from being proposed or developed until science is more clear, or the impacts of the closure of C&H can be studied over the course of several years. One large operation has put so much into the system that it will take a long time to know the full effects.

3) Making the moratorium permanent will create certainty for all parties involved so that everyone can move on.

Thanks for your time. James Brandenburg

### Comment from: Roxana Walace

P-581-1

Arkansas is the natural state...we have a responsibility to protect all our waters. Buffalo river is our premier waterway and our nations first national river. Do what is right. Protect the entire watershed forever.

## **Comment from: Patricia Mitchell**

P-582-1

"Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed." or "If only one swine concentrated feeding operation can, after only 5 years of operation, contribute to declining water quality in the Buffalo River watershed what would more do? ". We use the Buffalo River with friends and family, happily showing off the Buffalo to those that don't reside here. Over the last few years we have limited our visits because of our concerns over the contamination from the CAFO on Big Creek. It would mean a lot to our quality of life if you would protect this precious resource by approving a permanent moratorium.

# Comment from: Gail Leftwich

P-583-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations in the Buffalo National River's watershed. Knowing that these operations contribute to the declining water quality of the Buffalo River watershed, I feel it is of upmost importance to do what I can to prevent this. I have enjoyed being on the Buffalo River so much in my life and it pains me to think of its demise. Please consider the value of our natural resources by protecting them. Thank you.

Gail Leftwich

# Comment from: Edith Stahl

P-584-1

The Buffalo River is so important to me. I go there to restore my sole and my belief that humans can do the right thing. Thank you for your efforts in closing the C&H hog farm. Now please continue to protect it's water quality by enacting a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the watershed.

# Comment from: Beth Keck

P-585-1

I am writing to asked that the State of Arkansas place a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed. DEQ has found that engineering standards applied to C&H Hog farm were not adequate to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River. Given that this is karst topography, remediation methods for waste disposal (sewage treatment, sludge removal, concrete holding tanks, or phosphorus removal from the watershed) have not proven to be technically or financially feasible. Therefore, a permanent moratorium is the best solution.

There is strong evidence that the Big Creek watershed was contaminated by C&H with excess nutrients produced by the hog farm. If CAFOs are replicated on other tributaries of the Buffalo River water quality, recreational opportunities, and aquatic life would suffer. Hence we need a permanent moratorium covering the Buffalo River watershed.

Thank you for considering this information. Sincerely, Beth Keck

## Comment from: David Malm

P-586-1

Dear ADEQ--

Please acknowledge the serious and abiding concerns of the people of Arkansas and expand the (wise) decision to close down C&H Hog Farm into a permanent moratorium on similar CAFO operations in the Buffalo River watershed.

The BCRET report's documentation of water quality impairments (due to the overloading of manure-derived phosphorus and nitrogen --imported into the natural ecosystem via feedgrains -- onto soils overlying permeable karst geology) makes it clear that such problems are endemic to CAFO operations in the region, not just a "one-off" technical flaw in the particular C&H design. The same problems and impacts will undoubtedly occur if CAFOs are allowed to be established in the region in the future.

The value of a unspoiled, pristine Buffalo National River (to local residents, to tourism-based businesses, to the "Natural State"'s image as a whole) FAR outweighs the narrow, bottom-line interests of the multinational conglomerates who bankroll such short-sighted and potentially catastrophic factory-"farming" projects and expect to foist them upon the inhabitants of sparsely-populated areas under the fake flags of economic development, jobs and ideoligical support for the "Family Farm". Cargill (-cum-JBS) tried to establish C&H, assuming the corner-cutting assistance of state government and the support (--self-interest, default allegiance or at least indifference--) of the "local yokels". They FAILED, thanks to the vigilance and dedication of what was at first a small group of concerned citizens, which grew into a groundswell of activism and finally a tidal wave of public response that (eventually) prevailed upon ADEQ to rescind its improperly-granted application and to reassert its proper role as guardian of our environmental/ ecological quality.

The people of Arkansas are now much wiser as a result of the C&H fiasco. Just as similar pollution impacts are to be "naturally" expected from any future CAFOs in the region, so should be expected a similar, or greater, level of public outrage and opposition in response to such developments should they EVER be attempted.

Therefore: Please approve a PERMANENT MORATORIUM on medium and large

swine concentrated feeding operations (CAFOs)in the Buffalo National River's watershed. It's just doing your job.

Thank you, David Malm Jasper, AR

# Comment from: Annastasia Hunter

P-587-1

By protecting the Buffalo you are not only saving a beautiful peace of Arkansas' Nature and showing we take being called "The Natural State," seriously; but your also promoting ecotourism which will bring money to the communities around the Buffalo. I also know a few members of the community in Clarksville that rely on the Buffalo River. The people here rely and love the Buffalo please allow them the assurance that our government will solidify and help in protecting the River.

# Comment from: Ann Segura

P-588-1

I wish to add my voice to those who desire a permanent moratorium on CATOs in the Buffalo River watershed. This precious resource is invaluable to Arkansas tourism and natural habitat. It would be criminally foolish to allow it to be contaminated for commercial profit.

# Comment from: Roger Pyzocha

P-589-1

Please protect our waters from pollution, especialy the Bufflow River. Thank-you

# Comment from: Gail Eastlack

P-590-1

Please protect the Buffalo National River forever.

# Comment from: Kim Hamilton

P-591-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

Most of all I cant believe this was allowed to happen in the 1st place. However, to all those working to clean up this mess. Thank you!

# Comment from: Gail Lee

P-592-1

The permit for the hog farm should Never been permitted! Everyone knows what bad things happen when animal & man made fertilizer enters any water shed! Florida is dealing with Red Tide from the run off of fertilizer & a poison lake sending untreated water into the gulf!

Our first National River should always be enjoyed forever without fear of becoming ill when you or your family go swimming, or boating on the Buffalo River! All of the water ways that flow into the Buffalo should be protected from animal & industrial fertilizer !! Remember all the mistakes that can not be corrected! Flint, MI, Ft.Myers, FL., etc. Please save our Arkansas beauty that will always be ours to enjoy & share with forever "Thank You sincerely, Gail

# Comment from: Bendex Stevenson

P-593-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium or medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

# **Comment from: Jessie Cave**

P-594-1

Please make the river safer from swine feeding operations. It is bad for the environment. If only one operation happened, how would the quality improved.

# Comment from: Kelsey Dixson

P-595-1

Please approve a permanent moratium on medium and large CAFO in the Buffalo Watershed

# Comment from: Sami Saati

P-596-1

One of our country's most beautiful rivers is in danger. We need to take action to protect it! It is our responsibility!

# **Comment from: William Pickel**

P-597-1

I support a permanent moratorium on allowing large or medium-sized confined animal feeding operations in the Buffalo River watershed.

# Comment from: Syama Barden

P-598-1

As an Arkansas resident, i am willing to do anything to help keep our beautiful state natural. pleae help!!

# **Comment from: Patrick Thom**

P-599-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations (CAFOS) in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

# Comment from: Emily Spillers

P-600-1

I have spent many summers and actually all seasons on this Beautiful river! Please try to help protect this river and the beauty it provides.

# Comment from: Christopher Zapf

P-601-1

I would gladly help and protect the Buffalo River! I will do my best to keep Arkansas the natural state. :-)

# Comment from: laura allcon

P-602-1

please help ensure that the Buffalo National river is protected.

# Comment from: Mayleena Benham

P-603-1

The Buffalo River is a beautiful area and it would sadden many people if it isn't protected. Please help protect it.

# Comment from: Jarret Bain

P-604-1

The Buffalo River is a beautiful place, please continue to preserve it

# Comment from: kevvin brown

P-605-1

We should continue to preserve the buffalo river for future and major developments.

# Comment from: Cassidy Rolle

P-606-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations (CAFOS) in the Buffalo National River's watershed."

# Comment from: Shawna Woodside

P-607-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations (CAFO) in the Buffalo National River's watsershed

#### **Comment from: Alec Severe**

P-608-1

If only one swine concentrated feeding operation can, after only 5 years of operation, contribute to declining water quality in the Buffalo River watershed what would more do?

#### Comment from: Laura Newth

P-609-1

Please vote yes on the moratorium to protect the Buffalo River area. We lose 100's of acres each year and can't afford to lose anymore. Arkansas is the natural state. Let's keep nature a priority.

#### **Comment from: Jordon Henley**

P-610-1

I've lived in Arkansas my entire life and I feel it is very important to protect our nature and continue to improve the conditions of Arkansas's rivers so future generations can enjoy the as much as I have throughout my life.

#### **Comment from: Vicente Vasquez**

P-611-1

Everyone should report the amount of waste they are dumping in to the river and everyone should be able to acces this information

By everyone i refer to the companies that dump waste into the river

#### Comment from: Ginger Milan

P-612-1

My husband and I respectfully ask that the moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed be made permanent.

#### **Comment from: katie Watson**

P-613-1

In many of my environmental classes for the past two years have addressed the many issues in the Buffalo River. I believe that corporations and other businesses should understand the many values the river offers to many disciplines

#### Comment from: Kevin Nawa

P-614-1

If only one swine concentrated feeding operations can, after only 5 years of operation, contribute to declining water quality in the Buffalo River watershed what would more do?

#### Comment from: Josh Robinson

P-615-1

Please clean up Buffalo River. We need to preserve our national rivers because we are nothing without our natural resources

# Comment from: Imani Doyle

P-616-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations (CAFOS) in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

# **Comment from: Cynthia Peterson**

P-617-1

The Buffalo River is precious and vital for many reasons, including the tourism it brings to the state. Therefore, I support a permanent moratorium on all CAFOs In the vicinity of the Buffalo.

Thank you for your work.

# Comment from: Jacob Bradow

P-618-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations (CAFOS) in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

# Comment from: Leslie Coston

P-619-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed. If only one swine concentrated feeding operation can, after only 5 years of operation, contribute to declining water quality in the Buffalo River watershed what would more do? Thanks for your consideration of this.

# **Comment from: Karen Ramsey**

P-620-1

Dear Sirs, please accept this as my full support for the Permanent CAFO Moratorium in the Buffalo River Watershed. I have only recently moved to Arkansas in the last 5 years and it doesn't take long to appreciate why this is the Natural State. The Buffalo River Watershed is an extremely important ecological and environmental region. The closing of the Hog farm was the first step. A permanent CAFO Moratorium will help protect further devastation to this important ecosystem.

# Comment from: Megan Johnson

P-621-1

Arkansas is a beautiful state, and I believe that allowing further pollution to the Buffalo river would be detrimental to our states health not only pertaining to our ecosystems but also to our economy. More CAFO's will only cause more degradation to our already polluted river system.

#### Comment from: Donna Bouzi

P-622-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations (CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

## Comment from: dustin brown

P-623-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations (CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River"s watershed

# **Comment from: Dale Steffens**

P-624-1

The condition of the Buffalo River was severely impacted by the CAFO Hog Facility. It became so bad that it was unhealthy to do float trips, fish, or swim in. This has a much higher impact on Arkansas when you look at the dollars that are spent in this state by tourists who want to come and vacation in the Buffalo River area. When it was so bad, the word got out about how nasty the water became in the river that Arkansas started losing revenue. We must not let this happen again. We need to protect the state's natural resources and not let CAFO's or anything like it ever get started again.

# Comment from: Kirk Rhoads

P-625-1

Absolutely no hog farms on the Buffalo River

# Comment from: Robert Agosti

P-626-1

Please keep all commercial (especially hog farms) animal enterprises out of the White River water shed basin.

Thank you,

Robert Agosti

# Comment from: James Ollerenshaw

P-627-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

I am a proper owner in Newton County, Arkansas

# Comment from: Terry Sutterfield

P-628-1

I strongly urge the ADEQ to make permanent the present ban on medium and large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. This National River is a wonderful asset to Arkansas and ADEQ should do all it can to protect this river in the future!!!!

#### Comment from: Mike Risk

P-629-1

Please make permanent the ban on CAFO in the Buffalo River watershed. The geology of the region makes these operations very risky. Thanks Mike Risk

#### Comment from: Dr. William Smith

P-630-1

It is time to resolve this issue permanently. If we are going to continue to recover and have a clean / unpolluted Buffalo National River which also protects the White River downstream, we must restrict any future processes such as hog farms processes that pollute the streams and rivers.

Although I do question the integrity of ADEQ to do so as the agency has already failed in its initial promise to monitor and protect homeowners in the Cartney Arkansas area and the White River, The result being an unrestricted over extension of the original mining on Cartney Mountain which over the years has created a gigantic red pit and surface mining swallowing up homes and threatening local streams, remaining homeowners wells, property values, and the White River.

#### **Comment from: Jimmy McCain**

P-631-1

I would like to weigh in and show my support for a permanent moratorium providing permanent protection to the Buffalo River against future hog CAFO's for the following reasons:

1) The watershed is that of a National River under the care of our state.

2) The geology of the drainage area is underlain by the Boone Formation which is karst geology, making the Buffalo watershed particularly vulnerable to pollutants.

3) CAFO waste is spread on pastures using the Arkansas Phosphorus Index (API) which fails to account for groundwater or karst.

4) Soils in the Buffalo River watershed are too thin to accommodate industrial level distribution of CAFO waste.

5) The record shows agency concerns and degradation in regard to the single facility permitted.

Thank you for the opportunity to state my view.

#### Comment from: Jan Scheel

P-632-1

I support a permanent moratorium on allowing large or medium CAFO's in the Buffalo River watershed. I grew up in Jasper and swam and fished in the Buffalo. Now I live close to the King's River, and I often float and visit both it and the Buffalo. My students have monitored water quality on the Kings and I hope they and other young people appreciate the wonderful rivers we have in Arkansas. What a tragic misuse of these gifts it would be to allow pollution to ruin America's first national River!

#### **Comment from: Rodney Lewis**

#### P-633-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium for swine or other large animal operations that could potentially destroy the water quality of the buffalo river watershed! Some things need to kept sacred and protected from destruction. As a regular visitor the river and the river's trail systems, i moved to Arkansas strictly to be able to enjoy such natural treasures.

#### **Comment from: Willow Stratton**

P-634-1

The Buffalo River is a beautiful national river. I have developed many fond memories over the years regarding the Buffalo River. Floating the river is very peaceful and allows us to see so much wildlife that lives around the river. I love seeing all of the birds that have found homes along the riverside. This natural habitant needs to be protected from pollution so the environment can continue to exist. If it continues to be polluted, the wildlife will be harmed and the river will decrease in beauty and peacefulness.

#### **Comment from: Kim Hesse**

P-635-1

I am in favor of a permanent moratorium as proposed by the revision

# **Comment from: Notm Windt**

P-636-1

I strongly support the moratorium on land use along the Buffalo River.

#### Comment from: mary green

P-637-1

PLEASE: issue a permanent moratorium on allowing large or medium-sized confined animal feeding operations in the Buffalo River watershed.

It's the right thing to do! Save our beautiful Buffalo River.

## **Comment from: Randal Camp**

P-638-1

I would like to thank you for taking care of our natural resources. I am in complete support of the permanent moratorium. The Buffalo River along with many other beautiful places need support and YOU GAVE IT! Thank you.

#### Comment from: Deborah Graham

P-639-1

My comments are short. In my lifetime I have observed that life is more valuable than money. We have but one Buffalo River and once we pollute it we loose it. Please do not base your vote on the money brought forth from Hog farming. Please let the Buffalo River Watershed be off limits to any and all CAFOs.

# **Comment from: Nick McDaniel**

P-640-1

I have lived in Arkansas for nearly 4 years while attending the University of the Ozarks. The beauty of the Buffalo National River has been a staple for my friends and I through the years. Many wonderful memories and experiences have stemmed from the BNR: swimming, kayaking, climbing, backpacking, fishing, and simply sitting in awe of its clarity. It needs protection from pollutants, industrial and residential alike, to keep its beauty, serenity, and integrity the we all know and love.

# Comment from: Frank Sospenzi

P-641-1

Keeping the Buffalo River watershed pristine should be a top priority, which includes the need to regulate industry that could possibly have a negative effect on these waters. I'm retired after a 33 year career in industrial water treatment, have personal experience with waste water from livestock operations. It has been proven that regardless of the type of operation, allowing this type of waste water to enter any watershed will create an environment ripe for algae growth and low oxygen level in the water, both of which will have a negative impact on water quality and fish. It also needs to be pointed out that with the recent use of state funds to compensate the owners for the closing of the C&H hog CAFO, without a permanent CAFO moratorium in the Buffalo River Watershed, a cycle of these types of operations opening up, being shut down for environmental reasons, and possibly requiring the use of public funds to compensate for the closing of the operations.

This is to request a permanent moratorium of CAFO operations in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# Comment from: Nancy Bumgardner

P-642-1

Please put a permanent moratorium on CAFOs on the Buffalo River Watershed. Taxpayers have had enough of the thoughtless decisions made by the Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality. We cannot afford to pay millions of dollars to correct bad decisions. I propose that the members who made the original decision to allow the Henson pig farm should make some kind of personal restitution to the taxpayers in Arkansas. Where is the accountability of these people in making such a costly error? It is not just a "Whoops".

#### **Comment from: Marcia Zamora**

P-643-1

Please PRESERVE AND PROTECT the Buffalo National River watershed in perpetuity by all means available.

This national heritage endangered by private FOREIGN business entities provides unparalleled recreational, spiritual and economic opportunities for the people of the Ozarks and Arkansas. It is a unique destination for tourists from across the state, the nation and abroad. The evidence is solid. Water quality is damaged but CAFO's. Engineered remediation is not technologically or financially feasible in this karst formation. The contamination simply must stop PERMANENTLY.

\*DEQ has determined that the engineering technology currently in place at the facility is inadequate to protect the Buffalo National River and Big Creek watersheds.

\* Nitrate are very high and continue to rise in the "house" well and ephemeral stream adjacent to the waste lagoons.

\* Nitrate levels in Big Creek more than double as it passes the farm.

\* Groundwater nitrate levels below the farm are elevated by as much as 4 times as ground water levels above the farm.

\*The phosphorus load downstream is double the upstream load.

\* In Big Creek phosphorous levels are very high and regularly exceed safe human contact limits.

\* Aquatic life will surely suffer if the contamination spreads to adjacent watersheds.

Please save the Buffalo! PLEASE.

# Comment from: Marcia Zamora

#### P-644-1

Please PRESERVE AND PROTECT the Buffalo River watershed in perpetuity by all means available.

This national heritage endangered by private FOREIGN business entities provides unparalleled recreational, spiritual and economic opportunities for the people of the Ozarks and Arkansas. It is a unique destination for tourists from across the state, the nation and abroad. The evidence is solid. Water quality is damaged but CAFO's. Engineered remediation is not technologically or financially feasible in this karst formation. The contamination simply must stop PERMANENTLY.

\*DEQ has determined that the engineering technology currently in place at the facility is inadequate to protect the Buffalo National River and Big Creek watersheds.

\* Nitrate are very high and continue to rise in the "house" well and ephemeral stream adjacent to the waste lagoons.

\* Nitrate levels in Big Creek more than double as it passes the farm.

\* Groundwater nitrate levels below the farm are elevated by as much as 4 times as ground water levels above the farm.

\*The phosphorus load downstream is double the upstream load.

\* In Big Creek phosphorous levels are very high and regularly exceed safe human contact limits.

\* Aquatic life will surely suffer if the contamination spreads to adjacent watersheds.

Please save the Buffalo! PLEASE.

#### Comment from: Lucas Parsch

P-645-1

I am in favor of a permanent moratorium of medium and large CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. Given the karst geology of the Buffalo drainage area, this watershed is particularly vulnerable to pollutants, and this issue has not been sufficiently addressed in recent and on-going research, including that of BCRET. Moreover, CAFO waste spread in the watershed based on the Arkansas Phosphorus Index (and at rates which greatly exceed agronomic needs), fails to account for groundwater or karst.

The Buffalo River is a crown jewel in the Natural State of Arkansas, and we must do everything we can to preserve it for future generations.

## **Comment from: Emily Roberts**

P-646-1

I am in favor of this rule change which would establish a moratorium on swine confined animal feeding operations. The link between surface runoff and the regional karst needs to be studied further, and I believe that a "better-safe-than-sorry" approach is best when it comes to guarding Arkansas' jewel -- the Buffalo River and its watershed. Let's protect the water and be cautious with which activities we will allow within the watershed so that we don't permanently mess it up before we fully understand the surrounding geology and water systems.

# **Comment from: David Gruenewald**

P-647-1

I fully support the Arkansas PC&E commission's proposed changes to Regulation 5 & 6. I am thankful that Governor Hutchinson

made the decision to close the C & H Hog Farm & the PC&E Commission for their support of a permanent moratorium on not issuing permits for large & medium Swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. Arkansas has gone through a long, expensive six

year struggle to derive effective measures to preserve this crown jewel of our beloved Natural State. Wd do not need to repeat

another fight to protect this wonderful attraction that draws so many tourists.

By reference, I wish to incorporate all comments made that that support a permanent moratorium on large and medium CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

#### Comment from: Tim Mason

P-648-1

Comments as to why CAFO's should not be allowed in the Buffalo River watershed are as follows!

1. The watershed is that of a National River under the care of our state.

The geology of the drainage area is underlain by the Boone Formation which is karst geology, making the Buffalo watershed particularly vulnerable to pollutants.

2. CAFO waste is spread on pastures using the Arkansas Phosphorus Index (API) which fails to account for groundwater or karst.

Soils in the Buffalo River watershed are too thin to accommodate industrial level distribution of CAFO waste.

The record shows agency concerns and degradation in regard to the single facility permitted.

Respectfully,

# Comment from: Byron East

P-649-1

Please don't let the hog farm dump waste into the river or anywhere near the river. It is an important place to protect for future generations to appreciate without swimming in feces. There are many other places where they can dump waste.

## Comment from: RACHEL HENRIQUES

P-650-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed. Only one swine concentrated feeding operation DID, after only 5 years of operation, contribute to declining water quality in the Buffalo River watershed. The Big Creek Research Extension Team's (BCRET) final report show that there is documented water quality impact from ONE (as in 1) hog concentrated feeding operation (CAFO) in the Buffalo River Watershed after only 5 years of operation. Statements from BCRET report, the data of BCRET study and the conclusions of the expert panel of the BCRET report advise both impact and the potential for impact, thus supporting the need for a permanent moratorium on swine CAFOs in the Buffalo National River watershed.

Sincerely, Rachel Henriques, Mt. Judea, AR

# **Comment from: Brittney Russell**

P-651-1

I think the temporary moratorium in The Buffalo River Watershed should be made permanent.

Main point 1. DEQ has found that engineering standards as applied to this facility in a karst area were not adequate to protect Big Creek and the Buffalo River. Also, possible remediation methods for waste disposal (sewage treatment, sludge removal, concrete holding tanks, or phosphorus removal from the watershed) have not proven to be technically or financially feasible. Therefore, a permanent moratorium is the best solution.

Main point 2: There is strong evidence that the Big Creek watershed has been contaminated by C&H with excess nutrients. If this were replicated on several other tributaries the Buffalo River, water quality, recreational opportunities, and aquatic life would surely suffer. Hence the need for a permanent moratorium.

Ever rising nitrate levels in the "house" well and ephemeral stream adjacent to the waste lagoons.

Nitrate levels in Big Creek more than double as it passes the farm.

Groundwater nitrate levels below the farm are elevated by as much as 4 times as groundwater levels above the farm.

The phosphorus load (mass transport off the land) downstream is double the upstream load.

Field phosphorus levels in C&H have increased significantly, which is to be expected when field application rates greatly exceed agronomic needs.

Very high E. coli levels in Big Creek, regularly above the safe human contact level. These facts prompted this conclusion from BCRET Final Report: "Future additions of any nutrients (i.e., as mineral fertilizer, swine slurry, or poultry litter) to fields, which received slurry from C&H Farms, should be carefully managed, so as to not lead to further increases in soil test P. This can be achieved by application of nitrogen (N) fertilizer or slurry and poultry litter at P-based rates, where P applied is equivalent to expected forage uptake of P."

#### Comment from: Gordon King

P-652-1

Please consider making a permanent ban on CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed. Or better yet in any Karst topography. Thank you Gordon K King

## Comment from: Scott Barstow

P-653-1

The rule changes would be a positive step for the long term environmental health of the Buffalo National River.

# **Comment from: Laurie Schuler**

P-654-1

I am in favor of a permanent moratorium on medium and large-sized CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed.

The watershed must be protected! It is the right thing to do for our river, our environment, tourism, our children!

# **Comment from: Mary Morris**

P-655-1

The moratorium on large scale hog farming and other hazardous waste generating industries must be permanently banned within watersheds that feed into the Buffalo National River and other sensitive essential waterways. The Natural State is forever and so should be protections for our most precious natural areas as well as for our families.

# **Comment from: Geniece Yates**

P-656-1

Please, please consider a PERMANENT moratorium on farming practices that can harm our beloved Buffalo River!! We are so blessed to have this beautiful piece of heaven!

Thanks

# Comment from: Terri Huber

P-657-1

I support a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. I believe we must protect the quality of our waters for the future, by doing whatever we must do to keep it clean.

# **Comment from: Susan Howe**

P-658-1

We must ensure that our precious Buffalo National River and the White River, as well as all their various tributaries, remain free of pollutants. Also, our ground water is in danger of being contaminated. For future generations, I strongly support any and all efforts by the citizens of Arkansas to maintain the health of our lakes, rivers, springs, creeks, and wetlands. Thank you for continuing to monitor and regulate activities that may endanger these waters.

## Comment from: Bonnie Nickol

P-659-1

"I am in favor of a permanent moratorium on medium and large-sized CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. This beautiful free flowing river should be protected from polluted sources in order to be a natural source of pure water for future generations.

# Comment from: Peter Pulay

P-660-1

I am very much in favor of a permanent moratorium on Concentrated Animal Feed Operations (CAFOs) in the Buffalo watershed area. I am a scientist, a chemist, and I am not one of those who oppose everything blindly. However, the geology of Northwest Arkansas is ill suited to CAFOs because of the underlying karst formation and the thin topsoil.

# **Comment from: Matt Foster**

P-661-1

Please do not allow any CAF's in the Buffalo River watershed. The river is too precious and valuable to bend to large companies who commit egregious acts of environmental pollution while giving very little to the communities they destroy

## Comment from: William Spaine

P-662-1

Please do not allow hog farming of any magnitude, or any other pollutant, to harm one of the top natural resources in "The Natural State."

Let me be blunt, Arkansas is not known for excellence in any aspect outside this state. At national professional conferences, for example, as an interesting and intellectual conversation is evolving and the other learns one is from Arkansas, it is rare that ridicule is withheld. You know this is true! WalMart and Tyson's impress some business people; professionals view them tacky. So to allow any enterprise to damage Arkansas' natural beauty is outlandish. Our outdoors is the single best thing we have going for us! It is truly short-sighted to prostitute it for the benefit of commercial profit.

Please take the long view for the benefit of generations to come, and ban all hog farming and other sources of defilement from any of our water tables or other natural resources.

Thank you for your integrity, William E. Spaine, Psy.D.

## Comment from: Tom Perry

P-663-1

I love the Buffalo River, our nations first National River, and urge you to impose a permanent moratorium on any size CAFO in the National River boundaries and watershed.

Tom Perry

# **Comment from: Christopher Pryor**

P-664-1

There should absolutely be a permanent moratorium on medium and large sized CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. The Buffalo River has been a beautiful natural resource enjoyed by multiple generations. In high school, there were frequently trips to enjoy it on the weekends and as an adult the ability to enjoy and appreciate such a pristine natural resource hasn't diminished. As a recent graduate of the University of Arkansas that enjoyed many geology classes, I can understand how the karst geology underlaying the area makes the river vulnerable to pollutants. Any pollution that occurs is not easily undone, and often impossible to undo. Just look at the groundwater contamination problems that the US military is beginning to have to address with PFAS they allowed to contaminate ground water. Just because the Arkansas Phosphorus Index doesn't account for groundwater or karst geology doesn't mean that CAFO waste doesn't affect and pollute it. Furthermore, the soils of the Buffalo River watershed are incapable of dealing with an industrial distribution of CAFO waste. Even agency records document concern about degradation of the watershed due to just the one facility that was permitted.

Please impose a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. Not only does the science support that this should be done to keep it pristine, but common sense dictates this mandate as well. Arkansans want to keep a beautiful natural river in such a state for future generations as well as current ones. Thank you.

# Comment from: Harmon Chadbourn

P-665-1

I am writing to strongly urge that the temporary moratorium on new CAFO's in the Buffalo River Watershed be replaced with a permanent prohibition on new CAFO's in this watershed.

Big Creek and an associated reach of the Buffalo River were recently recognized as now being degraded on the 303(d) list. I believe that as more data has become available, the negative impacts of the recently closed CAFO on Big Creek and on the Buffalo River have become undeniable. Converting the moratorium on new CAFO's into a permanent prohibition will be an important step in preventing further degradation of the Buffalo National River.

#### **Comment from: Marsha Havens**

P-666-1

Please keep factory farms of any sort away from our precious waterways. They cannot be replaced...

#### **Comment from: Debbie Doss**

P-667-1

I am writing to urge you to make the moratorium on large and medium CAFOs a permanent prohibition of these kinds of facilities within the watershed of the Buffalo National River. Clean water and natural unpolluted streams are the most valuable resource in this state. We must protect them from this ill conceived industry.

## **Comment from: David Parker**

P-668-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

## **Comment from: Gary Speed**

P-669-1

Please keep the hog farms, chicken houses, turkey farms and other high concentration farming operations out of the Buffalo River watershed and other watersheds in Newton and Searcy Counties. I am a landowner in Searcy County. We don't want all that crap spoiling our rivers. Thank you.

# Comment from: C F Christian

P-670-1

Please promote actions that help keep our water and air healthy for us now and our future citizens. Thank you.

## **Comment from: Jesse Phillips**

P-671-1

I believe the Buffalo river watershed should remain free of combined animal feeding operations. The hydrology in this beautiful protected area is too fragile for this industrial use. The nation's first national scenic river is too special to risk.

## **Comment from: Robert Walker**

P-672-1

Please make the moratorium on CAFO operations in the Buffalo watershed permanent

## **Comment from: Michael Butler**

P-673-1

The Buffalo river is a national treasure. It must be protected. The moratorium on hog farms and other potential pollutants should be permanent.

# **Comment from: Beth Forbes**

P-674-1

The Buffalo National River needs to be permanently protected from any sources of containment in the watershed areas.

# **Comment from: Norma Senyard**

P-675-1

Please protect our beloved Buffalo River by forbidding any large scale animal operations in the Buffalo watershed.

Please place a forever moratorium on any such damaging, poisoning operations.

Norma Senyard

# **Comment from: Bonnie Smith**

P-676-1

Please put a permanent moratorium on any CAFO anywhere near the Buffalo River or its watershed. We have to protect it for future generations.

# Comment from: Kathy Sutterfield

P-677-1

I strongly request that ADEQ votes to make the moratorium on new medium and large CAFOs permanent in the Buffalo River Watershed. The science shows that the river has been affected significantly by the recently closed swine farm on Big Creek. This should never be allowed to happen again.

Kathy Sutterfield 3202 Hearthstone Fayetteville, AR 72764 870-213-5934 ktsutter@gmail.com

# Comment from: Johnny Sain

#### P-678-1

Removing C&H Farms from the Buffalo River watershed was only the first step in protecting this Arkansas treasure. The next step should be removing the possibility of construction of any other confined animal feeding operation in the watershed. The Buffalo River watershed is among the wildest and most delicate of natural areas in Arkansas, and its protection should be paramount to citizens of the Natural State. As a concerned citizen and lover of wild Arkansas, I'm asking ADEQ -- the agency given charge over our state's precious natural resources -- to close any and all loopholes that would ever allow the construction of a CAFO within the Buffalo River watershed.

#### Comment from: william stephenson

P-679-1

we need a moratorium on concentrated animal feeding operations in our area

# **Comment from: Kenneth Pape**

P-680-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large CAFOs in the Buffalo Nayional River's watershead. It has been demonstrated that one operator (C&H) can leave the river downstream obviously degraded. Let's stop future abuse of Arkansas' great resource.

## **Comment from: Tom Simmons**

P-681-1

I would respectfully ask that the moratorium on allowing drainage into the Buffalo River be made permanent.

## Comment from: Lynn Berry

P-682-1

Please keep large animal feedlots out of the Buffalo watershed, for Pete's sake.

# Comment from: Vicki Jett

P-683-1

I am for a permanent. Moratorium for medium to large concentrated animal feeding operations. We as a society need to be aware of the negative effects that such farming of animals has not only on the earth, but our health , our pocket books and from an ethical stand point as well.

CAFO's effect

-persons health in the form of pollutants to our land, waters and air -over 168 gas emissions including hazardous chemicals ,such as ammonia, hydrogen sulfide and methane

We must protect the watershed of a National River that is under the care of our state. CAFO's are resource intensive, and are not sustainable without taxpayer subsidies, which means we all pay for meat, even if we don't eat it. People think they are getting a bargain, but at what hidden cost?

CAFO killing practices are in humane. Let's protect our states natural beauty.

## Comment from: Cathy Joyce

#### P-684-1

I am inn favor of an Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality (DEQ) rule change that provides for a PERMANENT moratorium of swine Confined Animal Feeding Operations (CAFO's) in the Buffalo National River Watershed.

The e-coli contamination of the Big Creek, which feeds into the Buffalo watershed is totally unacceptable, and should be stopped permanently. The runoff of Nitrate and phosphorus load, coming from the swine operations, is also unacceptable, and should be stopped.

I ask you to approve this DEQ rule for a permanent moratorium of swine "farms" in this area.

#### Comment from: James Britt

P-685-1

I oppose medium and large animal feeding operations in the Buffalo River watershed. This is limestone-based terrain that is full of caves, sinks and fissures without enough topsoil to hold animal waste. These karst land features are what makes the Buffalo River and area such a natural beauty. Let's encourage natural tourism there over concentrated animal operations that are a detriment to the area and seep into the water.I have hiked and canoed on these lands and wish to preserve their natural beauty. Tourists come to Arkansas for the nature, not hog farms.

#### **Comment from: Michael Tipton**

P-686-1

I am a member of the North Arkansas Fly Fishers and Friends of Norfork and White Rivers. I support a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed!

## Comment from: Susanna Brinnon

P-687-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations (CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed. We don't want Arkansas' rivers to become, as are North Carolina's, polluted by the waste from CAFO's. Thank you.

# **Comment from: William Kumpuris**

P-688-1

I am writing in enthusiastic support of extending the moratorium against CAFO's anywhere within the Buffalo National River watershed. Essentially, I feel it is an absolute disgrace that our state agencies allowed such an ill conceived endeavor to operate in the first place within the watershed. Just dumb, dumb dumb. It should never be allowed to happen again.

#### **Comment from: David Pope**

P-689-1

I strongly agree with a permanent moratorium of CAFOs within the Buffalo River watershed. The recent debacle and money spent to close the C&S hog farm operation and in light of BRET research data as well as independent data and common sense should be enough to make the case to end this sad saga. Greed and corporate interests should not over-ride what is the obvious

right choice for the river, our state and the people of Arkansas.

#### **Comment from: Betty Pitts**

P-690-1

We are working in Cedar County to create legislation to reduce the effects of CAFOs' polution of air, soil and our waterways especially draining into Lake Stockton which is a water source for several cities. We would like to join any efforts to help support legislation that makes these "Contaminating" Feeding Operations" responsible for their polution. In addition, the products they are producing are also contaminated with antibotics, growth hormones, etc. so they are creating health issues for consumers.

#### Comment from: Elizabeth VanderStek

P-691-1

I support a permanent moratorium on CAFO operations on the Buffalo River Watershed.

We cannot take risks on our natural resources. We owe it to our posterity to safeguard our environment.

#### Comment from: Bill Pettit

P-692-1

I am writing in strong support of the proposed rule change that would provide a permanent moratorium on all medium and large CAFO's, including swine, cattle and or poultry, in the Buffalo National River watershed. This region, because of the karst terrain, can't safely or effectively accept the animal waste produced by these feeding operations. The Buffalo National River is a most valuable asset to the state of Arkansas as well as the region and local economies where the River flows, and deserves protection from the animal waste produced by said CAFO's. Please approve the proposed moratorium and protect the Buffalo National River. Thank you, Bill Pettit

## Comment from: Amber Manney

P-693-1

#### I am in favor of a moratorium

#### Comment from: Bryan Signorelli

P-694-1

I am writing to urge you to make the moratorium on CAFOs a permanent prohibition of these kinds of facilities within the watershed of the Buffalo National River. Clean water and natural unpolluted streams are the most valuable resource in this state. We must protect them.

#### **Comment from: Tom Krohn**

P-695-1

I am for a permanent moratorium on CAFOs on the Buffalo National River watershed.

#### **Comment from: Bettie Lu Lancaster**

P-696-1

We must protect our Buffalo National River. Th soil in the watershed will not support CAFO's without polluting the river. There must be a permanent moratorium, so the state does not have to go though the incredible expense of bailing out a CAFO after proving it was polluting the Buffalo.

#### Comment from: Rhonda Reid

P-697-1

I am in favor of a permanent moratorium on medium and large-sized CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed.

#### Comment from: Jeff Ingram

P-698-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed. If only one swine concentrated feeding operation can, after only 5 years of operation, contribute to declining water quality in the Buffalo River watershed what would do?

## **Comment from: Julianne Bitely**

P-699-1

Please protect our waterways not just for the sake of the environment, but for the sake of our youth. As a teenager, I contracted a parasite from livestock runoff entering into the waterway. It had a snowball effect that I am still working to resolve 20 years later. Just like you wouldn't put a composting toilet next to a creek or stream, the same is true for livestock. Eventually there is no upstream left to go to.

## **Comment from: Robert D Architect**

P-700-1 no CAFOs allowed

#### Comment from: Bob Tyler

#### P-701-1

As a regular Buffalo River paddler and cleaner,'I am concerned about the quality of the watershed. The algae blooms downstream of Carver are noticeable and have been expanding and are even present in the Winter months. Please make every effort to keep this from occurring again in the future. Wild places are rare and the Buffalo is one of those wild places and it attracts a large number of visitors. Save the Buffalo.

#### **Comment from: Christopher Fischer**

P-702-1

Please adopt appropriate measures to restrict large scale Confined Animal Feeding Operations (CAFO's) from watersheds such as the Buffalo National River. Please also consider enabling better regulatory measures to better protect all watersheds from degradation from a broad scope of harmful activities.

#### Comment from: Mary Simonson

P-703-1

Please make the temporary moratorium on commercial farms in the Buffalo River watershed permanent. We are the guardians of this national treasure and prevention is a much smarter bet for the future than having to fix it (again) if its damaged by lax laws and short-sighted goals. Thank you.

#### **Comment from: Marianne Lombari-Nelle**

P-704-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on swine concentrated operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River Watershed. It is so important tp protect this river.

#### Comment from: phyllis ridgway

P-705-1

If only one swine concentrated feeding operation can, after only 5 years of operation, contribute to declining water quality in the Buffalo River watershed what would more do? If the truth be known, ADEQ Please know that I care about permanent protection of the Buffalo National River. Laws need to be enacted and ENFORCED to make sure this pristine blessing in Arkansas is never again put in jeopardy by shortsighted, greedy individuals.

## **Comment from: Cheryl Marcum**

P-706-1

Every person needs clean water to live. Everyone lives downstream from someone. Water pollution is a "life and death" threat to all life, humans, animals, birds, fish, plants, all aspects of ecosystems. By definition, CAFOs produce massive amounts of manure, often contaminated with growth hormones and antibiotics. All disposal methods for these millions of gallons of waste overwhelm the earth's ability to absorb the "nutrients." I oppose CAFOs and the vertically integrated meat industry they support. To deal with our nation's CAFO threat to our food security and our environment, my family eats much less meat and we only buy meat from local farmers. We strongly support a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in our neighboring state's Buffalo River watershed. We support a permanent moratorium on all CAFOs.

#### Comment from: Carole Degginger

#### P-707-1

I support a permanent moratorium on CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed district. We own a home near Vendor and having a large scale big farm in our neighborhood is certainly not what I envisioned when we purchased the property.

Besides the negative environmental impact and the inhumane conditions for animals raised in CAFOs, they are making in almost impossible for the local farms to compete.

No more CAFOs!

# Comment from: Duane Woltjen

P-708-1 January 22, 2020 ADEQ Reg 5 & 6 comments:

"Future additions of any nutrients to fields, which received slurry from C&H Farms, should be carefully managed, so as to not lead to further increases in soil test P. This can be achieved by application of nitrogen (N) fertilizer or slurry and poultry litter a P-based rates, where P applied is equivalent to expected forage uptake of P.", so says BCRET from their Final Report.

BCRET continues, even in their Final Report, to advocate what C&H was required to do when the doors opened until the doors finally closed in December of 2019. And there is no doubt that C&H faithfully applied slurry in accordance with their permit as verified by the inspection reports of their compliance.

This BCRET advocated practice is how we ended up with Nitrate levels that more than double in Big Creek as it passes by the C&H Farm; P downstream that is double the upstream level; increasing levels of nitrates in the ground water found in the well by the two barns; ground water downstream of the barns that is 4 x the nitrate level of groundwater upstream of the barns; very high Big Creek E. coli levels such that Big Creek is declared "Impaired" by the State.

Isn't the above remarkable? The Final BCRET Report recommendations have been followed for at least 6 years, and the results are a disaster!

That tells us the Arkansas P Index (equivalent to the Final edict) does not work. Why not?

The basic reason why it does not work is the application field geology is karst. Karst soils are extremely variable in permeability, with virtually impermeable soil lying next

to conduits to the water table in unpredictable locations of greatly variable extent. If P soil samples are taken in what turns out to be a conduit or highly permeable location, P readings will be low (because the previously applied P when to the water table below). The P applied was not used by plants, it went to the groundwater.

I resent BCRET's Final Report appearing as a recommendation by BCRET. This more of the BS they have foisted on C&H and the public. This is academic fraud, pure and simple.

Logically, the only thing that works on karst is Not Applying Animal or Manufactured Fertilizers. (Try crop rotation to restore nutrients—old Chinese saying?).

Permanent prohibition of CAFOs is necessary to protect the Buffalo River and must happen. Now

Duane and Judy Woltjen

#### Comment from: Teresa Turk

#### P-709-1

Please see attached file below: TO: Arkansas Department of Environmental Quality 5301 Northshore Drive North Little Rock, AR 72118-5317

FROM: Teresa Turk 1408 W Cleveland St. Fayetteville, AR 72701

DATE: January 22, 2020

# RE: PERMANENT MORATORIUM FOR MEDIUM AND LARGE SWINE OPERATIONS (CAFO/AFO)

Dear ADEQ,

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on the proposed permanent moratorium on medium and large swine operations better known as AFO or CAFO in the Buffalo River Watershed. I support a permanent moratorium for the following reasons:

• The Buffalo National River was designated as America's first national river in the entire United States in 1972. Arkansas essentially piloted the Wild and Scenic Rivers Act that eventually became law. The Buffalo should have the highest protection possible in the United States, not just in Arkansas.

• It has been demonstrated during the past 7 years how sensitive an ecosystem the Buffalo River watershed is to increases in phosphorous and nitrates generated by C&H CAFO. During C&H reign of environmental terror, C&H deposited over 18 million gallons of hog manure in the watershed. The result was a 90-mile-long algal bloom! Please do not allow this to happen again.

• If a permanent moratorium in the Buffalo River watershed is not put in place, is ADEQ prepared to spend millions of dollars on litigation, clean-up, and eventual purchase of another CAFO to protect the river? Please do not make this mistake again, learn from your misguided and industry influenced mistakes.

• My back of the envelope calculation on the tax payers money spent on the C&H mistake is conservatively \$7 million dollars and likely significantly more. I calculated these numbers as follows:

\$1.0 M to Big Creek Research and Extension Team (BCRET)

\$ 100,000 for the Harbor study on detection of pond leakage

- \$ 5.2 M to purchase the conservation easement
- \$ 700,000 for cleanup operations

And thousands of hours of staff time/travel to respond to public comment, meet with industry, permit review, enforcement, and other documentation of all things associated with C&H and EC spraying fields.

• During the past 7 years of C&H's destructive operations, the tourism industry has grown on average about 4% per year in Arkansas and is the state's second leading employer. However, tourism on the Buffalo National River significantly declined from 2017 to 2018.

• Jobs generated by the Buffalo National River declined from 911 in 2017 to 797 in 2018, a decline of 12.5%. Visitors to the Buffalo National River declined in 2017 from 1.47 million to 1.24 million in 2018, a decrease of 15.6%. Economic output in 2017 was \$71.1 million and \$62.7 million in 2018, a decrease of 11.8%.

• In 2017, ADEQ noted the presence of a 60-mile algal bloom and in 2018 a 90-mile algal bloom. The river area within the National Park is only 135 miles long. In 2018, 2/3 of the river experienced significant and unsightly algae, possibly toxic in some areas. The presence of algae generated by the 18 million gallons of phosphorous filled manure applied in the watershed dramatically harmed the river's ecosystem and the tourism business.

• The recently published report produced by the BCRET is full of scientific misinterpretation and underlain by a poor study design and assumptions. From the very nature of the title, the report assumes "sustainable" yet does not prove C&H is sustainable by any measure. For brevity, below is a short list of why this document is misleading and does not meet the threshold of scientific integrity:

a. The study design does not provide a control location to measure changes from one area (upstream vs. downstream) to another. The researchers chose not to conduct a standard well regarded and necessary procedure-dye tracing-to identify nutrient pathways within karst environments prior to designing their investigation. Due to this decision, they did not realize that the upstream data collection site is influenced (and contaminated) by nutrient run off from spraying operations. This very fact totally invalidates this study.

b. The study does not have temporal or spatial information nor verification of when and where manure was spread relative to sampling dates. Without knowledge of the inputs of manure paired with water quality collection, this leaves huge uncertainties when high E. coli and nitrate levels appear.

c. The study reviewers noted that water quality collection should be done frequently and targeted during storm events. The researchers failed to capture many of the storm events where huge qualities of manure flowed into Big Creek and other tributaries during the testing period. These events are critical to understanding why Big Creek and the Buffalo National River experienced algal blooms and high E. coli events. d. The study authors are financially dependent upon the industry through grants and other consulting opportunities. Most of the authors are not unbiased independent researchers. In their attempt to appear unbiased, an outside review team reviewed their work and provided extensive recommendations. Most of those recommendations remain outstanding and were not addressed.

In conclusion, Arkansas tax payers spent at least \$7 million dollars in testing, clean-up, public response and eventual purchase of a conservation easement on a destructive large swine CAFO. Not only were millions of dollars spent, but the Buffalo National river's water quality declined significantly with some sections now placed on the EPA's 303(d) list of impaired streams. The economic generator of the area, tourism, also declined significantly and will likely continue to do so until the river recovers and a reduction in algae occurs. Some scientific articles suggest that ecological recovery in a karst river system could take 20-30 years for the river to be restored back to its previous ecological condition before large inputs of nutrients occurred.

For these reasons, please pass a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine AFO/CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. Please spend the Arkansas taxpayer's money on conserving special wild places in Arkansas and not enabling industry to destroy them.

Sincerely,

Teresa Turk 1408 W Cleveland St. Fayetteville, AR 72701 206.713.2265

#### Comment from: Bob Billig

P-710-1

Please make the Buffalo permanently off-limits to large and mid-size hog farms.

# Comment from: Linda Nichols

P-711-1

I am in favor of a permanent moratorium on medium and large-sized CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. The Buffalo watershed is vulnerable to pollutants, like hog waste. I would like to canoe the Buffalo River again, without algae blooms!

# Comment from: Richard Spiker

P-712-1

This just proves that the citizens of the states that allow CAFO's,like Missouri, end up with the bill and the meat packers and ag. corporations get off "scott free". The citizens of Missouri must wake up to the CAFO's being allowed and supported by our governor and "bought off" legislature.

# **Comment from: Mark Degginger**

P-713-1

I am writing in favor of a permanent moratorium of medium and large swine CAFO's. The main reason being the engineering standards for C&H were not adequate to to the karst area. Also we still do not know the full extent of damage to Big Creek. I would hate to see this repeated on other tributaries within the Buffalo River watershed.

# **Comment from: Fran Alexander**

P-714-1 To: ADEQ

Please enter this comment into your comment records.

(Also, I hope this is not a repeat comment from me. I have lost track of how many comments on protection of this watershed that I've already submitted in past comment periods.)

To put farmers and Arkansawyers through any further stress and grief if medium or large hog farms are

ever allowed to be built again on karst geology in the Buffalo River watershed would be extreme foolishness and cause

more grief and expense for all involved.

Nothing is going to change 2 things:

the karst geology and the fact that water runs downhill and underground.

Until we humans can find a way to not leach into groundwater and spread pollutants far and wide via

aquifers and springs, we must use any intelligence we possess to not repeat this horrible experience

ever again. We can study things to death and not change the reality of those 2 facts.

Please, for the sake of us all and for the sake of that river and everything that depends on it for life,

place a permanent moratorium on medium and large confined animal feeding operations in the Buffalo River watershed

Thank you, Fran Alexander

#### Comment from: Ed McEowen

P-715-1

As someone very negatively impacted by a sloppy CAFO operation in Missouri, I ask why wouldn't you make the moratorium on Buffalo River CAFO's permanent? There's too much money being thrown around to trust government officials with properly policing these poorly implemented operations. We know that from our state. Get your priorities straight - will it be wealth for a few and diminished quality of life for many, or clean air and healthy soil?

#### **Comment from: Garland Goodwin**

P-716-1

I think there should be a permanent moratorium on CAFO's for any watershed that has the potential to affect the Buffalo National River. Allowing the last CAFO was a mistake, a very expensive mistake.

#### **Comment from: Susan Holt**

P-717-1

The regulations should be permanent. Water is a life sustaining requirement for all of creation. Why should corporate interests be allowed to create pollution without shouldering the responsibility of preserving something so basic to survival of us all?

## Comment from: Marti Olesen

P-718-1

I have attached my comments on Reg 5 & 6 revisions. Will you please let me know that you have received them? Thank you, Marti Olesen

#### Comment from: Diane Goodwin

P-719-1

I am strongly against this.

# **Comment from: Annette Pettit**

P-720-1

As a life-long resident of Arkansas, I am in favor of a permanent moratorium on medium and large CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed. We can learn from the mistakes of North Carolina how these farms can jeopardize our natural resources. Arkansas's tourism should be protected as well as our beautiful, natural state. The karst topography of this area makes these farms dangerous for a healthy life as well as for a healthy ecosystem. Let's make a permanent solution without having to keep revisiting a problematic event for future generations.

# Comment from: Billie Walker

P-721-1

There are multiple areas that can be utilized for farming that do not have the ability to affect the watershed of the Buffalo River and that is where those farms should be located. The Buffalo is a treasure that we have to preserve to best of our ability. We should never grant a permit that will damage our national river.

# Comment from: George Campbell

P-722-1

As a national park advocate, I am writing to support the proposal for a permanent moratorium on industrial-scale farms like C & H Hog Farms in the Buffalo National River Watershed. Specifically, I support proposed revisions to Regulation 5 & 6 regarding confined animal feeding operations (CAFOs).

I appreciate Governor Hutchinson brokering a buyout of C & H Hog Farms, Inc. and I support Arkansas Division of Environmental Qualitys Director Keoghs proposed regulatory changes to create a permanent moratorium on large swine CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

# **Comment from: Beverly Wright**

P-723-1

Water is a gift of life. Keep it clean and safe.

#### **Comment from: Bill Pitts**

P-724-1

Missouri (and Arkansas) need to continue to actively monitor, supervise, regulate and penalize, if necessary, CAFOs.

In Missouri, counties need to have the final authorization to approve/disapprove whether a CAFO is permitted in their county. CAFOs need to be better regulated and monitored to insure that their waste, noise and operation are not harmful to our land and our residents. Today, CAFOs have little or no restrictions (pollution or health) on their operations. CAFOs should not be entitled to have free reign in their operations

#### **Comment from: Bruce Darr**

P-725-1

My family and I support a permanent CAFO moratorium in the Buffalo River Watershed. With the successful (and very expensive) closure of the C&H Hog farm, we need to ensure that no more CAFO's are ever built in the very sensitive environment of our first Wild & Scenic River - The Buffalo!

#### Comment from: Jennifer Conner

P-726-1

We paddle the Buffalo River throughout the year and are considering buying land adjacent to the Buffalo River to enjoy the unique qualities.

The Buffalo is a national, state, and local treasure. There should absolutely be a moratorium on all cafos within that watershed. Once the resource is destroyed, there is no getting it back. Future generations won't ask us why we didn't allow more factory meat to be produced. but they will ask us why we allowed a National treasure to be destroyed which will happen, if we don't employee bold strokes in the protection of our water resources. thanks

#### **Comment from: Susan Jenkins**

P-727-1

Thank you Gov. Hutchinson!

Now for the next move to protect the Buffalo and surrounding area: Permanent moratorium on medium and large swine CAFOs.

Also of interest to the public is the final closure clean-up plan by Denali Water Soluntions, including waste disposal, as well as further testing and monitoring. We're watching and waiting for this imformation.

Thank you.

#### Comment from: christy lavely

P-728-1

#### NO more CFO's

make it permenant that no more can be near the buffalo river

#### **Comment from: Susan Watkins**

#### P-729-1

I am in favor of a permanent moratorium of medium and large confined animal factories in the Buffalo River Watershed. The public wants protection for the Buffalo National River in perpetuity. The debacle of C&H hog farm that was encouraged by the Pork Producers and the Arkansas Farm Bureau cost the residents of Arkansas dearly in funds and water quality. Please do not let them control policy just because they have an abundance of lobbyists and put so much money into elections. Please protect the Buffalo River for generations to come. It is a solemn duty and the people of the state expect you to protect our water resources. I want to thank Gov. Hutchinson for for closing C&H and generously compensating the owners. Now s the time to give the watershed protection permanently.

Thank you, Susan Watkins

#### **Comment from: Eric Fraser**

#### P-730-1

I would like to go on record supporting the moratorium on moderate to large Concentrated Animal Feeding Ooerations in our Beautiful Buffalo National River. It just makes common sense to avoid the potential for contamination of this natural resource with animal refuse. The much discussed karst topography is a setup for eventual leakage into the river water with continued overgrowth of algae which is ultimately toxic to fish by lowering the dissolved oxygen in the water, as well as a tremendous eyesore to those of us who float and hike in and alongside the river. Thank you for this consideration. Eric Fraser

## **Comment from: John Murdoch**

P-731-1 No text entered for this comment.

# **Comment from: William Spitler**

P-732-1

The Buffalo River watershed is perhaps the most beautiful wilderness area between the Rockies and the Appalachians. I have visited the Buffalo countless times and will continue to visit this incredible place for years to come. Please extend the temporary moratorium regarding commercial farm operations in this fragile ecosystem. Make this moratorium permanent so that our children and grandchildren can enjoy this incredible resource.

# **Comment from: Betsy Murdoch**

#### P-733-1

If only one swine concentrated feeding operation can, after only 5 years of operation, contribute to declining water quality in the Buffalo River watershed what would many or several do? Please support a moratorium of medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations in the Buffalo National River's watershed.

#### Comment from: Thomas Johnson

P-734-1

No CAFO's. Should this be allowed, the economic damage to tourism and the "Natural State's" environment will be irrepairable.

#### **Comment from: David Schisler**

P-735-1

As a former resident of Iowa, I have seen first hand what runoff from hog farms can do to a state park public water. Lake Keomah in Mahaska county. Each year after the ice melts, the water is clear and the fishery is good. However, the lake never reaches its full potential. Spring rains which bring in livestock refuse from area farms turn the lake into a pea green algae reservoir with clumps of floating blue-green algae. When the algae dies, decomposition depletes oxygen and fish kills occur. We must protect our state watersheds including the Buffalo River, which is visited by many outdoors enthusiasts each year.

#### **Comment from: Alice Andrews**

P-736-1 No text entered for this comment.

#### **Comment from: Carol Bitting**

P-737-1 No text entered for this comment.

## Comment from: Robin Rumph

P-738-1

The time has come to completely protect the whole of the Buffalo River Watershed in order to protect the finest jewel of the state of Arkansas, the Buffalo River. Over the past decade I hope that we have learned an expensive lesson CAFOs in the Waterside and pristine water quality do not mix well. Please do not issue any new permits for CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed.

#### Comment from: Mary kunkle

P-739-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on the operation of CAFOs in the Buffalo River Watershed. We must be diligent with our efforts to protect this national treasure.

#### Comment from: Carol Bitting

P-740-1

Here are the copies of the moratorium originally placed on hog CAFO's in the Buffalo River watershed.

# Comment from: Elliott Golmon

P-741-1

We need to continue to support our Farmers who are on the front lines in the battle to preserve our nations ecosystems through sound farming practices based on research which utilizes science.

We are against the moratorium on farms of any type that threaten private property rights, especially those that are following the rules set forth by our governmental agencies.

Thank you.

# **Comment from: Terry Fredrick**

P-742-1

I favor a permanent moratorium on hog farms in the Buffalo River watersheds and contrbuting watersheds. As a dairy and poultry farmer over 40 years we are stewards of the land not polluters.

# **Comment from: Charles Finch**

P-743-1

I want to add my voice to the thousands of others in support of extending the moratorium on medium and large CAFO's to all livestock-including hogs, cattle and poultry, and making this moratorium permanent. The algae blooms on the Buffalo River and other streams in the area are growing in intensity and frequency. There are other more suitable locations for these type of operations. This fragile ecosystem is a jewel in our state and depends on agencies such as yours for protection.

# Comment from: Test

B-1-1

Test

# Comment from: Lizabeth Lottmann

B-2-1

My husband and I own two vacation rental properties: Misty Creek at the junction of Big Creek and its north tributary near Vendor, Ark.; and Misty Bluff on Hwy. 7 on the Grand Canyon view. It provides 6 jobs year-round to local residents. Our Misty Creek property is affected by the noticeable increase in algae growth on the tributary creek that runs in front of our property. Our business has been affected by the fact that our guests can no longer enjoy the creek due to the algae. About a year after the hog farm was opened, the algae had noticeably increased. Now it is so voluminous that the creek is nasty, slippery, and smelly, even in winter. We will fight the re-opening of the hog farm and any hog farm in this area, now and in the future. We do not want a hog farm!

#### Comment from: Arkansas Canoe Club

O-1-1

After the expenditures of millions of both private and taxpayer dollars, it would be irresponsible to allow this kind of environmental threat to occur again. Make the moratorium against medium and large Hog CAFOs permanent.

This is justified as scientific reports show that both excess Phosphorous and Nitrogen are leaching from surface runoff and through the porous Karst into the Buffalo.

#### **Comment from: Ray Jones**

0-2-1

I live in Missouri, but I visit the Buffalo River often and cherish our wonderful national treasure which graces the beautiful State of Arkansas. As the guardians of the river, please make permanent the moratorium on medium and large-scale CAFOs in the Buffalo River watershed.

#### Thank youlMDYH

#### **Comment from: Searcy County Cattlemen's Association**

O-3-1

On behalf of the 82 members of the Searcy County Cattlemen's Association, we OPPOSE any moratorium of any type agricultural operations for the Buffalo River Watershed.

#### **Comment from: Friends of the North Fork and White Rivers**

0-4-1

On behalf of myself and Friends of the North Fork and White Rivers, we applaud the closure of the C&H Hog CAFO in the Buffalo National River Watershed and urge you to approve the changes to Regs 5 & 6 to create a permanent ban on CAFO's within the Buffalo River Watershed. We believe the karst topography and natural beauty of this area of Arkansas begs for our protection from the pollution that CAFO's create. We believe the Buffalo River Watershed is one of if not Arkansas's premier Natural Asset and it is up to all of us to protect and conserve it forever. Thank You Steve Blumreich President Friends of the North Fork and White Rivers

## Comment from: Ozark Society Peterson

O-5-1 No text entered for this comment.

## Comment from: Saline River Watershed Alliance

O-6-1

In the interest of future generations to have the natural resources available the Buffalo River has to provide. It would be the only logical choice to permanently disallow any development of industry within a determined safety zone as outlined in the changes proposed in regulations 5&6.

# Comment from: Audubon Arkansas

## 0-7-1

Please approve a permanent moratorium on medium and large swine concentrated feeding operations(CAFOs) in the Buffalo National River's watershed. Audubon recognizes the Buffalo National River as an Important Bird Area (IBA). IBAs are sites that provide essential habitat for breeding, wintering, or migrating bird species. The Buffalo National River is important for a diversity of bird species, among them are Bald Eagle, Northern Bobwhite, Cerulean Warbler, Swainson's Warbler, and Louisiana Waterthrush. These species depend on clean water. This watershed is not an appropriate place for a CAFO.

# Comment from: Arkansas Cattlemen's Associaton

O-8-1

Please see attached files.

# **Comment from: Daniel Cohee**

O-9-1

I am President of the Citizens for Clean Water, located in Baxter County Arkansas. We are IN SUPPORT OF THE PERMANENT MORATORIUM that protects the Buffalo River Watershed. This is a National Treasure and must be protected.

## Comment from: Buffalo River Watershed Alliance

O-10-1

Attached please find three (3) files submitted by Buffalo River Watershed Alliance as our public comments on proposed revisions to Regulation 5 and Regulation 6. These comments are submitted in addition to comments submitted in the previous comment period. Attached are the following files: (1) BRWA Comments on BCRET Final Report, (2) Preliminary Report on BCRET Final Report, November 7, 2019, and (3) Comments on BCRET Final Report, January 20, 2020. Please confirm receipt of all three (3) files by email response to buffalowatershed@gmail.com. Thank you for the opportunity to comment.

# Comment from: White River Waterkeeper

O-11-1

Attached are comments submitted on behalf of White River Waterkeeper. A second transmission will include WRW's five (5) associated attachments.

# Comment from: White River Waterkeeper

0-12-1

Comment submission 2 of 2. Attachments 1-5 associated with WRW's comments submitted in submission 1 of 2.